# ORTHODOX CHRISTIAN EVANGELISM IN THE UNITED STATES AND BRAZIL: AN INTER-AMERICAN APPROACH IN EVALUATING THE EVANGELIZING MISSION OF ORTHODOX CHRISTIAN PUBLISHING COMPANIES

By

Theodora Saclarides

Thesis

Submitted to the Faculty of the

Graduate School of Vanderbilt University

in partial fulfillment of the requirements

for the degree of

MASTER OF ARTS

in

Latin American Studies

August 11, 2017

Nashville, Tennessee

Approved:

Earl E. Fitz, Ph.D.

Nicolette M. Kostiw, Ph.D.

#### **ACKNOWLEDGMENTS**

I conducted the research for this thesis between May and July 2015 during a summer exchange program at the Federal University of Pernambuco. The program was offered under the auspices of the United States-Brazil Higher Education Consortia Program and was funded by a grant from the Department of Education's Fund for the Improvement of Post-Secondary Education. I continued this research in 2016 as my side-project during my Fulbright English Teaching Fellowship at the Federal University of Paraíba in João Pessoa. My research would not have been possible without either of these grants.

I want to thank the Center for Latin American Studies for allowing me to continue my higher education at Vanderbilt University as a student in the 4+1 program. I am grateful that Professors Marshall Eakin, Jane Landers, and Celso Castilho entrusted me with the FIPSE-CAPES grant to research a topic of which there is scarce literature. I also want to thank Frank Robinson and Nicolette Kostiw for their patience and for jumping through many administrative hoops to allow me to take a leave of absence and participate in the Fulbright program, without which I would not have had the experience learning of the Orthodox Christian community in Paraíba. Professor Fitz, who has been an incredible mentor and professor, will always be very dear to my heart for his jokes, his incredible wisdom about translation studies, and for first introducing me to the field of Inter-American literature. In addition, I am greatly thankful to Nicolette Kostiw for graciously agreeing to be part of the thesis committee on short notice and for offering insightful advice to guide my writing and research.

Furthermore, this research was only made possible by the generosity and hospitality of Brazil's Orthodox Christians who went above and beyond to accommodate me and offer their insight about the growth of the Eastern Orthodox Church in Brazil. I am especially indebted to

Mother Barbara of the Nativity of Our Lord Orthodox Monastery in Kemp, Texas for introducing me to the Orthodox community in Recife, for welcoming me to the monastery shortly after my return from Pernambuco, and for teaching me how to make bolo de rolo. Of the Orthodox Christian community in Recife, I am indebted Father Alexis Álfaro, Emilia van Stein, and Father Jário for welcoming me into their homes, introducing me to incredible Northeastern Brazilian cuisine, and helping me coordinate interviews with different members of Pernambuco's Orthodox community. Father Pedro Siqueira was of invaluable support during my stay in Brazil and I am eternally grateful for the opportunity to examine the primary sources he used to write his masters thesis at St. Tikhon's Orthodox Theological Seminary. Furthermore, Annie Theodoropoulos was incredibly kind to share her research and resources with me. I also received assistance from Father Rafael de Queiroz, Father Elias Cavalcanti, and Bishop Ambrósio who were gracious enough to spend time telling me more about the history of the Orthodox Church in Recife. Apart from these clergy members, I want to thank the FIPSE-CAPES alumni Sandro Soares and Alana Souza for welcoming me to Brazil upon my arrival, my dear friends Francielle (Maria Madalena) and Erik (Athanasios), and Miriam Juvino for introducing me to the Polish Orthodox Church in Rio de Janeiro.

During my Fulbright grant I had the opportunity to meet many more Orthodox Christians in different regions of Brazil. I want to thank Leonardo Freitas Arroyo for introducing me to the Antiochian and Russian Orthodox Christian communities in São Paulo and for welcoming me into his home during the visit of Patriarch Kirill of Moscow. I also want to thank Felipe (Moisés) for welcoming me to Rio de Janeiro and introducing me to the Saint Zenaida Russian Orthodox Church, where I had the incredible experience of meeting part of the Russian diaspora living in Brazil.

In the state of Paraíba, I would like to thank Marcelo Jorge Campos Oliveira de Lima for receiving me in his home João Pessoa, Arquimandrita Jerônimo for welcoming me to St. Catherine the Great Martyr Orthodox Parish, and to Isabel, Luana, Bárbara, and Ricardo, who drove me to Conde every Sunday for church and for giving me one of the most unforgettable experiences of spending São João with their family in Puxinanã, Paraíba. I am also undeserving of Robson (João) and Lígia (Sarah) Pimenta's friendship and for putting me in touch with various Orthodox Christians in Brazil. Evelina also graciously gave me rides to church and I am thankful to her for her willingness to talk about her experience as a Russian Orthodox Christian in Brazil's Orthodox community. Although they were not part of the Orthodox Christian community, I am undeserving of the love that Diogenes Silva's family gave me and for agreeing to be my adoptive Brazilian family.

Finally, I owe an immense debt of gratitude to my "family" in Nashville and my family in Illinois. Father Parthenios Turner and Presbytera Marion, who are my Nashville family, graciously let me use their library of Orthodox Christian resources, which proves that the mission of Alektor Cafe lives on! I am also grateful for the love and support of my family in Illinois and especially my mother, to whom I owe everything. May her memory be eternal.

# **TABLE OF CONTENTS**

ŀ	age
Acknowledgments	ii
List of figures.	vi
Introduction	1
Chapter	
1. A Historical Overview: The Ancient Faith in the New World	4
The Status of Orthodox Christianity in the United States and Brazil. Orthodox Christian History in the United States. Russian America: Alaska's Enduring Orthodox Heritage. The History of Orthodox Christianity in Brazil. The Polish Orthodox Church and the Serbian Orthodox Church in the Northeast and Southeast of Brazil: Orthodox Theology of Mission in a Brazilian Context. The Future of the Orthodox Church in Brazil.	6 8 15
2. Integrating Worldviews: Orthodox Theology in the West	41
Introducing Orthodox Christian Spirituality to a Western Audience.  The Translation of Russian Orthodox Texts in the West	
3. A Comparative Analysis: Orthodox Christian Publishing Companies in the United States	and
Brazil	53
English and Portuguese in the World Language System.  Ancient Faith Publishing.  Becoming Orthodox: A Journey to the Ancient Christian Faith.  The Publication of Orthodox Christian Texts in Brazil.  The Literary Production of Editora Aletheia.  The Literary Production of Editora Theotokos.	55 57 62 66
Conclusion.	76
References	79

# LIST OF FIGURES

Figure	Page
St. Nicholas Greek Orthodox Church bulletin	18
2. Ukrainian Orthodox Archdiocese news bulletin	20
3. The martyrdom of Maria Aparecida Bureski	21
4. Padre Dionísio welcomes Patriarch Kirill to the Dormition of the Mother of God Pari	sh23
5. Patriarch Kirill celebrates liturgy at Sts. Peter and Paul Antiochian Cathedral	23
6. Orthodox baptisms on Father Elias Cavalcanti's property	28
7. Holy Trinity Orthodox Monastery in Camaragibe, Pernambuco	30
8. The interior of Holy Trinity Orthodox Monastery	30
9. St. Catherine Polish Orthodox Church in Conde, Paraíba	30
10. The Interior of St. Catherine Polish Orthodox Church	30
11. The Dormition of the Theotokos Serbian Orthodox Church in Recife, Pernambuco	32
12. Father Alexis Álfaro	32
13. Saint Anthony the Great Serbian Orthodox Parish, Belo Jardim, Pernambuco	34
14. Saint John Chrysostom Serbian Orthodox Parish in Caruaru, Pernambuco	34
15. The interior of Saint John Chrysostom Serbian Orthodox Parish	34
16. Planning the construction of Saint John Chrysostom Parish	35
17. The first Eucharist at the construction site.	35
18. The construction of Saint John Chrysostom Parish in June 2017	35
19. Weekly prayer services in Fortaleza.	36
20. Father Rafael Queiroz in his iconography studio	38
21. The thirty-year anniversary of Orthodox Christianity in Brazil's Northeast	78

#### Introduction

In the Epistle to Diognetus, it is stated, "Every foreign country is our motherland, and every motherland is foreign". The anonymous letter written to Diognetus, who was thought to be an advisor to Marcus Aurelius, seeks to defend Christianity from its accusers through describing the lifestyle and mannerisms of Christians.<sup>2</sup>

This letter not only defends Christians, but also defines their status and belonging in the world. The anonymous writer observes, "Christians are indistinguishable from other men either by nationality, language, or customs", thus establishing their "universal" nature. By stating that every "motherland is foreign", the writer references their persistent persecution in their native lands. Despite their affliction, "Christians love all men, but all men persecute them"; their love enables them to embrace other people and traditions as their own, thus designating every foreign country as their motherland.<sup>3</sup>

The Epistle to Diognetus establishes the "nationless" state of Christians, and at the same time, their global citizenship. The dual nature of this epistle has therefore been utilized to describe the diversity in the unity of many nationalities under the Orthodox Church and how Orthodox Christianity, from a cultural and geographical point of view, is no longer exclusively an "Eastern church". The Orthodox Church's incarnation in the traditions and customs of other "motherlands", however, has its challenges.

<sup>-</sup>

Otd in Ware, Timothy. *The Orthodox Church*. 3<sup>rd</sup> ed., Penguine Books, 2015, 167.

This is a document of Christian apologetics, which is a field of Christian theology that defends Christianity through historical, reasoned, and evidential based argumentation.

<sup>&</sup>quot;The Christians in the World." *The Holy See.* The Holy See Press Office 2017, www.vatican.va/spirit/documents/spirit\_20010522\_diogneto\_en.html. Accessed 20 May 2017.

There are two ecclesiastical families of the Orthodox Church: the Eastern Orthodox Church and the Oriental Orthodox Church. This paper focuses on the presence of the Eastern Orthodox Church in the Americas. Therefore, in this thesis, any mention of the Orthodox Church is specifically referring to the Eastern Orthodox Church.

One such challenge is the marginalization of Orthodox Christian texts from the national conception of literature in the Western Hemisphere. Print languages are essential in creating a basis for national consciousness, since "print-capitalism gave a new fixity to language, which in the long run helped to build that image of antiquity so central to the subjective idea of the nation". Major world religions are founded upon religious texts and scripture, which in turn foster communal liturgical practices and national identity.

The Orthodox Church is an institution with deep roots in nationalism and collective identity. It is the patriotic faith of the majority of Eastern European nations, where many regard following the nationally dominant faith of Orthodox Christianity as an important aspect of belonging in the homeland.<sup>6</sup> Given the nationalistic character of Orthodox Christianity, this thesis will examine how literary production, a tool that fosters national consciousness, attempts to transplant a patriotic faith from its Eastern roots into the Western Hemisphere. The United States and Brazil, which house the Western Hemisphere's largest and fourth largest Orthodox Christian communities respectively, are the subjects of this case study due to similar histories of evangelism, influence, and reception.<sup>7</sup> Although Brazil will be the centerpiece of this study, an overview of Orthodox Christian evangelism in the United States is necessary due to its crucial and influential role in the lineage of publications in the Western Hemisphere and influence in Brazil's Orthodox Christian community.

The role that converts have played in fostering a unique American and Brazilian

Orthodox society has received little attention from scholars, despite the growth of Orthodox

-

Anderson, Benedict. *Imagined Communities*. 2nd ed., Verso, 1991, 44.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> "Eastern Europe's Patriotic Faith." *The Economist*, 14 May 2017, www.economist.com/blogs/erasmus/2017/05/religion-after-communism. Accessed 24 July 2017.

I make this judgment based on *Orthodox World*, the world's largest Orthodox Christian online directory. According to *Orthodox World*, the United States has the greatest number of Orthodox Churches in the Western Hemisphere, and Brazil the fourth largest, assuming that the number of Orthodox Churches is an accurate indicator of the number of faithful. However, I have found that *Orthodox World* is not consistently updated. The directory can be found at the following link: <a href="http://orthodox-world.org/world">http://orthodox-world.org/world</a> index.php.

Christianity in the second half of the 20<sup>th</sup> century and the 21<sup>st</sup> century. This thesis will seek to address this gap in the literature by discussing how the publishing efforts of Orthodox Christian converts are instrumental in creating an Orthodox Christian society that is indigenous to the Western Hemisphere. I will begin with an overview of the history of Orthodox Christianity in the United States and Brazil, with a discussion of the historical legacy of Russian Orthodox evangelism in Alaska, the immigration of Orthodox Christians to the Western Hemisphere, and a an examination of Orthodox Christian evangelism in the United States and Brazil beginning in the 1970s and 1980s. I will then discuss works by Western scholars that address the reception of Orthodox Christianity in the Western Hemisphere. The remainder of the thesis will focus on the missionary role that religious texts published by converts have had in shaping a unique Orthodox Christian community in the Western Hemisphere. In the United States, I will primarily examine the evangelizing role of Ancient Faith Publishing. In Brazil, I will examine Editora Aletheia and Editora Theotokos, two publishing companies that fulfill a missionary purpose through different means and arguably opposing visions. These publishing companies link the Americas together in an Inter-American dialogue through their dichotomous relationship to the East. If "Latin American identity has been formed out of the intimate relationship between agents of cultural change – be they writers or conquistadores – and their translators," then Orthodox Christianity has had a significant role in participating as an agent of this cultural change. 8 Orthodox Christianity's role in the linguistic and theological translation of ideas has led to the formation of a collective "American" Orthodox Christian identity through the creation of Orthodox Churches native to North America and Latin America.

<sup>-</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Lowe, Elizabeth and Earl E. Fitz. *Translation and the Rise of Inter-American Literature*. University Press of Florida, 2009, 6.

#### Chapter 1

### A Historical Overview: the "Ancient Faith" in the New World

The Status of Orthodox Christianity in the United States and Brazil

The history of Orthodox Christianity in the United States and in Brazil differs according to mission. The Orthodox Church in the United States was foremost a story of 18<sup>th</sup> and 19<sup>th</sup> century Russian Orthodox missions, whereas Brazil never received Orthodox Christian missionaries. Regardless, in the 19<sup>th</sup> and 20<sup>th</sup> centuries, both countries received an influx of immigrants. Later, Orthodox Christian evangelism began in earnest in the 1980s, though the magnitude of immigration and conversion has been greater in the United States.

The status of the Orthodox Church in Brazil and the United States is similar due to their parallel historical trajectories. Orthodox Christianity is a relatively unknown form of American Christianity. It is "invisible despite its relative prevalence" and has been ignored and overlooked in religious, ethnic, and sociological studies in the United States. Orthodox Christianity occupies a comparably obscure status in Brazil's religious landscape, where it is still an enigma and often perceived as an exotic, foreign remnant of the past.

The anonymity of the Orthodox Church is due to its legacy as an immigrant cultural institution where ethnic identity is enacted, preserved, and reinforced. The Orthodox Church is contextualized within its Old World ethnic heritage due to the belief of "one state – one Church". Consequently, ethnic qualifiers are attached to affiliation; one is not simply an Orthodox Christian, but self-identifies as Greek Orthodox, Russian Orthodox, or the nationality

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Herbel, D. Oliver. *Turning to Tradition: Converts and the Making of an American Orthodox Church.* Oxford University Press, 2014, 14.

Krindatch, Alexei D. "Orthodox (Eastern Christian) Churches in the United States at the Beginning of a New Millennium: Questions of Nature, Identity, and Mission." *Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion*, vol. 41, no. 3, 2002, 534.

of one of the other thirteen universally recognized regional, autocephalous Orthodox Churches. The relatively unknown presence of Orthodox Christianity in the Western Hemisphere is also a product of the nature of Orthodox immigration. The major waves of Orthodox Christian immigration to the New World in the 19<sup>th</sup> and 20<sup>th</sup> centuries were largely involuntary. Events such as the persecution of Christians in the Ottoman Empire, the wake of WWII which displaced 100,000 Eastern Europeans, the 160,000 Greek immigrants that immigrated during the Cypriot Crisis, the Lebanese Civil War and the Iran-Iraq War, which displaced Middle Eastern Christians, and refugees from the former Yugoslavia upon its breakup and erupting wars impelled the movement of Orthodox Christians to the Western Hemisphere.<sup>11</sup>

Due to the history of forced migration, Orthodox Christians viewed themselves as a geographic extension of the Mother Church in the Old World and upon arrival created religious institutions that had socio-ethnic functions to preserve ethnic identity. Identity was also preserved through retaining the language of the mother country in liturgical practices. Evidently, Orthodox Christians in the New World had little concern for mission; they did not perceive themselves of having responsibility to the wider society of Brazil and the United States and Orthodox jurisdictions saw themselves as being composed of a faithful base that was not part of Western society. The reconstruction of cultural expressions of Orthodox Christianity in the Western Hemisphere has resulted in the absence of Orthodox Christian engagement. A "blame-the-Orthodox" prognosis defines the Orthodox Church as incapable of "self-adjusting". 13

To better understand this assessment of Orthodox Christianity in the Western Hemisphere, a brief outline of its development in the United States is deserved, where

<sup>11</sup> Krindatch, 551.

Krindatch, 558.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Herbel, 15.

scholarship has started to emerge that examines the formation of an Orthodox Christian America that is gradually losing its ethnic heritage.

## Orthodox Christian History in the United States

The Orthodox Church has a two hundred year history in the United States, with a firm foothold in industrial towns, cities, and Alaskan villages, whereas they are sparse in towns and smaller cities in the west and south of the United States.<sup>14</sup> Two centuries after the original establishment of Orthodox Christianity in Alaska, there are two million Orthodox Christians in the United States in 2,400 local parishes.<sup>15</sup> Orthodox Christianity is comparable in size to Judaism but does not have as great of an influence in American society.<sup>16</sup>

There is significant scholarship that documents the history of the Orthodox Church and Orthodox Christian migration to the United States. Notable scholars such as Matthew F. Namee, Rev. Andrew S. Damick, Aram G. Sarkisian, John H. Erickson, Rev. Thomas E. FitzGerald, David C. Ford, and V. Rev. Michael J. Oleksa, to name a few, have researched, written, and lectured on topics relevant to Orthodox Christianity in North America. Most are members of the Society for Orthodox Christian History in the Americas (SOCHA), which promotes the study of the history of the Orthodox Church in the New World.<sup>17</sup>

However, there are few studies solidly devoted Orthodox Christian evangelism and the social and cultural integration of Orthodox Churches in North America, which has become more apparent during the last 20-30 years.<sup>18</sup> In the 1980s, the demographics of the Orthodox Church

Erickson, John H. *Orthodox Christians in America*. Oxford University Press, 1999, 7.

<sup>15</sup> Krindatch, 533.

Herbel, 14-15.

More about the history and mission of SOCHA can be found at this website: <a href="http://orthodoxhistory.org/">http://orthodoxhistory.org/</a>. Despite its focus on the New World, SOCHA's mission fails to encompass the history of the Orthodox Church in Latin America.

<sup>18</sup> Krindatch, 551.

in the United States started shifting due to Orthodox Christian mission parishes, the increase of converts, and the Americanization of 3<sup>rd</sup> and 4<sup>th</sup> generation immigrants. Increasingly, faith and ethnicity are no longer inseparable in the Orthodox Church. Today, the Oriental Orthodox Churches in North America are more "ethnic" or "diasporic" than the Eastern Orthodox Churches, with the newest groups of Orthodox Christian arrivals being Coptic Christians and the Malankara Orthodox Christians.<sup>19</sup>

Scholars such as Alexei Krindatch, Father Oliver Herbel, and Amy Slagle, amongst others, have conducted significant historical, sociological, and ethnographic scholarship that has initiated serious investigation of this important trend in American religion. Alexei D. Krindatch, a sociologist of religion, is the research coordinator with the Assembly of Canonical Orthodox Bishops of North and Central America and directed the first ever US National Census of the American Orthodox Christian Churches, which was designed as a part of the U.S. "Religious Congregations Membership Study 2010". From this comprehensive membership and church attendance data, Krindatch pointed out the slow but inevitable process of indigenization of the Orthodox Church in America due to the growing proportion of third and fourth American-born generations and the increase of Anglo-American converts, both of which challenge the ethnic and denominational identities of Orthodox jurisdictions. Furthermore, in *Turning to Tradition:* Converts and the Making of an American Orthodox Church, Rev. Oliver Herbel examines the theological reasons for the conversion of Carpatho Rusyns, African Americans, and Evangelicals to Orthodox Christianity and is the first in-depth investigation of African-American Orthodoxy. The Eastern Church in the Spiritual Marketplace: American Conversions to Orthodox *Christianity* is one of few ethnographic studies that examines converts to Eastern Orthodox Christianity in the United States, where Slagle conducts participant-observation in Pittsburgh,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> Krindatch, 539, 562.

Pennsylvania, the "Holy Land" of the Orthodox Church in the United States, and in Jackson, Mississippi, which has witnessed an increase in Orthodox Christian mission parishes.

For the purpose of this thesis, further examination of American conversion to Orthodox Christianity will not be pursued. Regardless, this historiography is relevant in demonstrating that research about the de-ethnicization and indigenization of Orthodox Christianity in the Western Hemisphere is being initiated and the lineage of these publications has its origin in North American scholarship. Apart from conversion trends that began in the 1980s, the history of 18<sup>th</sup> century Russian missions to Alaska serve as an example of an Orthodox Church native to the Western Hemisphere.

## Russian America: Alaska's Enduring Orthodox Heritage

During the era of the Byzantine Empire, missionaries were sent out from Constantinople to convert the Slavic peoples of the north to Orthodox Christianity. In the 9<sup>th</sup> century, the missionaries St. Cyril and St. Methodius emphasized adapting the way the faith was expressed to the cultures of the Slavs. This idea was most evident when it came to language; rather than mandating the use of Greek, Sts. Cyril and Methodius preserved the language of the Slavs by establishing a written Slavic language, which is now recognized as Church Slavonic. Due to these efforts, Orthodox Christianity is still an integral part of the national cultures of various nations in Eastern Europe, such as Bulgaria, Serbia, Ukraine, and Russia, who at that time were independent but recognized Constantinople as a spiritual center. Even with the fall of the Byzantine Empire, Orthodox Christianity spread amongst Slavic peoples in accordance to their own language and cultural traditions. Similarly, the entrance of the Orthodox Church in the United States began in a manner that was attentive to the cosmological and cultural traditions of

Alaskan natives and was initiated by two Russian Orthodox monks who founded a mission on Kodiak Island in 1794.<sup>20</sup>

Reverend Dr. Michael James Oleksa, who has served as a Russian Orthodox priest in over a dozen Native Alaskan villages, is at the forefront of scholarship about Alaska Native cultures and history. He is a leader in the development of cross-cultural education and intercultural relations in the Alaskan context. Works such as Alaskan Missionary Spirituality (1987), Orthodox Alaska: A Theology of Mission (1992), and Another Culture / Another World (2005) have resulted in his scholarship's recognition by the Alaska State Legislature, the National Governors Association, and earned him the title of "Elder" by the Alaska Federation of Natives and "Distinguished Public Servant" by the Board of Regents of the University of Alaska <sup>21</sup>

Orthodox Alaska: A Theology of Mission, is a monumental work for documenting and recognizing Alaska's American Orthodox society, introducing the idea of an Orthodox Church native to North America well before scholars such as Krindatch or Herbel. In this work, Oleksa describes how Orthodox Christianity evolved into an indigenous Native Alaskan faith during three historical periods.

During the first eighty years of the Russian Orthodox mission in Alaska, a missionary team of monks from Valaam and Konevitsa monasteries were sympathetic toward the traditional cultures of Alaskan natives and defended the Aleuts, to the extent that Alexander Andreyevich Baranov, the chief manager of the Russian-American Company, placed the monks under house

<sup>20</sup> Erickson, 34.

Highland Tech High Students, Father Michael Oleksa. Father Michael Oleka's personal website. www.fatheroleksa.org/. Accessed 26 July, 2017.

arrest in 1800 in order to continue carrying out his exploitative plans.<sup>22</sup> These monks understood themselves to be the heirs of Sts. Cyril and Methodius efforts as the evangelizers of the Slavs. Father Herman, who was the last surviving member of the mission team, was canonized as the first Orthodox Saint of America in 1970 and is the Orthodox patron saint of the United States.

The subsequent eighty years consisted of the educational efforts of St. Innocent

Veniaminov and his Aleut colleagues. Starting in the 1820s, governmental reforms in the

Russian Empire stressed the need to build the empire's multinational character; the Russian

Orthodox Church consequently responded by sending missionaries to indigenous tribes in its

eastern territories in Siberia and the United States to create alphabets for native languages, as

well as translate scriptures, service books, and train native clergy. Father John Veniaminov was

one of these new missionaries sent to do missionary work in Unalaska starting in 1824.<sup>23</sup>

Veniaminov learned the local dialects of the Aleut language and Unangan, developed an

alphabet, compiled a dictionary, learned the language and culture of the Tlingit Indians, and as a

bishop, he established a seminary where native and creole students studied theology, native

languages (Aleutian, Eskimo, and Tlingit), medicine, and Latin. He was canonized by the

Russian Orthodox Church as "Saint Innocent, Enlightener of the Aleuts and Apostle to

America" in 1977, becoming the second North American saint.<sup>24</sup>

Opposition to the assimilationist policies of the United States Federal Government characterized the last eighty years of the Russian Orthodox Mission in Alaska. When Russia sold Alaska to the United States in 1867, it was initially seen as an opportunity to continue Orthodox mission work through inserting Orthodox Christianity into the jurisdiction of the United States. New measures such as transferring the bishop's headquarters from Sitka to San

Oleksa, Michael. *Orthodox Alaska: A Theology of Mission*. St. Vladimir's Seminary Press, 1992, 121.

Oleksa, 127.

Erickson, 50.

Francisco, appointing an English speaking bishop and staff, translating materials into English, using English in church services, and establishing a pastoral school to train future clergy in English rather than Russian came to fruition to continue missionary work. While the 1867 treaty stated that the Orthodox Church in Alaska could maintain property ownership and continue missionary work, it did not protect the property or cultural heritage of the native population.<sup>25</sup>

The greatest threat to native culture was carried out in the classroom; aggressive programs were put into place that intended to replace native culture with Anglo-American culture and Protestant values. The Presbyterian minister Sheldon Jackson was the lead figure in the Americanization and assimilation of Alaskan natives; in contrast to the Orthodox mission's bilingual or trilingual approach to education, an English only rule was established. The new missionaries were determined not to translate any materials into the native languages, and Jackson's associate Reverend S. Hal Young said, "We should le the old tongues with their superstitions and sin die – the sooner the better – and replace these languages with that of Christian civilization, and compel the Natives in our schools to speak English and English only". This language policy suppressed the practice of Orthodox Christianity amongst natives.

Oleksa's scholarship is significant for the purposes of this thesis because he frames

Alaskan missionary spirituality as a model for Orthodox mission in the New World. According
to Oleksa, the Orthodox Church in Alaska has persisted to the present because it was founded
and envisioned as an Alaskan church. The success of a mission cannot be constituted on the
basis of cultural homogeneity. Rather, Oleksa insists:

"Alaska reminds America that it is only be embracing each person in his cultural context that Orthodox mission has historically succeeded. Multilingualism will be the social

26

Erickson, 47.

Oleksa, 178.

norm in America in the next century. It will also necessarily be the norm within the Church. May the Alaskan model serve to inspire Orthodox unity in the New World."<sup>27</sup>

Therefore, rather than mandating a mono-linguistic and homogenous missionary agenda, which was met with resistance by the Alaskan natives, in a contemporary North American context, Oleksa advocates that Orthodox unity is only possible through the co-existence of ethnic and non-ethnic Orthodox Christians, where one should enjoy full membership in the Church regardless of nationality or cultural context. Given that Oleksa's research broadly addresses Orthodox mission in the New World but only speaks from a North American context, this thesis will reference Oleksa's propositions within the context of Brazil to examine whether Alaskan missionary spirituality may also serve as a model to the faithful of Brazil and Latin America.

### The Legacy of Alaskan Missionary Spirituality

Due to the presence of the Russian Orthodox Mission in Alaska, at the beginning of the 20<sup>th</sup> century, the 74 initial Orthodox parishes in the United States were united under the "Missionary Diocese of the Russian Orthodox Church in North America" which included Russian, Antiochian, Serbian, Greek, and Romanian missions. This has expanded to 20 major jurisdictions with more than 50 dioceses in present day United States.<sup>28</sup>

Within these jurisdictions, the "Americanization" of the Orthodox Church has been an inevitable and gradual process. Since the 1980s, there has been a greater move to achieve growth and Orthodox unity; as previously discussed, this movement was propelled by converts and by 3rd and 4th generations of immigrants who no longer considered religion and ethnic identity to be inseparable. The process of Americanization mirrors the evangelization strategies of the Russian Orthodox monks in Alaska through encouraging multilingual education, the

-

Oleksa, 220.

Krindatch, 534.

development of theological seminaries, and the push for Orthodox jurisdictional unity in the United States.

The rise of institutions of theological education in the United States was an integral establishment that, similar to the Alaskan missions, accomplished spreading the teaching of Orthodox Christian theology in a language native to an American audience. Holy Cross Greek Orthodox School of Theology in Brookline, Massachusetts and St. Vladimir's Orthodox Theological Seminary in Crestwood, New York were founded in the 1930s so American Orthodox Christians could study in the United States. Previously, aspiring seminarians learned a different language and studied abroad, most commonly in Greece, Lebanon, or Russia.<sup>29</sup>

Parallel to the linguistic goals of the Russian Orthodox missionaries, in 1938 the Holy Synod of the Antiochian Orthodox Church decided that liturgical services should be performed in the native language of each country. The Antiochian Orthodox Archdiocese was the first jurisdiction to institute the widespread use of English, which grew rapidly in the 1960s and 1970s. The decision of the Antiochian Orthodox Archdiocese was also carried out in South America, where Spanish and Portuguese became the official liturgical languages. The debate about liturgical languages was met with the most resistance from the Greek Orthodox Archdiocese. The late Patriarch Athenagoras of Constantinople stated, "The Greek language is and will remain the basic and preeminent liturgical language of the Greek Orthodox Archdiocese of America". 30

Orthodox Christian unity in North America has also been established through the formation of pan-Orthodox organizations, such as the Standing Conference of Canonical

\_

Ware, 182. Since the 1930s other Orthodox Theological Seminaries have been established in the United States, such as St. Sava's Serbian Orthodox Seminary in Libertyville, Illinois, Saint Tikhon's Orthodox Theological Seminary in South Canaan, Pennsylvania, Saint Sophia Ukrainian Orthodox Theological Seminary in Crestwood, New York, and Holy Trinity Orthodox Seminary in Jordanville, New York, amongst others.

Erickson, 111.

Orthodox Bishops in the Americas (SCOBA) in 1960, in addition to the International Orthodox Christian Charities (IOCC) (1992) and the Orthodox Christian Mission Center (OCMC) (1993), two international aid organizations that conduct outreach work worldwide. Furthermore, the Orthodox Church in America (OCA), which was granted autocephaly from the Russian Orthodox Church in 1970, has advanced Orthodox unity to a certain extent.<sup>31</sup>

Additional evidence of Orthodox "indigenization" in the United States has been evident in requests for administrative changes. In 2000, the Greek Orthodox Archdiocese in North America made requests to the Bishop Council of the Ecumenical Patriarchate of Constantinople to give the Archdiocese greater administrative independence from Constantinople. In addition, in 2001 the Assembly of North American Antiochian Archdiocese voted to request that the Mother Church in Syria grant parishes in North America autonomy. 32

It is arguably due to the aforementioned efforts of multilingual education, the development of theological seminaries, and the push for Orthodox jurisdictional unity that the Orthodox Church has received an inflow of converts since the 1970s, especially in the Antiochian Orthodox Christian Archdiocese and the Orthodox Church in America. Most famously, in 1987, 2,000 Evangelical Protestants formerly known as the New Covenant Apostolic Order were baptized at Saint Nicholas Antiochian Cathedral in Los Angeles and received into the Antiochian Orthodox Christian Archdiocese, forming the Antiochian Evangelical Mission (AEOM). In the United States, it has been the greatest conversion to Orthodox Christianity, and since their entry, over one hundred Orthodox Churches have been added to the archdiocese.

Erickson, 119.

Krindatch, 558.

Erickson, 123; Krindatch, 558.

Once more, the legacy of Alaskan Missionary Spirituality serves as an example for further reflection on if and how these same processes of de-ethnicization are being observed in Brazil. In the next several decades, further studies about Orthodox Christianity in Brazil and Latin America will no doubt be comparative in nature in order to fully understand how the Orthodox Church is changing in the Western Hemisphere.

#### The History of Orthodox Christianity in Brazil

A comprehensive history of Orthodox Christianity in South America has not been published nor has it received the attention that it deserves. A thesis titled "A Contribution to the History of the Orthodox Church in South America", authored by the Brazilian monk Father Pedro Siqueira and defended at St. Tikhon's Orthodox Theological Seminary in South Canaan, Pennsylvania, is the first work that has seriously contributed to this field of study.<sup>34</sup> His thesis outlines the history of the Russian, Greek, Ukrainian, and Antiochian Orthodox Churches in Brazil, Paraguay, Argentina, Uruguay, and Colombia.

In addition, the article "A Igreja Ortodoxa no Brasil" written by Mauricio Loiacono as part of the project "Etnia e Religião no Brasil" at the Universidade Presbiteriana Mackenzie, is one of few sources that outlines the various Orthodox Christian jurisdictions in Brazil.

Loiacono's research is didactic in nature, explaining the history, liturgy, and sacraments of the Orthodox Church, but lacks the depth of Father Pedro Siqueira's master's thesis for describing the Orthodox Church in an anachronistic light, as an institution that is distinct and incapable of

<sup>4</sup> 

At the time I was in Brazil on my FIPSE/CAPES grant, I came in touch with Anastasia Theodoropoulos, a doctoral student in the Anthropology Department at the University of New Mexico. She was conducting an ethnographic study of Brazilian converts at the Catedral da Santíssima Virgem Maria in Rio de Janeiro, the See of the Polish Orthodox Diocese of Brazil, composed only of Brazilians. Her ethnographic work is the first of its kind in studying Orthodox Christian converts in Brazil. Furthermore, Robson Nasrani Nunes, who is an undergraduate student majoring in history at the Universidade Estadual da Paraíba, is currently writing his undergraduate thesis about the history of the Orthodox Church in the state of Paraíba.

assimilating. His assertion that Orthodox Churches in Brazil, "são igrejas de imigração . . . o que revela um certo fechamento, fundamentado em um etnicismo peculiar a todas elas, apesar de pretenderem-se católicas e apostólicas, isto é, universais" is certainly true to an extent, but does not take into account the evangelization efforts of the Antiochian Orthodox Church and the Portuguese Orthodox Church's evangelization movement in the 1980s.<sup>35</sup>

The history of the establishment of the Orthodox Church in South America has primarily been documented through historical works about immigration to this continent, which began in the late 19<sup>th</sup> century and continued until the second half of the 20<sup>th</sup> century. In Brazil, the most prevalent immigrant populations that brought the Orthodox faith were the Syrian-Lebanese, Russian, Ukrainian, and Greek immigrants in the South and Southeast of Brazil. Similar to their North-American counterpart, immigrant groups often formed cultural associations that operated out of Orthodox Churches in order to preserve Old World cultural traditions. Due to this insular identity, from the beginning of the 20<sup>th</sup> century to the 1980s, the Orthodox Church did not grow amongst Brazilians.<sup>36</sup> Additional factors such as the shortage of priests, intermarriage, and the lack of financial support also threatened its existence.

The Antiochian Orthodox Church has the greatest faithful base amongst Orthodox Christians in Brazil and has a particular important presence in the state of São Paulo, where the infamous Cathedral of Saints Peter and Paul, the largest Orthodox Church in South America, resides. Before Greek, Russian, and Ukrainian Orthodox Churches were founded and constructed by immigrants in the states of São Paulo, Rio de Janeiro, and Paraná, immigrants

-

Loiacano, Mauricio. "A Igreja Ortodoxa no Brasil." Revista USP, n. 67, 2005, 128.

Siqueira, Father Pedro. "A Contribution to the History of the Orthodox Church in South America." MA thesis, St Tikhon's Orthodox Theological Seminary, 2009, 160.

attended liturgies at different Antiochian Orthodox parishes, which were the first Orthodox Churches in Brazil.<sup>37</sup>

The Antiochian Orthodox Church in Brazil is arguably an exception to the insular legacy of the Orthodox Christianity due to its evangelization efforts and resolution to conduct liturgies in the vernacular. Significant research conducted by scholars such as Jeffrey Lesser of Emory University, Truzzi Oswaldo, Audat Yacoub, and the anthropologist John Tofik Karam's doctoral dissertation Distinguishing Arabesques: The Politics and Pleasures of Being Arab in Neoliberal Brazil (2004) have contributed greatly to the literature about the Syrian-Lebanese community and the role of the Antiochian Orthodox Church within it. In particular, Montie Bryan Pitts Jr., who wrote a master's thesis in 2006 titled "Forging Ethnic Identity Through Faith: Religion and the Syrian-Lebanese Community in São Paulo" is significant in examining the role of the Antiochian Orthodox Church in shaping and preserving ethnic identity. In this thesis, Pitts concludes that the future of the Antiochian Orthodox Church's ethnic heritage is uncertain, due to evangelization, the passing of the original Syrian and Lebanese immigrants, and the conversion and entrance of more non-Arab Brazilians to the church. 38 His assertions accurately mirror the evangelization of the Antiochian Orthodox Church in North America, which accepted 2,000 Protestant converts who founded the Antioquian Orthodox Mission.

-

Siqueira, 68.

Pitts Jr., Montie Brian. "Forging Ethnic Identity Through Faith: Religion and the Syrian-Lebanese Community in São Paulo." MA thesis, Vanderbilt University, August 2006, 70.



Figure 2: The 2008 New Year church bulletin at St. Nicholas Church in Florianopolis, Santa Catarina, the first Greek Orthodox Church in Brazil

In contrast, the Greek Orthodox Church in Brazil has demonstrated to be the most confined community. Liturgies are still conducted in Koiné Greek, and according to Father Pedro Siqueira's assertions, the Greek Orthodox Church does not have the financial support or the willpower to evangelize like the Antiochian Orthodox Church.<sup>39</sup> The first Greek Orthodox Church in Brazil was founded in Santa Catarina when Commander Savas Nicolas Savas brought a priest who started celebrating liturgies in the 1880s. In 1924, this community founded the Greek Orthodox Brotherhood of Saint Constantine society, whose purpose was to maintain the

<sup>39</sup> Siqueira, 111.

cultural unity of the Greek colony in Florianopolis. This society raised funds to build the first Greek Orthodox Church in Brazil.<sup>40</sup>

In 1960, there were only two Greek Orthodox Churches in Brazil: Saint Peter and Paul Orthodox Parish in São Paulo, Saint Nicolau Orthodox Parish in Florianopolis, and a private Greek Orthodox Church in Lins, São Paulo State. From the 1950s-1970s, however, Brazil received the greatest number Greek immigrants, of whom most settled in Rio de Janeiro. In 1971, the construction of the first Greek Orthodox Parish in the Higionópolis neighborhood in Rio de Janeiro was finished. Father Dimitrios Nicolaidis, who was the first Greek Orthodox priest of this parish, also traveled to serve liturgy once a month in Vitoria, Espírito Santo and Belo Horizonte, Minas Gerais. Subsequent parishes were founded in the states of Paraná and Rio Grande do Sul. Despite the proliferation of Greek Orthodox Churches starting in the 1960s, its faithful base has not grown, and apart from works such as Paschoal Apóstolo Pítsica's *A Contribuição Grega* (1994) and Father Siquiera's thesis, there is a significant gap in research about Brazil's Greek Orthodox communities.

The Ukrainian Orthodox Church in Brazil in contrast has a significant following in the states of Paraná, Santa Catarina, Rio Grande do Sul, and São Paulo, and has even produced seminarians. The Ukrainian Orthodox Church was first established in various parts of Paraná, in localities such as Dorizon, Antônio Olinto, Cruz Machado, Marco Cinco, Gonçalves Júnior, São Roque, Curitiba, Piraquara, Guajuvira, Iapó (Castro), Joaquim Távora, Nova Ucrânia, Maringá, Palmital, and Ponta Grossa. Significantly more scholarship has been produced about

Sigueira, 46.

In his thesis, Father Pedro Siqueira recounts the striking story of the Saint Tsambika Parish in Lins, São Paulo. Mr. Vassiliadis, who was the founder of the Orthodox parish, had a dream in which the Theotokos challenged him to build the church for his mother. The church exists as a historical monument in Lins but no longer has an Orthodox community.

Siqueira, 120.

the role of Ukrainian immigration to Brazil and the role of the Orthodox Church in these communities, such as Valdomiro Burko's *A Imigração Ucraniana no Brasil* (1963) and Nelson Gimar Zaroski's *A Utilização do Tempo pelos Imigrantes Ucranianos de Prudentópolis* (2001).



**Figure 3:** A news bulletin from the Ukrainian Orthodox Archdiocese in Brazil commemorating Easter, published both in Portuguese and in Ukrainian.

When Ukrainian immigrants first arrived, however, there were no Ukrainian Orthodox priests. Until the first Ukrainian priest arrived in Brazil in 1926, two Byzantine Catholic Ukrainian priests, Father Nikon Rozdolskyi and Father Paulo Petrytskyi, attended to the Ukrainian Orthodox immigrants, which ultimately resulted in the significant exit of Ukrainians from the Orthodox Church to the Byzantine Catholic Church and the Roman Catholic Church.<sup>43</sup>

Siqueira, 52.

Nevertheless, in his thesis Father Pedro Siqueira asserts that many Brazilians of Ukrainian decent are returning to the Ukrainian Orthodox Church in the 21<sup>st</sup> century. Perhaps the Ukrainian Orthodox Church's greatest contribution in Brazil is its claim to producing the first South American Orthodox saint. Maria Aparecida Buruski (1955-1986), a teacher that taught in a school connected to a Ukrainian Orthodox Church in Paraná, died in a school fire while saving several students. Many Ukrainians revere her and there is continued discussion about canonizing her as a saint.<sup>44</sup>



**Figure 5:** Maria Aparecida Bureski saved schoolchildren from a school fire by throwing them out the window, and when she could save no more, she held eight children in the corner of the schoolhouse and they died together while she covered them with her body. In this photo, an Orthodox Christian venerates Maria Aparecida Bureski at her grave, where she is buried with her eight pupils. In the 21<sup>st</sup> century there is still discussion about canonizing her as a saint, which would make her the first South American Orthodox saint.

Siqueira, 123.

-

In the states of São Paulo and Rio de Janeiro, Russian immigrants held liturgy in Antiochian Orthodox Churches before the establishment of the first Russian Orthodox Churches. The first Russian Orthodox Church was built in Campinas das Missões in Rio Grande do Sul in 1912 and has expanded to seven functioning parishes in Rio Grande do Sul, São Paulo, Rio de Janeiro, Manaus, and Brasília. This will soon include the first Russian Orthodox monastery in South America, which is currently being constructed in Fundão, Espírito Santo. Today, most of Brazil's Russian Orthodox Christians in Brazil reside in the state of São Paulo, numbering at about 4,000. Both scholars and laypeople have made significant contributions that study the role of the Russian Orthodox Church in Russian immigration, such as Valentina Lysenko's *Alma Russa, Terra Brasileira* (2002), Jean Magalinski's *A Igreja Ortodoxa Russa – Exílio em Fé em Goiânia* (2005), Dr. Jacinto Anatólio Zabolotsky's *A Imigração Russa no Rio Grande do Sul* (2007), and Alexandre Zhebit's *Brasil-Rússia: História, Política, Cultura* (2005).

In the 21<sup>st</sup> century, it is arguable that the Russian Orthodox Church is comparable to the Antiochian Orthodox Church in terms of mission, influence, and relative recognition in Brazilian society. In São Paulo, the Holy Dormition of the Mother of God Russian Orthodox Church has a significant non-Russian faithful base.<sup>47</sup> Leonardo Freitas Arroyo, a parishioner of this parish, was recently admitted as the first Latin American seminarian in the Moscow Theological Academy and Seminary located in Trinity Lavra of St Sergius, which is regarded as the most

\_

<sup>&</sup>quot;Espírito Santo vai receber primeiro mosteiro da Igreja Católica Ortodoxa Russa." *Folha Vitória*, 16 Dec. 2016, <a href="www.folhavitoria.com.br/geral/noticia/2016/12/espirito-santo-vai-receber-primeiro-mosteiro-da-igreja-catolica-ortodoxa-russa.html">www.folhavitoria.com.br/geral/noticia/2016/12/espirito-santo-vai-receber-primeiro-mosteiro-da-igreja-catolica-ortodoxa-russa.html</a>. Accessed 5 Aug. 2017.

<sup>&</sup>quot;Líder ortodoxo pide la 'unidad de las religiones' en Brasil." *NoticiaCristiana.com*, 22 Feb. 2016, www.noticiacristiana.com/iglesia/ecumenismo/2016/02/lider-ortodoxo-pide-la-unidad-de-las-religiones-en-brasil.html. Accessed 26 July 2017. It is important to note that the Russian Orthodox Community of Old Believers is also prevalent in Brazil and South America, but it is not included in this statistic due to its non-canonical status. It separated from the Patriarchate of Moscow in 1927.

This was my observation when I visited the church with Leonardo Freitas Arroyo during the visit of Patriarch Kirill of Moscow. The older parishioners in the church were ethnically Russian, but the younger generation of faithful consisted of university students who had converted to Orthodox Christianity.

important Russian monastery and spiritual center of the Russian Orthodox Church. Furthermore, a Missão Ortodoxa da Proteção da Mãe de Deus in Rio de Janeiro is a Russian Orthodox Mission that celebrates liturgy in Portuguese. Despite the growth and recognition that the Russian Orthodox Church has witnessed, events such as the Bolshevik Revolution and the spread of communism previously hindered its existence; since the Orthodox Church was suspected of having ties with communist ideology by governmental authorities, Orthodox Churches consequently could not be labeled as "Russian" because Russian social institutions were banned.<sup>48</sup>



**Figure 4:** Padre Dionísio of the Holy Dormition of the Mother of God Russian Orthodox Church in São Paulo, awaiting the grand entrance of Patriarch Kirill of Moscow.

**Figure 5:** During his visit to São Paulo, Patriarch Kirill of Moscow celebrated liturgy in Sts. Peter and Paul Antiochian Orthodox Cathedral.

Siqueira, 152.

Patriarch Kirill of Moscow's visit to Brazil during his South American tour in February 2016 also illustrates the relevance of the Russian Orthodox Church's presence and influence in Brazil. At his first stop in Rio de Janeiro, his speech at Christ the Redeemer called for the unity of Catholics and Orthodox Christians to put an end to the de-Christianization of human civilization in the 21<sup>st</sup> century. This speech echoed the words he shared during his historic meeting with Pope Francis in Cuba on February 12, 2017, which was the first time that a Catholic Pope and a Russian Orthodox Patriarch met to discuss issues of the Church. In his visit to São Paulo, due to the size of the crowd of Orthodox faithful, Patriarch Kirill celebrated liturgy in Saints Peter and Paul Antiochian Orthodox Cathedral and subsequently visited the Holy Dormition of the Mother of God Russian Orthodox Church, which is the only canonical Russian Orthodox Parish in the city of São Paulo. De Paulo Church, which is the only canonical Russian Orthodox Parish in the city of São Paulo.

Another historic occurrence of a different nature occurred when the previous Minister of Culture Gilberto Gil visited the Russian Orthodox Church of Santa Zenaida in Rio de Janeiro, Brazil to attend the baptism of the son of the high profile couple Fernanda Torres and Adrucha Waddington. In the Orthodox Church, the godparents of baptized children must be Orthodox Christians. Thus, thirty minutes before the baptism of Joaquim, his godmother-to-be and aunt Elizabeth Waddington converted to Orthodoxy, and Fernanda Torres converted during the same meeting, explaining that, "Simplesmente, a Ortodoxia tem um traço muito atraente para mim: não muda suas tradições para se conformar aos tempos e ventos modernos". <sup>51</sup>

\_

<sup>&</sup>quot;O Papa e o Patriarca Ortodoxo reconciliam as duas grandes vertentes do Cristianismo." *Sputnik Brasil*, 15 Feb. 2016, <u>br.sputniknews.com/noticias/201602153586317-papa-patriarca-ortodoxo-reconciliacao-vertentes-cristianismo/</u>. Accessed 26 July 2017.

These were my observations when I attended liturgy during Patriarch Kirill's visit. Orthodox Christians of all denominations attended the liturgy at Saints Peter and Paul Antiochian Orthodox Church, whereas Patriarch Kirill's visit at the Holy Dormition of the Mother of God Orthodox Church was more heavily attended by Russians. 
"Reencontro com a Igreja à Brasileira." *Igreja Ortodoxa do Brasil*, 29 Jan. 2017. <a href="http://ortodoxia-brasil.blogspot.com/2008/01/reencontro-com-igreja-brasileira.html">http://ortodoxia-brasil.blogspot.com/2008/01/reencontro-com-igreja-brasileira.html</a>. Accessed 27 July 2017; Torres, Fernanda. "Eucaristia." *Veja Rio*, 25 Feb. 2017, vejario.abril.com.br/blog/fernanda-torres/eucaristia/. Accessed 28 July 2017.

Despite the development of Brazilian scholarship that documents the role of the Orthodox Church in Brazil, there are few published studies that examine the 1980s evangelical movement of Orthodox Christians in Brazil, with Father Pedro Siqueira's thesis being the principal source. My aim is to demonstrate how the history of Orthodox mission in Brazil is parallel to the history of mission in Alaska, and how an inter-American comparison is possible due to shared histories of translation and the continued Slavic tradition initiated by Sts. Cyril and Methodius of adapting the customs of the Church to its people. My original contribution is to outline evangelization that has occurred since Father Pedro Siqueira wrote his thesis in 2009 and contribute to the visual documentation of this history.

The Polish Orthodox Church and the Serbian Orthodox Church in the Northeast and Southeast of Brazil: Orthodox Theology of Mission in a Brazilian Context

Of the thirteen universally recognized regional, autocephalous Orthodox Churches, there is no Brazilian Orthodox Church. The foundation of an Orthodox Church native to Brazilians has therefore developed under the jurisdiction of other autonomous Orthodox Churches that originate from Old World cultures. In Brazil, the Orthodox Church founded and created by native Brazilians for the Brazilian people first grew and developed under the Portuguese Orthodox Church from 1986-2000, which was not a canonical Orthodox Church during the initial period of evangelization. This movement began just as the third major wave of immigration was ending and curiously it took place in the northeastern states of Pernambuco and Paraíba, a region that had not received the magnitude of Orthodox Christian immigration that the

South and Southeast received a century earlier. A community in Rio de Janeiro was also part of this movement.

The formation of a Brazilian Orthodox Church is a product of the time in which it was formed. The movement occurred during the tumultuous 1970s, a decade of counter-cultural movements that strongly contested and challenged government and religious institutions. In other ways, the 1970s were also a repudiation of the 1960s, where a new conservative backlash responded to the turbulence of the 1960s through defending political conservatism and traditional family roles.<sup>52</sup> In Brazil, the group of spiritual seekers initially began searching new traditions and spiritual expressions to replace institutions that they considered repressive and outdated. At the end of their spiritual search, they found Orthodox Christianity, an ironic return to the traditionalism and conservatism they sought to distance themselves from.

This group consisted of Brazilian astrologists from Recife and Rio de Janeiro and was led by the astrologist Eduardo Maia. In their search they primarily sought out Oriental traditions, such as yoga, Zen, Taoism, Buddhism, and Islam.<sup>53</sup> Its members came from diverse religious backgrounds, such Catholicism, Protestantism, and atheism. To immerse themselves in these Eastern traditions, they studied cosmology, metaphysics, mythology, and symbolism. One such intellectual that was pertinent to their spiritual search was René Guénon, a French metaphysician and writer that was influential in laying the metaphysical groundwork for the Traditionalist school of thought in the early twentieth century. René Guénon's works also influenced the conversion of North American spiritual searchers during the same time period, most notably Father Seraphim Rose, which is discussed in the next chapter of this thesis.

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>52</sup> "The 1970s." *History.com*, A+E Networks, 2010, <u>www.history.com/topics/1970s</u>. Accessed 26 July 2017. Siqueira, 66.

In September 1985, the Portuguese journalist Antonio Carlos Carvalho arrived in Brazil to give lectures about tradition in the modern world, spiritual esoterism, and symbolism in Rio de Janeiro and Recife in lectures titled "Igrejas & Igrejas" and "Introdução ao Simbolismo da Arte Sagrada". Antonio Carlos Carvalho, also known as Archpriest Athanasius, was also an Orthodox priest of the Orthodox Church in Portugal and the Portuguese translator of René Guénon. In his talks, he lectured about Guénon's depiction of Orthodox Christianity and its traditions. Guénon turned away from his Catholic upbringing and eventually become a convert of Islam; regardless, the tenets of Guénon's personal beliefs were not what influenced these Brazilian astrologers, but rather his insistence on the importance of practice within a particular spiritual tradition.<sup>54</sup> Upon request from the astrologists who attended these conferences, Archpriest Athanasius returned in December of the same year to give courses about Orthodox Christianity to this group of Brazilians.<sup>55</sup> The first intellectual this group studied was Sergei Bulgakov, a Russian Orthodox Christian theologian and philosopher who wrote profusely about his evolution from being a Marxist to a devout Orthodox Christian. Similar to the model of American Orthodoxy that arose from the Alaskan missions, Russian Orthodox spirituality became the example from which to model a native Brazilian Orthodox Church.

After these courses, Metropolitan Gabriel of the Orthodox Church of Portugal invited the Brazilian group of astrologers to visit Portugal in 1986 to learn more about Orthodox Christianity at the Orthodox Monastery in Mafra, Portugal. The Brazilian astrologers' turn to monastic tradition is parallel to the history of Orthodox tradition in Alaska, where the first American

\_

<sup>&</sup>quot;René Guénon's Life and Work." *World Wisdom*, 2008, <u>www.worldwisdom.com/public/authors/Rene-Guenon.asp# edn6</u>. Accessed 26 July 2017.

Within Father Alexis Álfaro's primary source collection that documents this history, I read additional accounts that show that in November of 1985, Antonio Carlos Carvalho also presented at the First International Congress of Astrology which took place in Hotel Glória, Rio de Janeiro, themed "Fernando Pessoa, Astrólogo", and administered the courses "Tradição & Tradições", "Messianismo & Sebastianismo" and "A Cavalaria & o Amor" during the same period in Rio de Janeiro and Recife, but there is no mention of this in Father Pedro Siqueira's thesis.

Orthodox mission originated with arrival of Russian missionary monks from Valaam Monastery. Five pilgrims from Recife and four from Rio de Janeiro traveled to Portugal, and after a month they were all baptized. However, Metropolitan Gabriel did not concede to their request to send priests to Brazil; he did not have spare clergy and mandated that the church be local and native to Brazil. Consequently, Father Paulo, also known as Eduardo Maia and the leader of the spiritual movement, and Father Alexis Álfaro were ordained as priests, in addition to the two sub-deacons Rev. Filipe and Rev. Alexandre, and they were blessed with the Metropolitan's permission to establish the Orthodox Church in Brazil for Brazilians. This decision was unusual, given that priests are customarily ordained upon receiving theological training, but neither had attended an Orthodox Seminary.



**Figure 6:** Father Pedro Siqueira points out the plot of land on Father Elias Cavalcanti's property where priests initially started baptizing Brazilians.

The newly ordained priests Father Paulo and Father Alexis baptized the faithful in Recife and Rio de Janeiro upon their return to Brazil in July of 1986, despite the fact that these faithful had never been in an Orthodox Church nor had they attended liturgy. Dr. Ned Cavalcanti, an engineer from Recife and one of the baptized faithful, offered a barn on his property in Aldeia, Camaragibe to serve as Holy Trinity Parish, which was the first Orthodox Church in the Northeast. Simultaneously, The Most Holy Virgin Orthodox Cathedral in Rio de Janeiro was consecrated, becoming the second Orthodox Church that was founded and originated from this movement. Both Orthodox Churches celebrated liturgies in Portuguese. Saint Catherine of Alexandria the Great Martyr Parish, which was the second Orthodox Church to be established in the Northeast of Brazil, was founded in February of 1987 in Conde, a suburb of João Pessoa, and subsequently established the joint Orthodox monastery of St. Nicholas. In the same year, Metropolitan Gabriel ordained another priest, Father Bento, to serve in the missions in Quissamã, Natividade, Maricá, and Cordeiro in the state of Rio de Janeiro. Therefore, a year after the Orthodox Church was established in Brazil, there were three parishes and four missions that had been founded and established by Brazilians. 56

Siqueira, 74.



**Figure 7**: Holy Trinity Serbian Orthodox Monastery in Camaragibe, Pernambuco.



**Figure 8**: The interior of Holy Trinity Serbian Orthodox Monastery, which was the first Orthodox Church and Monastery in the Northeast of Brazil.



**Figure 9:** Saint Catherine the Great Martyr Polish Orthodox Church in Conde, Paraíba.



**Figure 10:** The Interior of Saint Catherine the Great Martyr Polish Orthodox Church in Conde, Paraíba, with Archimandrite Jerônimo, a monastic priest.

A significant event that changed the canonical status of the Orthodox Churches in Brazil was when Metropolitan Gabriel decided to cut off the Orthodox Church of Portugal's communion with the non-canonical Greek Old calendar Synod in 1989. The Portuguese Orthodox Church was thus received under Metropolitan Basílio, who was the head of the canonical Polish Orthodox Autocephalous Church. In the same year, the first exhibition of holy icons written by Brazilian iconographers was exhibited in the states of Paraíba, Pernambuco, Rio de Janeiro, and São Paulo.<sup>57</sup>

In 1991, Metropolitan Gabriel made his first and only trip to Brazil to visit all of the newly formed Orthodox parishes and to consecrate Holy Trinity Orthodox Church in Camaragibe, Pernambuco and Saint Catherine of Alexandria the Great Martyr Orthodox Church in Conde, Paraíba. During his visit he did not consecrate the Most Holy Virgin Orthodox Cathedral in Rio de Janeiro because it was located in a rented house. Five years after the foundation of the evangelical Orthodox Church, the number of faithful had increased to several hundred and two new missions were founded in Belo Jardim, Pernambuco and in São Paulo. In addition, Metropolitan Gabriel ordained six more priests and three priests were elevated as Archpriest. Brazilians also started to enter monasticism; more than twenty traveled to the monastery in Mafra, Portugal to take part in monastic life. Over the next several years, a Diocese was created with a local bishop to supervise the young church in Brazil and more parishes were being founded, such as Saint Bento of Nurcia in Ilha do Governador, Rio de Janeiro, Saint Jorge the Great Martyr in Marica, Rio de Janeiro, and Saint Nicolau in Juiz de Fora, Minas Gerais. There were five hundred newly baptized believers and thirteen priests, five deacons, several readers, and subdeacons.<sup>58</sup>

Siqueira, 80.

<sup>8</sup> Siqueira, 160.

Eleven years after the establishment of the first Orthodox Churches founded by
Brazilians, Metropolitan Gabriel, who was the pillar of the Portuguese Orthodox Church, passed
away in 1997. After a series of administrative changes, the Brazilian Diocese was brought under
the Polish Orthodox Church and its canonical status was preserved. Whereas the majority of the
parishes decided to stay within the jurisdiction of the Polish Orthodox Church, Holy Trinity
Parish in Camaragibe was admitted into the Serbian Orthodox Church in 2002, when Bishop
Mitrophan of Eastern United States and South America accepted the parish with its entire
clergy.<sup>59</sup> Given that Holy Trinity Parish is in a remote location, years later, the Dormition of the
Theotokos Serbian Orthodox Church was founded in Boa Vista, Recife in a rented room, where
Father Alexis Álfaro and Father Rafael de Queiroz Santos are currently the acting priests.



**Figure 11**: The Dormition of the Theotokos Serbian Orthodox Church, which is located in a rented room of an office building in Boa Vista, Recife.

**Figure 12**: Father Alexis Álfaro, the priest of the Dormition of the Theotokos Serbian Orthodox Church.

<sup>-</sup>

Siqueira, 178. Metropolitan Amfilohije Radovic is the current Bishop of Montenegro and the Episcopal Administrator of the Serbian Orthodox Diocese of Buenos Aires and South and Central America.

When Metropolitan Gabriel passed away, many Brazilians became disillusioned with the new leadership and left the Orthodox Church, including the group's original leader and first ordained priest, Eduardo Maia, who continues to work as an astrologist in Recife.<sup>60</sup> Regardless, in the 21<sup>st</sup> century, the legacy of the Brazilian astrologists' evangelization efforts continues, although perhaps not to the same extent or magnitude.

Father Jário Carlos is a model of the most recent Orthodox missionary efforts in the Northeast of Brazil. Previously a Protestant pastor, Father Jários was pursuing his doctorate in theology at Mackenzie Presbyterian University in São Paulo when he decided to convert to Orthodox Christianity after years of contact with the Orthodox faith through Father Alexis Alfaro. In addition to working as a professional translator and lecturer in Greek, Hebrew, and Theology at the Faculdade Maurício de Nassau, Father Jário attends to the flock of the small but growing community of Orthodox Christians at Saint John Chrysostom Orthodox parish in Caruaru, Pernambuco and Saint Anthony the Great Orthodox Parish in Belo Jardim, Pernambuco, both of which are under the Serbian Orthodox Archdiocese. Given that Saint John Chrysostom Orthodox Parish is small and located on the outskirts of Caruaru, it is inaccessible for most of its parishioners; for this reason, Father Jário celebrates biweekly Orthodox liturgies at a local Catholic convent. Therefore, Father Jário began a campaign in 2015 to build an Orthodox Church in Caruaru, which is currently under construction. Erik Henrique, who is a parishioner of this community, is pursuing studies at the Orthodox theological seminary in Montenegro.

\_

When I was in Recife on my FIPSE/CAPES grant, Father Pedro Siqueira so kindly contacted Eduardo Maia on my behalf to schedule an interview, but he declined to answer questions.



**Figure 13**: Saint Anthony the Great Serbian Orthodox Parish in Belo Jardim, Pernambuco. For lack of a church, the parish is located in a spacious room in one of the parishioner's residence.



**Figure 14**: Father Jário points out Saint John Chrysostom Orthodox Parish, which is located in the rural zone of Caruaru.

**Figure 15**: The interior of St. John Chrysostom Orthodox Parish.



**Figure 16**: Father Jário and seminarian Erik Henrique examine the plot of land where the new Saint John Chrysostom Orthodox Parish will be built. This picture was taken in June 2015.



**Figure 17**: The first Eucharist was celebrated on the construction site of the Orthodox Church in November 2016.

**Figure 18**: The construction of Saint John Chrysostom Parish in June 2017.

Another notable Orthodox Christian community in the Northeast of Brazil includes the small but dedicated group of faithful in Fortaleza. An Orthodox Church has yet to be built in Fortaleza with an acting priest, thus the Fortaleza native Diego Ribeiro built a small chapel in his home and holds weekly prayer services. Arquimandrita Jerônimo, who is the residing priest at Saint Catherine the Great Martyr in Conde, Paraíba, travels once a year to celebrate liturgy in Fortaleza.<sup>61</sup>



**Figure 19:** Weekly prayer services in Fortaleza are held in Diego Ribeiro's residence.

-

When I was visiting Fortaleza, Lígia (Sarah) Pimenta, an Orthodox Christian parishioner in Paraíba, put me in touch with this community. They were incredibly welcoming and a dedicated group of individuals composed of about eight men, not all of them baptized Orthodox Christians, but interested in learning about the Orthodox Church. Diego Ribeiro, the leader of this prayer group, was baptized in Constantinople.

The third nascent Orthodox community in the Northeast of Brazil consists of the private Orthodox Church that is being constructed in Paulo Afonso, Bahia by Amin Seba, a Brazilian of Syrian descent from São Paulo. Upon moving to Paulo Afonso to work as a university professor, Amin began constructing an Orthodox Church in his backyard due to the scarcity of Orthodox Churches in the Northeast, and it is currently under construction.<sup>62</sup> In addition, the Missão Ortodoxa dos Santos Apóstolos Pedro e Paulo, which is under the Polish Orthodox Archdiocese, is located in Guarabira, Paraíba with Father Emiliano as the acting priest.<sup>63</sup> Father Emiliano also attends to the Missão Ortodoxa da Apresentação da Santíssima Virgem Maria in Rio Tinto, Paraíba, and the Missão Ortodoxa de Santo Antônio, o Grande in Jacaraú. Paraíba.<sup>64</sup>

In the Southeast of Brazil, the Serbian Orthodox Mission of St. Peter and Paul in Campinas, São Paulo, is the home parish of Editora Theotokos, the Brazilian publishing company that produces Orthodox Christian texts, which is the subject of the next chapter of this thesis. Father Marko Obradovic, who is the residing priest of this mission, is a native of Serbia who graduated from St. Sava's Serbian Orthodox Seminary in Libertyville, Illinois.

The history of the evangelization of Brazil's Orthodox Christians reflects what Oleksa defined as the model of "American Orthodoxy": as a Church that embraces each people in its cultural context. For the purpose of this thesis, I propose that Oleksa's theory should also be defined as a model of "Inter-American Orthodoxy", given that the Brazilian missionary priests and their North American counterparts are aware of each other's missionary presence and provide mutual support. For example, both Father Pedro Siqueira and Father Jário lived in St.

\_

I did not have the opportunity to meet Amin or see the construction of the church, but Lígia (Sarah) Pimenta put me in touch with him and he kindly shared his story in an informal interview.

<sup>&</sup>quot;Igreja Ortodoxa Polonesa no Nordeste." *Igreja Ortodoxa Polonesa no Nordeste*, COMMUNITY CHURCH, 2023, <a href="http://igrejapolonesa.wixsite.com/nordeste/igrejas">http://igrejapolonesa.wixsite.com/nordeste/igrejas</a>. Accessed 6 Aug. 2017.

<sup>&</sup>quot;Localização de Igrejas." *Primeiros Passos na Ortodoxia: Um Blog da Igreja Ortodoxa Autocéfala da Polônia*, 2017. primeirospassosnaortodoxia.blogspot.com/p/localizacao-de-igrejas.html. Accessed 6 Aug. 2017.

Herman of Alaska Monastery in Platina, California and Father Pedro Siqueira pursued his master's degree in theology at St. Tikhon's Theological Orthodox Seminary in South Canaan, Pennsylvania. Archimandrite Gerasim, the dean of St. Seraphim's Cathedral in Dallas, Texas and the former abbot of St. Herman of Alaska monastery, is the spiritual father of the Serbian Orthodox community in the Brazil's Northeast and is the serving priest at the Nativity of our Lord Orthodox Monastery in Kemp Texas, where Mother Barbara, a Recife native who converted during the 1980s Orthodox evangelical movement, is the abbess. Furthermore, the Brazilian iconographer Father Rafael Queiroz has collaborated with Father Theodore Jurewicz, a renowned North American, Portuguese-speaking Orthodox priest and iconographer in Pennsylvania. Editora Theotokos's inspiration from Father Seraphim Rose's printing press in St. Herman of Alaska Monastery in Platina, California is further evidence of a nascent Inter-American Orthodox Christianity, which is detailed in the third chapter of this thesis.



Figure 20: Father Rafael Queiroz in his iconography studio.

### The Future of the Orthodox Church in Brazil

The third major wave of the immigration of Orthodox Christians to Brazil ended in the 1970s. Therefore, the Orthodox Churches in Brazil should no longer be considered "churches in diaspora"; newer generations do not consider themselves to be in "diaspora" but rather as Brazilians with an ethnic past or, in the case of the missions, as native Brazilians with no connection to the Old World.

Apart from the missionary efforts, which have incited growth, the Orthodox Church in Brazil sees itself in decline amongst 3<sup>rd</sup> and 4<sup>th</sup> generations of immigrants. Amongst several reasons, the youngest generations have left the church because the language of the services became a barrier in accessing and understanding Orthodox Christianity. The liturgical use of language in the Orthodox Church has always been an issue central to identity and preservation of tradition.

Apart from language, theological education is also a barrier that has divided believers from the Old World and the New World. An Orthodox seminary has never been established in South America; given that an Orthodox seminary that uses Portuguese or Spanish to teach theology does not exist, full knowledge of a foreign language such as Greek, Arabic, English, or a Slavic language is required for those who want to pursue theological studies overseas. There are currently three Brazilians abroad that are pursuing theological studies at Orthodox Christian seminaries in the United States, Brazil, and Montenegro. In his thesis, Father Pedro Siqueira therefore urges the establishment of an Orthodox seminary in South America "in conjunction with all the Orthodox jurisdictions in order to form priests and missionaries who in turn will be equipped to pastor both ethnics and native South Americans". With this theological training, he imagined the subsequent establishment of local parishes "for local people who want to join

-

Siqueira, 173.

the Orthodox Church, but have not yet found a way to do so" and that these parishes would be equipped "to receive the new generations of ethnic Orthodox people who do not think or feel themselves to be ethnic immigrants anymore but Latino people. They speak Portuguese or Spanish, and they think and feel that they are Latinos". Father Pedro Siqueira's vision is equal to that of the Russian monks from Valaam Monastery who fulfilled their spiritual mission through the establishment of theological seminaries in Alaska.

Due to the misled belief that to be an Orthodox Christian is to be of ethnic descent and that Orthodoxy Christianity does not belong in the West, it presents itself as a religion inaccessible to a western audience. For a population that is geographically and culturally isolated from a non-western tradition, overcoming the remoteness of Orthodox Christianity is often gained through readership, which underscores the necessary role of literature in mission theology. The following chapter outlines the challenges that Western scholars, thinkers, and theologians have encountered in contextualizing an Eastern tradition for a Western audience.

66

Siqueira, 173-174.

## Chapter 2

# **Integrating Worldviews: Orthodox Theology in the West**

In a letter addressed to a reader of René Guénon, Father Seraphim Rose, a renowned North American Orthodox Christian monk and theologian, explains, "'Eastern Wisdom' is not for us who are the flesh and blood of the West". The following section will analyze how western thinkers and theologians, such as Father Seraphim Rose and Guénon, who influenced the rise of Orthodox Christianity in Brazil, conceptualize and bridge the cosmological divide between the eastern and western hemispheres. This synthesis is necessary in understanding the challenges that Orthodox Christian publishing companies in the United States and Brazil have confronted in evangelizing their respective audiences.

Introducing Orthodox Christian Spirituality to a Western Audience

There are few works published by scholars in the East that address the reception of Orthodox Christianity in the Western Hemisphere. The book *Bright Faith* is a rare book of such dimensions and consists of compiled interviews with Father Artemy Vladimirov, a contemporary English-speaking protopriest of All Saints' Orthodox Church in Moscow, Russia. Throughout these compiled interviews from *Road to Emmaus: A Journal of Orthodox Faith and Culture*, he discusses his interactions with Western pilgrims in Russia, the majority of which are from the United States and Great Britain. In his interviews he offers advice as to how to discuss Orthodoxy with Westerners and how to help Western Orthodox Christians approximate to a more intimate understanding of the Orthodox faith. In speaking with Westerners, he states that

41

-

Hieromonk Damascene. *Christ the Eternal Tao*. 6<sup>th</sup> ed., Valaam Books, 2012, 448.

the ultimate challenge is "to rid ourselves of the rational western thinking" in order to arrive at this approximation to the East.<sup>68</sup>

Curiously, when asked to comment on his perceived notions of cultural differences between the eastern and western values, he chose to focus his musings on western entertainment enjoyed by "modern young people". Upon reflecting about these differences, he stated "the idea of a weekend as a time for continuous fun or amusement [in the West] certainly doesn't allow one to cast a glance into one's own soul or think about the meaning of life. This modern cultural 'relaxation' often excludes any time for serious meditation". This "meditation", or "contemplation through prayer", which he inherently defines as being a foreign custom to a Western audience, is a pillar to Eastern Orthodoxy that the sociologist Kyriacos Markides also explores in his book *Mountain of Silence*.

In the United States, Kyriacos Markides of the University of Maine is an example of such an academic that has dedicated his research endeavors to conceptualizing Eastern Orthodox Christianity to a Western audience. In an autobiographical account that introduces his work *Mountain of Silence*, he describes his spiritual and intellectual journey into Eastern wisdom. He speaks from his personal experience as a western academic that, "For a worldly man of letters, a social scientist, the only real world was the world of hard facts". He calls Eastern Orthodoxy "mystical" and "experiential", as opposed to Western Christianity, and when he started his fieldwork at an Orthodox monastery in Cyprus, he stated, "I was ready for an adventure within the mystical, experiential tradition of organized Christianity that survived in a few ancient

\_

Bright Faith: Father Artemy Vladimirov Talks with Western Orthodox Christians. Edited by Mother Nectaria McLees, Christ the Savior Brotherhood Publishing, 2010, 65.

Bright Faith: Father Artemy Vladimirov Talks with Western Orthodox Christians, 86.

Markides, Kyriacos C., *The Mountain of Silence*. Doubleday (Random House), 2001, 2.

monasteries unknown to the West and to mainstream Christianity". Therefore, he describes his journey back to Eastern Orthodoxy as an "intellectual challenge" due to his renouncement of his western way of rational thinking. In engaging in this East-West dichotomy, it becomes evident that the West is the designated audience of Markides's work as he laments over the dubious reputation that monks and hermits have in Western culture.

Markides ultimately resolved to abandon this rationalism because, "It increasingly became clear to me that the secular assumptions about reality, dominant during my university training, were in fact a grand illusion, a materialist superstition that had kept Western though stranded and imprisoned for the last three hundred years". For this reason, Markides names Mount Athos and the title of the book "Mountain of Silence"; Eastern Orthodoxy is understood from the "eye of contemplation", or meditation, rather than rational thinking. Due to this different approach, Markides expresses his belief that Mount Athos could make a contribution towards developing the "eye of contemplation" to restore tradition to the Western hemisphere. <sup>73</sup>

Markides curiously defines Eastern Orthodoxy as the Christian equivalent of Tibet.

Upon observing monastic lifestyle on Mount Athos, he compares the monks to "Christian yogis, the type that Westerners seek in the ashrams of India". Given that Eastern Orthodox tradition has been preserved in monasteries since the early centuries of the common era, he expresses "To my amazement I discovered that the spiritual practices and psycho-technologies we seek in India and Tibet are also present at the very heart of the Christian tradition . . .Yet churches of all denominations as well as biblical scholars of the West are oblivious to the mystical wisdom that

Markides, 5.

Markides, 3.

Markides, 8.

Markides, 5.

still flourishes in some of these monastic communities". Markides constantly questions the choice of Westerners in turning to Hinduism and Buddhism, without being fully aware of what Mount Athos has to offer to the Western world. Markides' comparison of Eastern Christianity to other Eastern religions is significant because other North American thinkers utilized the same approach to establish their own philosophies that highlighted the spiritual differences between the East and the West. Two such scholars of Eastern spirituality that influenced the conversion of Americans and Brazilians to Orthodox Christianity are Alan W. Watts and René Guénon. Whereas Watts was a critic of the West, Guénon was a critic of modernity. The constant of the West, Guénon was a critic of modernity.

Alan Watts rebelled against what he called "conventional" Western spiritual society. He was a spiritual leader of Eastern mysticism in a countercultural generation in the 1960s where he advocated for reforms in the Catholic and Protestant Church. After being drawn to Eastern Religions and participating in the Buddhist Society of Great Britain, he attended the Seabury-Western Theological Seminary where he pursued the Protestant Episcopal priesthood with the intention of bringing the message of Eastern spirituality into Western culture. However, he soon renounced the priesthood and taught at the Academy of Asian Studies in San Francisco, where he wrote *Psychotherapy East and West* (1961) and *Myth and Ritual in Christianity* (1953, 1968), in which he specifically expressed his aversion to Orthodox Christianity "with what he perceived as its lawgiving God set apart from humanity".

Watts' rejection of Orthodox Christianity opposes René Guénon's rather favorable perspective of Eastern Christianity. Rather than criticize the West in itself, Guénon rejected the

Markides, 6.

Hieromonk Damascene, *Father Seraphim Rose: His Life and Works.* 2<sup>nd</sup> ed., St. Herman of Alaska Brotherhood, 2005, 64.

Ellwood, Robert S. "Watts, Alan Wilson." *American National Biography Online*, American Council of Learned Societies, Feb. 2000 <a href="https://www.anb.org.proxy.library.vanderbilt.edu/articles/08/08-01880.html">www.anb.org.proxy.library.vanderbilt.edu/articles/08/08-01880.html</a>. Accessed 28 Jan. 28.

Hieromonk Damascene, Father Seraphim Rose: His Life and Works, 66.

modernity of Western society that was based on a rejection of the traditional spirit of ancient cultures and it was only, "through a return to the traditional, orthodox forms of the major world religions, either Eastern or Western that a man can even begin to come once more into contact with the truth". Unlike Watts, Guénon was not critical of Christianity because he saw it as the authentic spiritual tradition of the West. Rather, Guénon did not accept Protestantism or other "modernistic deviations" from traditional Christianity, of which he gave Eastern Orthodoxy his highest praise. In the words of Guenon, "Protestantism is illogical". As stated in the previous chapter, the theology of René Guenón is significant to this thesis because his translated works compelled the group of Brazilian astrologists to convert to Orthodox Christianity. Furthermore, Guénon was the chief influence that led to the conversion of Father Seraphim Rose, one of the most celebrated American Orthodox theologians.

The late Orthodox Hieromonk Father Seraphim Rose encountered Orthodox Christianity by chance in the United States when he entered a Russian Orthodox Church in San Francisco during liturgy and felt his calling, which ultimately began his spiritual search. After being tonsured as a monk, he founded a publishing house in Platina, California to translate Orthodox texts from other languages to spread the word of Orthodoxy. Renowned for his theological publications and works about Orthodox Christianity in the West, he is largely considered the first American *podvizhnik*, or Rightous Struggler, which is a specific type of righteousness in the Orthodox Christian tradition. Although there have been other *podvizhniki* in North America, such as St. John Maximovitch of Shanghai and San Francisco, Father Seraphim is the only American-born *podvizhnik* and is thus a model of a nascent but fervent American Orthodoxy. Despite his lack of general recognition in the West, his works have made a tremendous

Hieromonk Damascene, Father Seraphim Rose: His Life and Works, 65.

Hieromonk Damascene, Father Seraphim Rose: His Life and Works, 66.

Hieromonk Damascene, Father Seraphim Rose: His Life and Works, xi.

impression in Eastern Orthodox lands in the former Soviet Bloc and have been translated into Greek, Serbian, Romanian, Bulgarian, Georgian, Latvian, Polish, Italian, French, and Malayalam (south Indian). In Russia, Father Seraphim Rose is a cherished figure and his works are ardently read and considered "pivotal to the resurrection of Holy Russia". Father Seraphim Rose is also a pivotal figure in the rise of Orthodox Christianity in Brazil, which is discussed in the subsequent chapter.

Apart from Western scholars and theologians such as Markides, Watts, Guénon, and Father Seraphim Rose, the challenges of bridging the cosmological divide between eastern and western tradition are also articulated by various English translators of Russian Orthodox texts.

### The Translation of Russian Orthodox Texts in the West

The greatest challenge that translators of Eastern Orthodox texts face is distinguishing the differences between the traditions of Orthodox Christianity from that of Western Christianity in a manner that aids the Western reader be responsive to the foreign and mystical theology of Eastern Christianity. An example of such a challenge is evident in the translation and reception of Russian Orthodox publications in the West.

The Way of a Pilgrim and The Pilgrim Continues his Way (presented together as one volume), a classic of Russian Orthodox spirituality, is an autobiographical account written by an anonymous Russian pilgrim that travels to different holy places in Russia and Siberia; it is an "allegory" of the struggle of pursuing Orthodox Spirituality. The identity of the writer and time period of events are unknown, although it is assumed that it was written before 1860. Also unknown is how a copy of the manuscript came into the hands of a monk on Mount Athos, which was eventually founded by the Abbot of St. Michael's Monastery at Kazan, who copied

-

Hieromonk Damascene, Father Seraphim Rose: His Life and Works, xiii.

the manuscript and printed it in 1884. The translator R. M. French encountered obstacles in obtaining a copy of the book outside of Russia, which he eventually obtained from contacts in Denmark and Bulgaria.

In the opening note to this volume, the Anglican philosopher Walterus Truron rightly assumes the biases of the Western audience when he asks the reader to "try a little journey with this Pilgrim", implying that the reader may be hesitant or resistant to begin such a philosophical journey to the East. He then directly confronts this; "You will probably not always agree with his naïve talk; but your differences from his outlook will afford much fruit for reflection . . . and in any case you will appreciate his entire simplicity and sincerity. In this statement, Truron unintentionally admits his own partiality upon defining this spiritual journey as "simple" and the pilgrim as "naïve", when in reality the spiritual struggle of the pilgrim is far from lacking complexity.

To further emphasize the story's "simplicity", Truron is careful to say that if the story ever seems "monotonous", or lacking of interest to the Western audience, the Western reader should not worry; the reader can be entertained by the vivid pictures of Russian life that are illustrated in his journey because they are reminiscent of Leo Tolstoy's work. <sup>85</sup> He further elaborates this comparison; "Tolstoi wrote as the artist, who . . . could depict what he saw and heard, but did not really *know*. Our pilgrim *knows* every bit of what he says: and you will listen, even to the strangest things that he says, with the respect which is due to real, vital knowledge". <sup>86</sup> Comparing the Pilgrim's prose to Tolstoy gives his narration the cultural leverage that is needed by the Western audience to deem the travelogue credible. Despite this praise, Truron reverts to

o

The Way of a Pilgrim and the Pilgrim Continues His Way. 1930, translated by R. M. French, The Seabury Press, 1952, v.

The Way of a Pilgrim and the Pilgrim Continues His Way, v.

The Way of a Pilgrim and the Pilgrim Continues His Way, v.

The Way of a Pilgrim and the Pilgrim Continues His Way, v.

his Western judgment when he assumes that the reader will be disappointed when, at the end of the travelogue, the Pilgrim "suddenly disappears into the obscurity from which he emerged", further perpetuating the reputation that Orthodox Christianity is both geographically and spiritually "obscure" to the Western reader and will remain in that state.<sup>87</sup>

Addressing the biases of a Western audience are also the principal concerns that are expressed by the translator R. M. French in the introduction. Unlike Truron, he does not perpetuate Western bias. French initiates the introduction through explaining the dual meaning of way in the book's title: the story is both about a Pilgrim's experiences as he made his way throughout various pilgrimage destinations in Russia and Siberia, and through his travelogue, he also teaches to others a way of praying, that is, the principal philosophical and spiritual foundation of Orthodox Christianity. 88 Upon describing the way, French states that "of the hesychast method of prayer, much might be said, and not everyone will be in sympathy with it", assuming that the Western reader can neither understand nor agree with hesychasm, the mystical tradition of prayer in the Eastern Orthodox Church, given that "strongly contrasted as the method may be with an ordinary religious Englishman's habits of devotion", the reader will therefore be averted. 89 However, the translator admits that "everyone will appreciate the sincerity of his [the Pilgrim's] conviction and few will doubt the reality of his experience". 90 He then refers the readers to additional readings to understand the *hesychast* method of prayer. To further highlight the conceptual disparity between the East and the West, French refers the reader to the notes at the end of the travelogue of words he claims best not be translated into English; the majority of

The Way of a Pilgrim and the Pilgrim Continues His Way, v.

The Way of a Pilgrim and the Pilgrim Continues His Way, viii.

The Way of a Pilgrim and the Pilgrim Continues His Way, vii.

The Way of a Pilgrim and the Pilgrim Continues His Way, vii.

this vocabulary consists of commonplace words in Orthodox theology, such as the words *icon* and *starets*.

Father Arseny 1893-1973: Priest, Prisoner, Spiritual Father is a book about Russian Orthodox spirituality that has also become widely known to western audiences. It is a compilation of testimonials, memoirs, and oral accounts that narrate the life of Father Arseny, a priest and spiritual father that faced persecution during the period of communist rule under Joseph Stalin. Although there are many memoirs that describe the lives of Russian prisoners during Stalin, this is the largest contribution that describes the religious persecution that persisted in this era.

In Father *Arseny 1893-1973: Priest, Prisoner, Spiritual Father*, the translator's note recognizes the challenges that the reader may confront in understanding or believing the period of Stalin's dictatorship in the Soviet Union. This lack of knowledge is once again due to the historical, cultural, and political rift between the East and the West that was manifested by the Iron Curtain that, according to Bouteneff, "effectively prevented the West from learning about the extent of the repression of thought and the extinction of human life". She then describes the history of religious persecution in Russia and how this persecution was unprecedented in the history of the Christian Church. Given that religious literature was also banned, the book first appeared during communist rule in samizdat form, or as "self-published" carbon copy manuscript that was distributed without the permission of the government or the Writer's Union. Even during this period of persecution, the book circulated widely. Similar to *The Way of a Pilgrim*, the translator's introductions to these works demonstrate her awareness of

-

Father Arseny 1893-1973: Priest, Prisoner, Spiritual Father. 1993, translated by Vera Bouteneff, St Vladimir's Seminary Press, 1998, vi.

Father Arseny 1893-1973: Priest, Prisoner, Spiritual Father, viii.

addressing cultural and knowledge gaps about Eastern spirituality that are persistent in the Western audience.

A third classic testimony about Russian Orthodox Spirituality that has gained a readership in the West is *Everyday Saints and Other Stories: Archimandrite Tikhon (Shevkunov)*, translated by Julian Henry Lowenfeld.<sup>93</sup> Similar to the works about Father Arseny, the book is a compilation of stories and testimonials about five youths from non-religious backgrounds that decide to join a monastery in communist Russia in 1984.

The translator's introduction continues to address the misconceptions that are likely present in a Western audience in understanding the monks of the Pskov Caves-Monastery in Russia. In addressing these biases, Lowenfeld ends his introduction by stating that he is "profoundly honored to have helped to acquaint Western readers with them and their world and their way of life". He calls this way of life the "mysterious Russian soul" which is integral to Russian spirituality and makes Russian art, music, and literature unique. To first understand the Russian soul, he demarcates the historical misconceptions that the Western reader may face. For example, Lowenfeld indicates, "All too often, we associate Russia with doom and gloom or with cynicism or corruption or cruelty. Perhaps – at least, so I hope – this book will help to correct our vision". In addition, he addresses knowledge gaps about the Cold War, where he claims "it may surprise some of us who grew up during the Cold War, but Russia, feared for so many years as the land of 'godless Communists,' is in fact one of the most intensely spiritual and devout nations in the world", which is a reality that unfolds in the book's testimonies.

It was voted the most popular book in Russia in 2012 and more than a million copies sold within its first year of publication.

Shevkunov, Archimandrite Tikhon. *Everyday Saints and Other Stories*. Translated by Julian Henry Lowenfeld, Pokrov Publications, 2012, xi.

Shevkunov, Archimandrite Tikhon, xi.

Shevkunov, Archimandrite Tikhon, ix.

To establish credibility, Lowenfeld reflects upon his own experiences translating a text about a foreign and noncanonical spiritual tradition. In helping the West become acquainted with the "mysterious Russian soul", he sought to make the book accessible to believers and skeptics alike through highlighting his own difficulty in understanding the text. He speaks directly to the western reader:

"Skeptical readers – I at first was one of you – need not agree with the author or believe in everything he says to enjoy his remarkable way of saying it. Whether or not you are touched by the author's faith, I am certain that you will be transported by his stories of a spiritual treasure chest that has suddenly been reopened, a world that has been long hidden, a world that we can enter without belonging to it."97

He continuously emphasizes the ignorance of the "us", or the West, upon pleading "whether you are religious or skeptical, whether you care about Russia or not, you can still let this book transport you to a world and a way of looking at things of which most of us have no inkling". <sup>98</sup> In approaching this foreign spiritual world, the author persists that the "worldview has a way of growing on you: you may pass through states of incredulity and bemusement" but despite encountering "curious words and terms peculiar to the world it portrays" and being confronted "with words for things you have never heard of before", instead of relying on notes as does French in *The Way of the Pilgrim*, Lowenfeld asks the reader to surrender to the text's mysteries.99

Overall, the aforementioned challenges that western theologians, professors, thinkers, and translators have confronted in portraying Orthodox Christianity to a western audience illustrate that Orthodox Christian texts are a marginalized canon of literature in the western hemisphere. Every translation is a retelling and rewriting of a text to its original audience. However, the translation of a marginalized text is neither a retelling nor a recreation to its target audience,

Shevkunov, Archimandrite Tikhon, x.

Shevkunov, Archimandrite Tikhon, xi.

Shevkunov, Archimandrite Tikhon, x.

given that, "the translator is in the paradoxical position of 'telling a new story' to the receptor audience . . . and the more remote the source culture and literature, the more radically new the story will be for the receiving audience". This explains the intricacies of attempting portray the cosmology of Orthodox Christianity to the West. The following comparative analysis between the Orthodox texts published in Brazil and the United States will further examine these very same cultural confrontations.

\_

Tymoczko, Maria. "The Metonymics of Translating Marginalized Texts." *Comparative Literature*, vol. 47, no. 1, 1995, 13.

### Chapter 3

# A Comparative Analysis: Orthodox Christian Publishing Companies in the United States and Brazil

In this chapter I aim to demonstrate how recent publication efforts in the United States and Brazil demonstrate a revitalized theology of mission for a church that in recent history has not been missionary due to its nationalistic nature in eastern cultures. This section of the thesis will analyze how Orthodox Christian converts in the United States and Brazil engage in presenting a marginalized literature to a Western audience. I will first discuss how the lineage of literary production of Orthodox Christian texts in the United States and Brazil differs according to the relative position of English and Portuguese in the World Language System. I will next provide an overview of Ancient Faith Publishing and the conversion narrative and explain how the United States arguably serves as a pretext for the development of Orthodox Christian publishing companies in Brazil. Finally, I will synthesize the nascent but significant work of Editora Aletheia and Editora Theotokos in Brazil, identifying the works that have been published and attempting to explain the differences between the two publishing companies.

### English and Portuguese in the World Language System

An inherent difference exists in the types of publications released by Orthodox Christian publication companies in the United States and Brazil; this is due to the uneven flow of book translations between various language groups and the relative position of English and Portuguese

Worshippers in the west often feel geographically and culturally "isolated" from this eastern tradition and therefore seek to overcome the remoteness of Orthodox Christianity through readership. However, this must be treated with caution, given that the understanding of a religious tradition cannot be gained solely through readership. Knowledge of the Orthodox Christian faith can only be fully acquired through participation in the spiritual life of Orthodox Christianity.

in the world language system. The World Language system is hierarchical structure with central, semi-peripheral, and peripheral languages, with central languages having a larger share in the total amount of translated books worldwide. The international translation system is unevenly distributed due to the dominance of English.

Although Portuguese has a large number of speakers, it occupies a peripheral position in the translation system. In the international translation system, the more central a language is, the more books are translated from the language, "centrality, in other words, implies variety", whereas the same does not hold true for peripheral languages. The central status of English signifies that more translations not only pass from English to a peripheral language, but that communication between peripheral groups often passes through English due to its centrality. Therefore, the translators of the Orthodox Christian publishing companies in Brazil translate from English into Portuguese, whereas the original source languages are Eastern European languages.

The relative position of the languages in the world language system determines the types of texts that are published by the Orthodox publication companies in Brazil and the United States. Due to the peripheral status of Portuguese, Orthodox publishing companies in Brazil formed out of the necessity of translating texts due to the scarcity of Orthodox Christian resources in Portuguese. Given the plethora of didactic Orthodox Christian resources with English translations, the centrality of English has arguably allowed for more original scholarship and variety in which American converts educate wider audiences about Orthodox Christianity,

Heilbron, Johan. "Towards a Sociology of Translation: Book Translations as a Cultural World-System." European Journal of Social Theory, vol. 2, no. 4, 1999, 433.

Heilbron, 438.

Heilbron, 435.

The only translation of Editora Aletheia is *Teologia Monástica*, which Father Jário translated from English into Portuguese. I assume that the translators of Editora Theotokos also have working knowledge of Russian, but their affinity towards Father Seraphim Rose's texts arguably demonstrates that they primarily translate from English to Portuguese.

since utilitarian texts are already available. Father Seraphim Rose is the prime example, given that his original works such as The Soul After Death, Orthodoxy and the Religion of the Future, and Nihilism: The Root of the Revolution of the Modern Age have gained international recognition. The following section explores how Ancient Faith Publishing in the United States attempts to de-marginalize the canon of Orthodox Christian texts through publishing conversion narratives.

# **Ancient Faith Publishing**

In New England, the conversion narrative was an integral facet of Puritan society from 1630 until the Great Awakening. Although often thought of as testimonies of religious experience, in Puritan society the composition of conversion narratives, or, as Edmund S. Morgan describes it, the "morphology of conversion", also involved the states of, "knowledge, conviction, faith, combat, and true, imperfect assurance". 106 "Combat" phrases the inherent struggle to understand the faith, and "imperfect assurance" is the state of perpetual transition. Although Eastern Orthodox Christianity is distinct from the Puritan tradition, the elements of "combat" and "imperfect assurance" are present in Orthodox Christian texts written by Western writers as they attempt to bridge the spiritual and intellectual gap between the East and the West. Ancient Faith Publishing is one such publishing company that publishes religious testimonies as experienced by Western converts.

Ancient Faith Publishing is one of the largest resources for Orthodox Christian books in the English-speaking world. It originated as Conciliar Press, which was established in 1977 as the publishing arm of the New Covenant Apostolic Order (NCAO) and was founded to publish AGAIN Magazine, which was the trademark publication of the Evangelical Orthodox Christian

106 Morgan, Edmund S. Visible Saints: The History of a Puritan Idea. Cornell University Press, 1963, 72.

Movement. At the time, Metropolitan Philip Saliba commissioned Conciliar Press "to carry the story of the ancient faith to the modern world" and although its initial mission in the 1980s was to publish volumes for seekers and new converts of the Orthodox faith, its vision has expanded to publish books targeted towards cradle Orthodox Christians to deepen their faith. In 2008, Conciliar Press merged with Ancient Faith Radio to form Conciliar Media ministries, but the name changed once again in July 2013 to Ancient Faith Publishing as part of the overarching Ancient Faith Ministries. Today, Ancient Faith Ministries is part of the Antiochian Orthodox Christian Archdiocese of North America<sup>107</sup>.

Within Ancient Faith Publishing, the genre "Journeys to Orthodoxy" consists of religious testimonials of Westerners recounting their transition from their own spiritual origins to the realm of Eastern Orthodoxy. These conversion narratives involve a certain element of "travel" between two spiritual traditions that have different geographical and cultural origins. The accounts are comparative in nature, comparing Orthodox ecclesiology to the previous religious formation of the authors, which predominantly consist of Protestant denominations. Rather than being academic, theological texts, they are narratives that describe difference and the foreignness of cultural associations within the Church. They are part history, part bible study, and part autobiography. Through advocating that "culture" is not the substance of the church, the writers attempt to reverse the marginalized status of Orthodox Christian literature through demonstrating how Orthodox Christianity can, and is, becoming part of American cultural life.

Although the breadth of the genre "Journeys to Orthodoxy" is impressive and continues to expand, for the purposes of this thesis, Peter E. Gillquist's Becoming Orthodox: A Journey to the Ancient Christian Faith (1989) will be the sole work discussed due to its wide readership and

<sup>&</sup>quot;Ancient Faith Publishing." Ancient Faith Ministries, Inc., 2017, www.ancientfaith.com/publishing. Accessed 25 July 2017.

account of the 1980s Orthodox Evangelical Movement in the United States. Given that Ancient Faith Publishing's religious testimonials are rarely cited in academic works that explore the evolving identity of the Orthodox Church in the United States, I seek to fill this gap in literature through illustrating how conversion narratives are valuable resources in the examination of American Orthodoxy. Furthermore, within this comparative analysis I seek to further demarcate the differences between the works of Ancient Faith Publishing, Editora Aletheia, and Editora Theotokos while reflecting upon the future trajectory of Brazilian publishing companies.

Becoming Orthodox: A Journey to the Ancient Christian Faith

Becoming Orthodox: A Journey to the Ancient Christian Faith is an autobiographical account of a Protestant minister Peter E. Gillquist who, together with other former evangelical Protestants, were part of the group Campus Crusade for Christ in the seventies as they began to look for what they called the "New Testament Church". During this decade, they dedicated themselves to the study of Church history and New Testament faith. Upon discovering the Eastern Orthodox Church, Gillquist narrates the challenges they encountered and the questions they sought answers to. After his conversion, Gillquist then recounts his journey to becoming an Orthodox priest.

Gillquist's pilgrimage unfolds into three parts. Part I is a history lesson of Christendom in Gillquist's words and about the Campus Crusade's historical findings when they set out to find the "New Testament Church". Part II, called "Orthodoxy and the Bible" describes specific ecclesiological obstacles that evangelical Christians consistently confronted on this path to Orthodoxy. Part III describes the decade (1977-1987) in which this group learned about the Orthodox Church and found it, "embedded securely in a cultural setting [they] knew almost

nothing about", thus describing the struggle with the ethnic identity of Orthodox Churches in the United States. 108

Of Gillquist's three-part journey, Parts II and III discuss obstacles inherent to this thesis: the foreignness of Orthodox Christianity in the Western Hemisphere due to differences in cultural identity and ecclesiology, which are the same issues that the aforementioned western scholars and thinkers such as Father Seraphim Rose, René Guénon, and Kyriacos Markides expressed. Through describing how this evangelical group overcame these theological and cultural roadblocks, however, Gillquist fulfills the evangelical message of Ancient Faith Ministries; that Orthodox Christianity, which is an Eastern tradition, is capable of establishing itself as a cultural institution in the West.

The comparative nature of Gillquist's work is embodied in his discussion of ecclesiological differences between Protestantism and Orthodox Christianity during the second stage of his "pilgrimage", as he humorously phrases, "Let me offer a brief word of encouragement . . . admittedly, the style of Orthodoxy looks complicated to the modern Protestant eye, and understandably so". <sup>109</sup> Upon entering a modern-day Orthodox Church for the first time, Gillquist described Orthodox liturgy as "ancient and otherworldly", thus demonstrating that the most difficult challenge that a convert must overcome is change the manner of worship in a modern-day Orthodox Church.

Gillquist's emphasis on differences in ecclesiology is due to the perspective of "tradition" within evangelical Protestantism, where he states, "there has developed within today's

Gillquist, Peter E. *Becoming Orthodox: A Journey to the Ancient Christian Faith.* 1989. Conciliar Press, 1992, 57.

Gilllquist, Fr. Peter. Interviewed by AGAIN Magazine. "From Becoming Orthodox to Being Orthodox: AGAIN Interviews Fr. Peter Gillquist." *Antiochian Orthodox Christian Archdiocese of North America*, antiochian.org/content/becoming-orthodox-being-orthodox-again-interviews-fr-peter-gillquist. Accessed 1 May 2017.

evangelicalism a tradition of being opposed to tradition," in other words, a western modernity and rationalism that was the very object of Guénon's critique. The principal issues therefore revolve around the mysticism of Orthodox Christianity, and Gillquist gives various personal accounts of fellow evangelicals who encountered these roadblocks. For example, he recounts, "A man who was very close to me personally stayed with us on the journey until we came to the place in our study where we saw that the Church viewed the bread and wine of Communion as the body and blood of Christ in a mystery", thus further delineating the ecclesiological rift between the East and the West. Apart from general comments of the mystical nature of Orthodox Christianity, he describes how it was a challenge for his group to accept that the early Church was sacramental, the polity of the church was hierarchical, and that the worship was liturgical.

Upon providing an overview of ecclesiological differences, Gillquist transitions to outlining the challenges the group of evangelical Protestants confronted converting to a faith traditionally limited by ethnic boundaries and immigrant origins, given that in their search they were soon led to "onion-domed Slavic Churches, and then to the Greek". He humorously comments on this struggle upon saying "When you follow God you also take up with His people", with "his people' being the ethnic diaspora that initially appeared to be the insurmountable obstacle to their acceptance into Orthodoxy. This especially became problematic when they attempted to be admitted into one of the thirteen autonomous, universally recognized Orthodox Archdiocese.

Gillquist, Peter E. Becoming Orthodox: A Journey to the Ancient Christian Faith, 61.

Gillquist, Fr. Peter. Interviewed by AGAIN Magazine.

Gillquist, Peter E. Becoming Orthodox: A Journey to the Ancient Christian Faith, 45.

Gillquist, Peter E. Becoming Orthodox: A Journey to the Ancient Christian Faith, 139.

Gillquist, Peter E. Becoming Orthodox: A Journey to the Ancient Christian Faith, 147.

The group first sought acceptance in the Greek Orthodox Archdiocese. Upon embarking on a pilgrimage to Constantinople to ask the Ecumenical Patriarch of Constantinople to enter the church, they were met rejection. In Gillquist's words, it was thought that this group of Evangelical Protestants would "somehow 'water down' Orthodoxy in America to a pop version of the ancient faith and not be supportive of retaining a commitment to Hellenistic culture in the parishes. One report suggested we were out to 'take over the Church'". 115

However, upon being accepted into the Antiochian Orthodox Archdiocese, Gillquist affirmed that the evangelical Protestants had embraced "those incredible Middle Eastern people who have made a home for us in the Orthodox faith". Despite this reception and mutual respect, cynicism was inevitable and targeted towards identity and cultural preservation on both sides, as Gillquist recalls, "you could occasionally hear our side worry aloud, "I sure hope they don't try to make Arabs out of us!" but the other culture was heard asking more than once concerning us, "What if they try to make the Church Protestant". Regardless, Gillquist assures at the end of his narrative that the wedding of the two cultures was successful and fruitful.

Despite Gillquist's wish to foster mutual respect, his goals for the development of Orthodox Christianity in the United States seek to address issues of unity and address how it is complicated by ethnic identity and language. In speaking about the future of American Orthodoxy, his goals are primarily linguistic where he aspires to see an Orthodox Church worshipping in the language of America rather than the language of the mother countries. He questions the logic of maintaining a diasporic church upon saying; "I question why it is that the people in a given North American Orthodox parish can read the paper, trade securities, and order

-

Gillquist, Peter E. Becoming Orthodox: A Journey to the Ancient Christian Faith, 172.

Gillquist, Peter E. Becoming Orthodox: A Journey to the Ancient Christian Faith, 182, 183.

Gillquist, Peter E. Becoming Orthodox: A Journey to the Ancient Christian Faith, 183.

a Big Mac all in English, and then insist the services the following Sunday be in Greek, Slavonic, or Arabic – especially when their kids can't grasp a word of it" thus addressing Krindatch's observations of the Americanization of 3<sup>rd</sup> and 4<sup>th</sup> generation immigrants.<sup>118</sup>

Orthodox publications are essential in mission theology and articulating a new American Orthodox identity in all its complexity. The proliferation of Orthodox Christian texts written by converts has been credited for resurrecting evangelism in the life of the Orthodox Church. In describing the Crusade's contributions to Orthodox Christianity, Gillquist claims that their publications have impacted Christendom and have gained readership both in North America and in countries overseas. The Antiochian Evangelical Mission started AGAIN magazine and Conciliar Press with the intention of having a "publishing arm that would help teach our people what we were learning about the ancient Christian faith" and "to be able to put into print the things we were learning to better instruct our people in the midst of this journey". 

119 Becoming Orthodox, for this reason is monumental and deserves recognition in this comparative analysis is because it has been the principal force in carving a new genre within the publication of Orthodox Christian texts and creating a new population of Orthodox Christians in the United States.

In concluding *Becoming Orthodox*, Gillquist describes other ways in which the printing press has been an influential force in the establishment of Orthodox Christianity as a cultural institution in the West. For example, Conciliar Press was an instrumental factor in allowing entry of this evangelical group into the Antiochian Orthodox Archdiocese. When the group of Evangelical Protestants formally requested acceptance, the Antiochian Orthodox Archdiocese ordered copies of the *Again* magazine and other works of literature produced by the Evangelical

.

Gilllquist, Fr. Peter. Interviewed by AGAIN Magazine.

Gillquist, Peter E. Becoming Orthodox: A Journey to the Ancient Christian Faith, 184.

Orthodox Christians, which were reviewed thoroughly to determine their membership. 120 In addition, this group started the Academy of Orthodox Theology I Santa Barbara (which was later named Saint Athanasius) for the purpose of uniting scholars to research the Orthodox faith, translation work, and publish research, amongst other responsibilities. <sup>121</sup> Gillquist also emphasizes the importance of the publication of the first Orthodox Study Bible, which he insists has been a significant resource to both Orthodox and non-Orthodox.

Although the Orthodox Christian publishing companies in the United States and Brazil share the same evangelizing mission, the breadth of Ancient Faith Publishing is much greater than Editora Aletheia and Editora Theotokos. The following section will explore this difference in breadth and how the Brazilian publishing companies fulfill their vision of mission. Since there are no existing works that explore the contributions of Editora Aletheia and Editora Theotokos in the formation of a Brazilian Orthodox community, this section of the thesis will seek to address this gap in literature.

### The Publication of Orthodox Christian Texts in Brazil

Editora Aletheia and Editora Theotokos are publishing companies that translate, edit, and revise Orthodox Christian literature, with their largest consumer base in Recife, Rio de Janeiro, São Paulo, and Curitiba. They formed out of the necessity of having Orthodox Christian materials in Portuguese. Before the foundation of these publishing companies, those who previously sought access to Eastern Orthodox Christian texts in Brazil had to possess knowledge of languages such as English, French, and Russian, given the great volume of Orthodox theological texts available in these languages. Books were either purchased from abroad or

Gillquist, Peter E. Becoming Orthodox: A Journey to the Ancient Christian Faith, 48. 121

Gillquist, Peter E. Becoming Orthodox: A Journey to the Ancient Christian Faith, 129.

gathered from doubtful translations on the Internet. Despite this common mission of translation, however, these publication companies differ in how they approach the translatability of the Orthodox Christian Church.

Editora Aletheia is a publisher of Orthodox Christian literature in Recife, Pernambuco. Since "aletheia" in Greek means "truth", or "unconcealdness", collaborators Padre Alexis Álfaro and Padre Jário Carlos established the publishing company with the purpose of "unconcealing" the Orthodox faith in Brazil, due to the great deficiency of Orthodox literature available in Portuguese. Most of the published materials are of original authorship and are the product Father Alexis and Father Jário's scholarship in Orthodox theology, with the exception of a few select works translated by Father Jário.

In partnership with Editora Aletheia and the blessing of Bishop Dom Mitrophan, the former Serbian Orthodox Bishop of Eastern America, the Centro de Estudos Ortodoxos São Máximo o Confessor of the Serbian Orthodox Diocese of Buenos Aires and Central and South America was founded with the intent of encouraging the study of Orthodox theology, the development of talks and seminars, and the publishing of translations and Orthodox texts, with the goal of spreading "a tradição oriental" to the Orthodox faithful and also the general public. São Máximo o Confessor was appropriately chosen as the namesake since he was martyred for his scholarship; his persecutors cut off his hand to punish him for his prolific writings.

Editora Theotokos is the other Orthodox Christian publishing company and its headquarters are located in Campinas, São Paulo. It functions in partnership with St. Peter and Paul Serbian Orthodox Church in Campinas, São Paulo and was founded in 2014 with the blessing of Metropolitan Amfilohije Radovic, the current Bishop of Montenegro and the Episcopal Administrator of the Serbian Orthodox Diocese of Buenos Aires and South and

Central America. The publishing company is small and contains a select staff of researchers, translators, and theological editors. In contrast to Editora Aletheia's lineage of publications, the majority of Editora Theotokos's literature are translations of Orthodox Christian texts.

Similar to Editora Aletheia, Editora Theotokos was created out of the necessity of having access to printed material about Orthodox Christianity. Due to language barriers, Editora Theotokos was created with the intention of publishing translations in Portuguese with theological revisions. When confronted with doubts about the mission of the publisher due to the small audience that it serves in Brazil, the translator Priscila Salomão claimed; "é justamente por isso, que é um público restrito e a gente quer expandir esse público. Trata-se de uma missão espiritual muito mais do que material. A gente que resgatar estes valores cristãos da origem do cristianismo e semear a ortodoxia aqui no Brasil". 122 It is thus from this mission that the name of the publishing company originated; Theotokos, which means "God-bearer" or "Birth-giver to God" in Greek, pays homage to the Mother of God "que tanto nos ilumina e nos inspira nessa missão cristã ortodoxa", which can arguably be configured as "Word-giver" since these texts have revitalized Orthodox Christianity in Brazil. 123

Despite their common mission of translation, Editora Aletheia and Editora Theotokos differ in how they approach the translatability of the Orthodox Church, that is, how they frame Orthodox Christianity in a western context and whether it can belong as a cultural institution in the western hemisphere. This is evident not only in the polarizing language that they use, but also in the selection of works that they translate.

Salomão, Priscila. "Editora Theotokos: Nossa História." *YouTube*, uploaded by Editora Theotokos, 21 Jan. 2017, <a href="https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=4ZYyn">www.youtube.com/watch?v=4ZYyn</a> ENiLY

Salomão, Priscila. "Editora Theotokos: Nossa História."

Both Editora Theotokos and Editora Aletheia frame Orthodox Christianity in a polarizing language that distinguishes the traditions of the East and the West, comparing the revitalization of Christianity in the East to the lack of a spiritual tradition in the West:

"Enquanto no Oriente ... o cristianismo está florescendo, florescendo de uma maneira muito mais arraigada nas suas origens, é isso que queremos para terras brasileiras . . . o Ocidente vive uma espécie de desilusão do cristianismo . . . enquanto o leste europeu revive o cristianismo, então queremos beber nesta fonte para que possamos fortalecer a nossa espiritualidade cristã aqui no Ocidente". 124

Editora Theotokos is not the sole publisher of Orthodox texts in Brazil; regardless, it seeks to distinguish itself from Editora Aletheia as the "única editora no Brasil que publica exclusivamente livros sobre o cristianismo ortodoxo", and their motive for distinguishing themselves as such is how they frame Orthodox Christianity in their published work:

"Uma outra editora já publicou aqui no Brasil algumas obras relacionadas à ortodoxia em língua portuguesa, porem nunca deixavam claro que se tratava de uma origem ortodoxa. As referências à ortodoxia continuada nestas obras eram sempre alteradas para que fossem escamoteadas, você vê nelas sempre uma referência a uma igreja no oriente, a um braço da igreja católica romana no oriente, mas você não vê dito de uma maneira explicita que é uma obra relacionada ao cristianismo ortodoxo. Por isso nos decidimos que em nossa editora, vamos deixar bem claro que se trata de uma obra relacionada ao cristianismo ortodoxo com intuito de difundir-lo aqui no Brasil". 125

Editora Theotokos deliberately distinguishes itself as a publishing company of Orthodox Christian texts. Although Editora Aletheia shares the same mission, in its literature, the Orthodox Church is framed as "a tradição oriental" or as "a igreja oriental", thus isolating this Christian tradition from the West. By distinguishing themselves as a publishing company dedicated to publishing literature about Orthodox Christianity, rather than the "Eastern Church", the editors of Editora Theotokos distinguish Orthodox Christianity as a translatable tradition that is capable of establishing itself in the West.

<sup>124</sup> Salomão, Priscila. "Editora Theotokos: Nossa História." 125 Salomão, Priscila. "Editora Theotokos: Nossa História."

In addition to differences in how Orthodox Christianity is framed, the specific works about Orthodox Christian theology that are published further reveal how these publishing companies differently conceptualize the Orthodox Church. Whereas Editora Aletheia predominantly publishes literature written by or about eastern theologians, thus reiterating Orthodox Christianity as "a tradição oriental", Editora Theotokos cites Father Seraphim Rose as influential in the establishment of this Orthodox Christian publishing company, since he established his own publishing house in Platina, California to translate and write Orthodox Christian literature. For this reason, Editora Theotokos claims that Father Seraphim Rose "sem dúvida foi uma fonte de inspiração para a gente. A gente está seguindo os passos dele e desejamos realmente que este trabalho tenham seus frutos positivos aqui nas terras brasileiras" and has thus dedicated themselves to translating his works. <sup>126</sup> Editora Theotokos's reverence of a North American Orthodox theologian further distinguishes their vision of Orthodox Christianity as a tradition that is capable of establishing itself in a western context. The following section will examine select published works of Editora Aletheia in order to further delineate the two publishing companies' different visions of mission.

## The Literary Production of Editora Aletheia

The following select works translated and written by Father Alexis Alfaro and Father Jário are didactic in nature and their argumentation mirrors that of scholars such as René Guénon and Kyriacos Markides in emphasizing the differences between the spiritual traditions of the East and West. In synthesis, Editora Aletheia's literature communicates the same philosophy as the aforementioned scholars: the dangers of western, modern rationalism and the need to belong to an authentic, contemplative, spiritual tradition that can only be found in the "igreja oriental".

<sup>126</sup> Salomão, Priscila. "Editora Theotokos: Nossa História."

The breadth of Editora Aletheia's publications is extensive, but for the purpose of this thesis, I will briefly focus on a few select works, not necessarily for their didactic content, but rather, how they present Orthodox Christian theology in a way that is disparaging to everything that is western, modern, and distant from the mysticism of Orthodox Christianity. 127

This dichotomous message is present in the three volumes *Cristo, o Amigo do Homem* (2011), *Os Amigos de Deus* (2012), and *O Homem Interior* (2013)<sup>128</sup>. These works, which are written by Father Alexis, are stories about divine friendship with Christ in the Bible and how these Christ-centered relationships offer an alternative to modern-day living. Particularly in *O Homem Interior*, Father Jário's introduction characterizes modernity in a disparaging fashion and proposes engaging in a relationship with Christ in the Orthodox Church as a solution to the crisis of the modern generation. Upon outlining the fallbacks of modernity in the 21<sup>st</sup> century, Father Jário concludes that the spiritual flaws of man, "poderão ser remediadas tanto por uma inusitada resiliência advinda do Oriente Ortodoxo como por uma corajosa avaliação das construções e desconstruções do chamado ocidente cristão ao longo dos dois últimos séculos", thus framing Orthodox Christianity as an isolated cultural and spiritual tradition of the East. <sup>129</sup>

Father Alexis further contrasts Orthodox Christianity to current cultural movements in the West through comparing and contrasting what he calls "a vida interior" and "a vida exterior". According to Father Alexis, "a vida interior is "a herança espiritual do oriente cristão ortodoxo" which differs from "a sociedade contemporânea centrada na vida exterior". Similar to Guénon's critique of Protestantism's "illogical" nature, Father Alexis places blame on other Christian denominations for making "exterior demands" that are detrimental to the internal,

All can be found on their website: http://editoraaletheia.minestore.com.br/produtos.

These works were originally published by Editora Libertas but are available for purchase by Editora Aletheia.

Peña-Alfaro, Arcipreste Alexis. *O Homem Interior*. Vol. 3, Libertas Editora, 2013, 11.

Peña-Alfaro, Arcipreste Alexis. *O Homem Interior*, 12.

contemplative tradition of Orthodox Christianity. He particularly target Evangelical Protestantism, which is accused of presenting "sequiosas em atender as novas demandas de novos grupos sociais" and Catholicism for following in the same footsteps to compete with Evangelism in this "disputa de mercados e espaços sociais" which ultimately leads to the secularization and mundanization of the Church, where religion "fica cada vez mais na defensiva e empobrecida, separada das suas fontes históricas e de toda a tradição e experiência acumulada pelo cristianismo em mais de 2000 anos de história". <sup>131</sup>

Similar to the aforementioned works, the intent of *Vida e Obra de São João Cristóstomo* is to emphasize the importance and the relevance of the Church Fathers within the context of the contemporary theological crisis. *Vida e Obra de São João Crisóstomo* was published as a commemorative edition 1600 years after the repose of the important Early Church Father Saint John Chrysostom. Father Alexis and Father Jário explain how Church Fathers such as Saint John Chrysostom "perderam valor a partir da modernidade, especialmente no ocidente, onde a cultura e o culto ao humanismo contaminaram a eclesiologia e a teologia, a ponto de a atual crise da teologia ocidental, tanto católica quanto protestante"; therefore, venerating St. John Chrysostom within this publication serves as an affront to the corruptive force of modernity. <sup>132</sup> To commemorate the life of Saint John, the collaborators thus describe and summarize the contribution of his written works to the history of Christianity. Apart from presenting a list of his publications, they present a few select works such as *A Interpretação do Pai Nosso, Homilia XIX ao Comentário sobre o Evangelho Segundo S. Mateus*, and *Sobre o sacerdócio*, all of which were translated directly from Greek to Portuguese by Father Jário Carlos and Diego Raphael.

\_

Peña-Alfaro, Arcipreste Alexis. *O Homem Interior*, 18-19.

Vida e Obra de São João Crisóstomo. Organizers and Editors: Archpriest Alexis Peña-Alfaro, Deão Jairo Carlos S. Junior, and Prof. Dr. Diego Raphael Carreiro, Centro de Estudos Ortodoxos S. Máximo o Confessor, 2007, 10.

Finally, the series *Pais da Igreja*, the only translation published by Editora Aletheia, seeks to fulfill the dearth of material about Patristic studies in Portuguese. The series consists of four volumes, all of which reveal "a verdadeira mística cristã" which the authors insist is only present in the "oriente cristã". In particular, *Teologia Monástica*, which is the second volume of Pais da Igreja, presents Orthodox Christianity as a tradition originating from and preserved in the East, juxtaposed to Brazil, which is "tantas vezes, distante de uma verdadeira espiritualidade". 133 It consists of a compilation of texts from the Desert Fathers about spiritual life, as well as texts from Saint Anthony the Great, Saint Macarios and Saint Diádoco, Saint John of Climacus, Saint Simeon the new theologian, and Saint Gregory of Palamas, all of whom write about the tradition of hesychasm as taught and preserved by the generations of monks living on Mount Athos. In being defined as an eastern tradition, hesychasm is presented within the context of the challenges of being an Orthodox Christian in Brazil, for "sua oposição a todo compromisso com as exigências 'deste mundo'" and for encouraging a monastic lifestyle and practice as taught by the monks on Mounth Athos. 134

Overall, the aforementioned works of Editora Aletheia seek to distinguish the Christian traditions of the East from the West. The authors Father Alexis Alfaro and Father Jário Carlos engage in the same philosophy of dichotomy as René Guénon and Kyriacos Markides, without clearly proposing how the Orthodox Church can evangelize and establish itself within the western hemisphere; rather, they incessantly reference "a oriente cristã" and "a tradição oriental" as the answer to the West's decaying spiritual identity. In contrast, Editora Theotokos assumes a different approach in framing Orthodox Christianity for a Western audience.

134 Meyendorff, 6.

<sup>133</sup> Meyendorff, John. Teologia Monástica. Translated by Pe. Jairo Carlos, Editora Aletheia, 2016, 2.

## The Literary Production of Editora Theotokos

Similar to Editora Aletheia, the following works translated by the editors Priscila Salomão and Gabriel Tossato, with theological revisions made by Father Pedro Siqueira, are didactic in nature and are explicit in their evangelizing mission. Since its inception in 2014, Editora Theotokos has published three works: *Dogma Trinitário*, *Prólogo de Ohrid*, and *Revelação de Deus ao coração humano*. Most of the published works are translations, with its first publication, *Dogma Trinitário*, being the only original work of this publishing company.

A native of Beirut, Lebanon, the book's author Michel Fares Breidi came to Brazil as an adolescent, then returned to Lebanon to study theology and was ordained a deacon in the Monastery of Archangel Saint Michael in Baskenta, Mount Lebanon. He subsequently returned to Brazil and obtained a degree in theology at the Faculdade Pontificia Nossa Senhora da Assunção. His work *Dogma Trinitário* describes the theology behind the production, artistry, and the use of iconography in the Orthodox Church. The work specifically focuses on the icon of the Hospitality of Abraham and details the life of Andrei Rublev, a Russian monk and one of the most renowned iconographers in the Orthodox Church. *Dogma Trinitário* embodies a didactic function, given that icons are one of the most iconic expressions of Orthodox Christianity when compared to other religions. <sup>135</sup>

Dogma Trinitário most significantly emphasizes the uniqueness of its publication within Brazil due to the scarcity of instructional sources about Orthodox Christianity in Portuguese, which results in iconography's relative anonymity as a sacred art. The peripheral status of Portuguese in the world language system thus compelled Breidi to write the book, although the

70

Tossato, Gabriel. "Uma interpretação iconográfica do dogma trinitário." *YouTube*, uploaded by Editora Theotokos, 18 Jan. 2017, www.youtube.com/watch?v=4ZYyn\_ENiLY.

Breidi, Michel Fares. *Uma Interpretação Iconográfica do Dogma Trinitário: A Ceia de Abraão*. Editora Theotokos, 2015, 12.

marginalization of Orthodox Christian literature presented itself as a challenge; "Daí, a dificuldade de encontrar recursos bibliográficos na nossa lingual dificultou ainda mais o trabalho, mas cada obstáculo me incentiva ainda mais a prosseguir, pois crescia o interesse de aprender e divulgar mais sobre os assuntos ícone e dogma". Breidi thus states that the book is, "oportuno, belo e muito feliz. Oportuno, porque o mercado editorial brasileiro carece de boms livros sobre iconografía" due to the peripheral status of Portuguese, which has made the "precisão dos termos teológicos em língua portuguesa" a necessity. Brazil more specifically lacks didactic books about the use of iconography in prayer life, signifying that resources that specifically address the spiritual needs of Orthodox Christian audiences in Brazil are lacking. 139

Thus *Dogma Trinitàrio*'s utility is emphasized due to the peripheral status of Portuguese, as Freidi affirms; "tenho a certeza que a uns e a outros o livro será de grande utilidade e certamente servirá para o fortalecimento, em terras do Brasil, da verdadeira Igreja de Cristo", thus clearly delineating the didactic and missionary role of Editora Theotokos, where he guarantees that the reader will find "informações úteis e necessárias que podem levar a um conhecimento espiritual". Freidi assures that the book's utility also lies in its accessibility and simplicity, such that it is "um livro simples; qualquer pessoa consegue ler sem nenhum problema de linguagem", indicating that it was written for the common reader and recognizes that many of the readers may converts beginning their spiritual journey, as does *Prólogo de Ohrid*, which is also didactic in nature. <sup>141</sup>

Prólogo de Ohrid is the second novel published by Editora Theotokos. Its preface provides one of the few published histories of Holy Trinity Orthodox monastery in Camaragibe,

Breidi, Michel Fares, 12.

Breidi, Michel Fares, 7, 9.

Breidi, Michel Fares, 7.

Breidi, Michel Fares, 8-9.

Tossato, Gabriel. "Uma interpretação iconográfica do dogma trinitário."

Pernambuco since it's founding in 2010. The preface, written by the late Bishop of Ohrid Nikolaj Velimirovic, explains that a "prólogo" or "prologue" is an introduction to the knowledge of the Christian faith and is a daily reading designated for lay people and clergy alike; *Prólogo de Ohrid* is therefore an instructional source and provides insight on the role and the utility of books in the study of Orthodox Christianity. Given that "O Prólogo é lido há muito tempo pelos ortodoxos, os quais receberam seus ensinamentos ao longo de séculos", it is also a document of historical importance in the inheritance of the Orthodox faith across generations. <sup>142</sup>

In his introduction, Bishop Velimirovic gives a personal account of his relationship with the Prologue and its utility in approximating to the Orthodox faith. In his autobiographical account he describes; "Em minha infância, o Calendário foi o primeiro livro que eu vi e tive em mãos" and was guarded and preserved behind a communal icon in the neighborhood with reverence. During his childhood he recognized the power that the book had in guiding him to the mysteries of the Orthodox faith: "Era considerado um livro de nomes misterioso e – para mim, naquele tempo – mágico . . . Eu nem sequer suspeitava da grandiosidade que aqueles nomes ocultavam" and it was due the magical quality of the book that Bishop Velimirovic, "o reverenciava sem conhecimento e o amava sem compreensão". The Bishop's reverence of the Prologue overall describes the essential role of literature in learning about the Orthodox faith.

In addition to its didactic nature, Bishop Velimirovic emphasizes the prologue's role in evangelism. The original Prólogo Eslavônico was published in Old Church Slavonic, "o qual se tornou inaccessível ao povo eslavo de nosso tempo lamentavelmente por causa de seu idioma,"

72

142

Velimirovic, Saint Nikolai. *Prólogo de Ohrid: Vida de Santos, Reflexões, Contemplações e Homilias para cada dia do ano (setembro e outubro)*. Edited by Priscila Casagrande Salomão and Gabriel Zanardelli Vince Esgalha, revisão teológica by Pe. Pedro Siqueira of Holy Trinity Serbian Orthodox Monastery in Aldeia,

Pernambuco, collaboration of Saints Peter and Paul Serbian Orthodox Parish in Campinas, São Paulo, Editora Theotokos, 2016, 4.

Velimirovic, Saint Nikolai, 4.

Velimirovic, Saint Nikolai, 4.

therefore, his recompilation and translation of the Prologue into Serbian was accomplished with the purpose of making it accessible to a wider audience. The purpose of the recompilation and retranslation of the book into Serbian accomplishes the same mission that Editora Theotokos is succeeding with its mission: making books accessible to the common audience.

Both *Dogma Trinitário* and *Prólogo de Ohrid* are similar to the publications produced by Editora Aletheia because they are didactic in nature and are explicit in their evangelizing mission. Regardless, the recent proliferation of Father Seraphim Rose's translated texts, such as *Revelação de Deus ao coração humano*, make Editora Theotokos's mission distinct due to its depiction of Orthodox Christianity as a religious and cultural institution also inherent to the West, as opposed to what Editora Aletheia regards as "a igreja oriental". *Revelação de Deus ao coração humano* is the first book authored by Father Seraphim Rose that has been translated into Portuguese. The book was published in collaboration with Father Pedro Siqueira at Holy Trinity Monastery in Camaragibe, Pernambuco. Given that Father Pedro Siqueira lived at St. Herman of Alaska Monastery in Platina, California, which was founded by Father Seraphim Rose, he gained authorization from the publishing press of this monastery to translate the book into Portuguese, thus delineating an emerging inter-American Orthodox Christian fellowship.

The editor Priscila Salomão chose to translate the works of Father Seraphim Rose because of his influential history in Orthodox Christianity in the West; he dedicated himself to writing for a Western audience that desired to learn about the Orthodox faith, "pessoas que talvez tivessem a mesma busca que ele" when he studied eastern religions as a young adult. <sup>146</sup>
Furthermore, Priscila claims "A gente escolheu esse autor porque ele sabe dialogar justamente com uma demanda contemporânea, com um homem contemporâneo" and spoke about issues

-

Velimirovic, Saint Nikolai, 5.

Salomão, Priscila and Gabriel Tossato. "Revelação de Deus ao coração humano (Pe. Serafim Rose)." *YouTube*, uploaded by Editora Theotokos, 15 Jan. 2017, <u>www.youtube.com/watch?v=nkF4R1nBRrw</u>

endemic to the modern man, such as existentialism, materialism, atheism, and nihilism, thus referencing the same "crisis of modernity" as the editors of Editora Aletheia and the succession of western philosophers of the East, such as Guénon and Markides.<sup>147</sup>

Revelação de Deus ao coração humano, which is one of dozens of titles composed by Father Seraphim Rose, is a transcript of the lecture and question-and-answer session between Father Seraphim Rose and university students at the University of California, Santa Cruz in 1981<sup>148</sup>. The lecture was presented in a Comparative Religions course dedicated to youth who were looking for new religious experiences, with a particular orientation to the religious traditions of the East. He gave this lecture because as a youth, he underwent the same spiritual search in the crisis of modernity, as Salomão points out, "O Padre Seraphim Rose soube muito bem falar sobre isso porque ele viveu essa crise também". After his death, the lecture was published into a book and is divided into two parts: the first half of the lecture describes the Orthodox faith and its relationship with other religions, whereas the subsequent half is dedicated to guiding the reader in finding and choosing a spiritual path.

Revelação de Deus ao coração humano is significant within the context of Brazil and the audience of Editora Theotokos because it is a lecture about conversion and the spiritual search for Orthodox Christianity. According to Father Seraphim Rose, one's approximation to God and "revelação" of the Orthodox faith is only possible through the conversion of the heart of man, of which the experience of suffering is indispensible in leading one to the knowledge of God. In particular, Father Seraphim Rose references the experience of the Soviets to exemplify how even

\_

Salomão, Priscila and Gabriel Tossato. "Revelação de Deus ao coração humano (Pe. Serafim Rose)."

The original in English was published in 2007.

Salomão, Priscila and Gabriel Tossato. "Revelação de Deus ao coração humano (Pe. Serafim Rose)."

in the midst of suffering atheists acquired the Orthodox faith. It is this example that summarizes his lesson: "como o sofrimento conduz o sujeito ao coração amoroso". 150

In synthesis, Editora Theotokos does not portray Orthodox Christianity as solely an eastern church ("uma igreja oriental"), but rather as a tradition that also exists and continues to thrive in the West, as demonstrated by Editora Theotokos's affinity to Father Seraphim Rose. The anticipated publications of Editora Theotokos will continue this literary mission as inspired by Father Seraphim Rose's printing press. Such anticipated works include *Nihilism: The Root of the Revolution of the Modern Age* by Father Seraphim Rose, and the presale of the book *Uma Maravilhosa Revelação*, a compilation of texts about the Russian Orthodox Saint St. Seraphim of Sarov written by Saint John of Kronstadt, Saint John Maximovitch, and Father Seraphim Rose.

-

Salomão, Priscila and Gabriel Tossato. "Revelação de Deus ao coração humano (Pe. Serafim Rose)."

## Conclusion

Upon examining the various works of literature published by American and Brazilian Orthodox converts to Orthodoxy, several general conclusions can be reached, although more extensive research is necessary as conversion narratives and translations continue to be published. It is indisputable that Orthodox Christians in the United States and Brazil are increasingly no longer descendents of an Old World heritage; the majority of those who are descendants no longer view heritage and faith as being inseparable. The changing demography of Orthodox Christianity in the United States and Brazil reflects larger demographic shifts in the Western Hemisphere; the Orthodox Church is also growing amongst natives in other Latin American countries, such as Argentina, Ecuador, and Guatemala. For example, of the 52 clergy that serve in the Greek Orthodox Metropolis of Mexico, Central America, Colombia, Venezuela, and the Caribbean Islands, only three clergy members are of Greek descent. <sup>151</sup>

This thesis examines how converts attempt to articulate a tradition they were not born into. Knowledge is intricately connected to the culture from which it originates because it is transmitted through education, and education is a cultural institution. The need to express ideological and theological differences between Eastern and Western Christianity and the desire to obtain knowledge has led to the development of publishing companies founded by converts. The proliferation of texts about Orthodox Christianity originates from the principles upon which the Orthodox Christianity was evangelized amongst the Slavs in the 9<sup>th</sup> century, Alaska in the 18<sup>th</sup> century, and subsequently in the United States and Brazil in the 1980s. That is,

\_

Kuruvilla, Carol. "The Greek Orthodox Church in Latin America is not very Greek." *Huffpost*, 25 Apr. 2015, <a href="www.huffingtonpost.com/2015/04/15/greek-orthodox-church-latin-america\_n\_7065630.html">www.huffingtonpost.com/2015/04/15/greek-orthodox-church-latin-america\_n\_7065630.html</a>. Accessed 15 May 2017.

evangelization has principally been an indigenous movement built upon the translation and writing skills of its converts.

Orthodox Christian texts published by converts in the United States and Brazil share a common vision and desire; to express that an Eastern tradition is capable of establishing itself as a cultural institution in the West. Furthermore, these converts seek to reverse the marginalized status of this genre of literature and debunk the reputation of Orthodox Christianity as the bestkept secret" in the Americas. 152 Regardless of this common vision, there are significant differences in how this function is fulfilled due to the global language system. The peripheral status of Portuguese has designated translation as the principal task of Orthodox Christian publishers in Brazil; the scarcity of Orthodox Christian publications in Portuguese as expressed through the frustrations of the editors of Editora Aletheia and Editora Theotokos, allocate translation as a necessary and urgent task. But even within these publishing companies, there are differences in how the Orthodox Church is portrayed to a western audience.

On the other hand, the centrality of the English language has resulted in the relevant availability and accessibility of texts about Orthodox Christian theology in the United States. This stronger foundation in Orthodox literature has arguably provided more leeway for alternate forms of expression, such as the conversion narrative. Narratives such as Becoming Orthodox: A Journey to the Ancient Christian Faith demonstrate that writing is a form of conversion. It is through writing that the ecclesiological and cultural differences between Eastern and Western Christianity are contemplated as Gillquist embarks on a long lifetime road of conversion.

This thesis hopes to further develop this field to understand how the publication and translation of theological texts is instrumental to the existence of Orthodox Christianity in Brazil and the United States. The dynamic role of Orthodox Christian literature is inciting a new spirit

<sup>152</sup> Gillquist, Peter E. Becoming Orthodox: A Journey to the Ancient Christian Faith, 58.

of evangelism in a church that has otherwise not been missionary in two lands of the diaspora: the United States and Brazil. Therefore, the literary efforts of evangelical Orthodox Christian converts have and continue to provide a new front to create a united Orthodox mission and inter-American Orthodox Christian identity.



**Figure 21**: The thirty-year anniversary of the establishment of Orthodox Christianity for Brazilians in the Northeast of Brazil. This commemoration took place in August 2016 and brought together the Serbian and Polish Orthodox Churches of Brazil's Northeast.

## References

- "Ancient Faith Publishing." *Ancient Faith Ministries Inc.*, 2017, www.ancientfaith.com/publishing. Accessed 25 July 2017.
- Anderson, Benedict. Imagined Communities. 2nd ed., Verso, 1991.
- Breidi, Michel Fares. *Uma Interpretação Iconográfica do Dogma Trinitário: A Ceia de Abraão*. Editora Theotokos, 2015.
- Bright Faith: Father Artemy Vladimirov Talks with Western Orthodox Christians. Edited by Mother Nectaria McLees, Christ the Savior Brotherhood Publishing, 2010.
- Carlos, Pe. Jairo. Patrística Grega. Editora Aletheia, 2015.
- "Eastern Europe's Patriotic Faith." *The Economist*, 14 May 2017, <a href="www.economist.com/blogs/erasmus/2017/05/religion-after-communism">www.economist.com/blogs/erasmus/2017/05/religion-after-communism</a>. Accessed 24 July 2017.
- Ellwood, Robert S. "Watts, Alan Wilson." *American National Biography Online*, American Council of Learned Societies, Feb. 2000 <a href="https://www.anb.org.proxy.library.vanderbilt.edu/articles/08/08-01880.html">www.anb.org.proxy.library.vanderbilt.edu/articles/08/08-01880.html</a>. Accessed 28 Jan. 2017.
- Erickson, John H. Orthodox Christians in America. Oxford University Press, 1999.
- "Espírito Santo vai receber primeiro mosteiro da Igreja Católica Ortodoxa Russa." *Folha Vitória*, 16 Dec. 2016, <a href="www.folhavitoria.com.br/geral/noticia/2016/12/espirito-santo-vai-receber-primeiro-mosteiro-da-igreja-catolica-ortodoxa-russa.html">www.folhavitoria.com.br/geral/noticia/2016/12/espirito-santo-vai-receber-primeiro-mosteiro-da-igreja-catolica-ortodoxa-russa.html</a>. Accessed 5 Aug. 2017.
- Father Arseny 1893-1973: Priest, Prisoner, Spiritual Father. 1993, translated by Vera Bouteneff, St Vladimir's Seminary Press, 1998.
- Gillquist, Peter E. *Becoming Orthodox: A Journey to the Ancient Christian Faith.* 1989. Conciliar Press, 1992.
- Gilllquist, Fr. Peter. Interviewed by AGAIN Magazine. "From Becoming Orthodox to Being Orthodox: AGAIN Interviews Fr. Peter Gillquist." *Antiochian Orthodox Christian Archdiocese of North America*, antiochian.org/content/becoming-orthodox-being-orthodox-again-interviews-fr-peter-gillquist. Accessed 1 May 2017.
- Heilbron, Johan. "Towards a Sociology of Translation: Book Translations as a Cultural World-System." *European Journal of Social Theory*, vol. 2, no. 4, 1999, pp. 429-444.
- Herbel, D. Oliver. Turning to Tradition: Converts and the Making of an American

- Orthodox Church. Oxford University Press, 2014.
- Hieromonk Damascene. Christ the Eternal Tao. 6<sup>th</sup> ed., Valaam Books, 2012.
- Hieromonk Damascene, *Father Seraphim Rose: His Life and Works*. 2<sup>nd</sup> ed., St. Herman of Alaska Brotherhood, 2005.
- Highland Tech High Students, *Father Michael Oleksa*. Father Michael Oleka's personal website, www.fatheroleksa.org/. Accessed 26 July 2017.
- "Igreja Ortodoxa Polonesa no Nordeste." *Igreja Ortodoxa Polonesa no Nordeste*, COMMUNITY CHURCH, 2023, <u>igrejapolonesa.wixsite.com/nordeste/igrejas</u>. Accessed 6 Aug. 2017.
- Krindatch, Alexei D. "Orthodox (Eastern Christian) Churches in the United States at the Beginning of a New Millennium: Questions of Nature, Identity, and Mission." *Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion*, vol. 41, no. 3, 2002, pp. 533–563. www.jstor.org/stable/1387462
- Kuruvilla, Carol. "The Greek Orthodox Church in Latin America is not very Greek." *Huffpost*, 25 Apr. 2015, <u>www.huffingtonpost.com/2015/04/15/greek-orthodox-church-latin-america n 7065630.html</u>. Accessed 15 May 2017.
- "Líder ortodoxo pide la 'unidad de las religiones' en Brasil." *NoticiaCristiana.com*, 22 Feb. 2016, <a href="www.noticiacristiana.com/iglesia/ecumenismo/2016/02/lider-ortodoxo-pide-la-unidad-de-las-religiones-en-brasil.html">www.noticiacristiana.com/iglesia/ecumenismo/2016/02/lider-ortodoxo-pide-la-unidad-de-las-religiones-en-brasil.html</a>. Accessed 26 July 2017.
- "Localização de Igrejas." *Primeiros Passos na Ortodoxia: Um Blog da Igreja Ortodoxa Autocéfala da Polônia*, 2017. primeirospassosnaortodoxia.blogspot.com/p/localizacao-de-igrejas.html. Accessed 6 Aug. 2017.
- Loiacano, Mauricio. "A Igreja Ortodoxa no Brasil." Revista USP, n. 67, 2005, pp. 116-131.
- Lowe, Elizabeth and Earl E. Fitz. *Translation and the Rise of Inter-American Literature*. University Press of Florida, 2009.
- Markides, Kyriacos C., *The Mountain of Silence*. Doubleday (Random House), 2001.
- Meyendorff, John. *Teologia Monástica*. Translated by Pe. Jairo Carlos, Editora Aletheia, 2016.
- Morgan, Edmund S. *Visible Saints: The History of a Puritan Idea*. Cornell University Press, 1963.
- "O Papa e o Patriarca Ortodoxo reconciliam as duas grandes vertentes do Cristianismo." *Sputnik Brasil*, 15 Feb. 2016, <u>br.sputniknews.com/noticias/201602153586317-papa-patriarca-ortodoxo-reconciliacao-vertentes-cristianismo/</u>. Accessed 26 July 2017.

- Oleksa, Michael. *Orthodox Alaska: A Theology of Mission*. St. Vladimir's Seminary Press, 1992.
- Peña-Alfaro, Arcipreste Alexis. *Amigos de Deus: personagens bíblicos que conheceram a amizade divina*. Vol. 2, Libertas Editora, 2012.
- Peña-Alfaro, Arcipreste Alexis. O Homem Interior. Vol. 3, Libertas Editora, 2013.
- Pitts Jr., Montie Brian. "Forging Ethnic Identity Through Faith: Religion and the Syrian-Lebanese Community in São Paulo." MA thesis, Vanderbilt University, August 2006.
- "Reencontro com a Igreja à Brasileira." *Igreja Ortodoxa do Brasil*, 29 Jan. 2017. <a href="http://ortodoxia-brasil.blogspot.com/2008/01/reencontro-com-igreja-brasileira.html">http://ortodoxia-brasil.blogspot.com/2008/01/reencontro-com-igreja-brasileira.html</a>. Accessed 27 July 2017.
- "René Guénon's Life and Work." *World Wisdom*, 2008, <a href="www.worldwisdom.com/public/authors/Rene-Guenon.aspx#\_edn6">www.worldwisdom.com/public/authors/Rene-Guenon.aspx#\_edn6</a>. Accessed 26 July 2017.
- Salomão, Priscila. "Editora Theotokos: Nossa História." *YouTube*, uploaded by Editora Theotokos, 21 Jan. 2017, www.youtube.com/watch?v=4ZYyn ENiLY.
- Salomão, Priscila and Gabriel Tossato. "Revelação de Deus ao coração humano (Pe. Serafim Rose)." *YouTube*, uploaded by Editora Theotokos, 15 Jan. 2017, www.youtube.com/watch?v=nkF4R1nBRrw.
- Sapiro, Gisele. "Globalization and cultural diversity in the book market: The case of literary translations in the US and in France." *Poetics*, vol. 38, no. 4, 2010, pp. 419-439.
- Shevkunov, Archimandrite Tikhon. *Everyday Saints and Other Stories*. Translated by Julian Henry Lowenfeld, Pokrov Publications, 2012.
- Siqueira, Father Pedro. "A Contribution to the History of the Orthodox Church in South America." MA thesis, St Tikhon's Orthodox Theological Seminary, 2009.
- Slagle, Amy. The Eastern Church in the Spiritual Marketplace: American Conversions to Orthodox Christianity. Northern Illinois University Press, 2011.
- "The Christians in the World." *The Holy See*. The Holy See Press Office 2017, <a href="www.vatican.va/spirit/documents/spirit\_20010522\_diogneto\_en.html">www.vatican.va/spirit/documents/spirit\_20010522\_diogneto\_en.html</a>. Accessed 20 May 2017.
- The Way of a Pilgrim and the Pilgrim Continues His Way. 1930, translated by R. M. French, The Seabury Press, 1952.

- "The 1970s." *History.com*, A+E Networks, 2010, <u>www.history.com/topics/1970s</u>. Accessed 26 July 2017.
- Torres, Fernanda. "Eucaristia." *Veja Rio*, 25 Feb. 2017, vejario.abril.com.br/blog/fernanda-torres/eucaristia/. Accessed 28 July 2017.
- Tossato, Gabriel. "Iconografía: a sacralidade dos ícones no cristianismo ortodoxo." *YouTube*, uploaded by Editora Theotokos, 16 Jan. 2017, www.youtube.com/watch?v=VplDwE9kBFI.
- Tossato, Gabriel. "Uma interpretação iconográfica do dogma trinitário." *YouTube*, uploaded by Editora Theotokos, 18 Jan. 2017, www.youtube.com/watch?v=4ZYyn ENiLY.
- Tymoczko, Maria. "The Metonymics of Translating Marginalized Texts." *Comparative Literature*, vol. 47, no. 1, 1995, pp. 11–24. www.jstor.org/stable/1771360.
- Velimirovic, Saint Nikolai. *Prólogo de Ohrid: Vida de Santos, Reflexões, Contemplações e Homilias para cada dia do ano (setembro e outubro)*. Edited by Priscila Casagrande Salomão and Gabriel Zanardelli Vince Esgalha, revisão teológica by Pe. Pedro Siqueira of Holy Trinity Serbian Orthodox Monastery in Aldeia, Pernambuco, collaboration of Saints Peter and Paul Serbian Orthodox Parish in Campinas, São Paulo, Editora Theotokos, 2016.
- Vida e Obra de São João Crisóstomo. Organizers and Editors: Archpriest Alexis Peña-Alfaro, Deão Jairo Carlos S. Junior, and Prof. Dr. Diego Raphael Carreiro, Centro de Estudos Ortodoxos S. Máximo o Confessor, 2007.
- Ware, Timothy. The Orthodox Church. 3<sup>rd</sup> ed., Penguine Books, 2015.