### Being Dark-Skinned and Poor in Brazil: The Intersectionality of Skin Color, Income, and Gender

By

Yvonne Marie White

Thesis

Submitted to the Faculty of the

Graduate School of Vanderbilt University

in partial fulfillment of the requirements

for the degree of

MASTER OF ARTS

in

Latin American Studies

May, 2014

Nashville, Tennessee

Approved:

Mariano Sana, Ph.D. Marshall C. Eakin, Ph.D. To my family who has always been there for me

#### **ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

This work would not have been possible without the financial support of the Fund for the Improvement of Postsecondary Education (FIPSE) and the Center for Latin American Studies. I would especially like to thank Dr. Marshall C. Eakin and Dr. Jane Landers for selecting me as a FIPSE grant recipient. I am indebted to Dr. Mariano Sana for taking the time to mold me into a researcher. I must also acknowledge my Brazilian counterparts, Dr. Eliane Veras and Dr. Lady Selma Albernaz at the Universidade Federal de Pernambuco for helping me understand Brazilian society more in-depth.

#### INTRODUCTION

On June 12, 2000, Sandro do Nascimento, a 21 year-old, became the poster child for race relations in Brazil. On that day, Sandro hijacked Bus 174 in Rio de Janeiro. The whole spectacle was broadcast live for millions of Brazilians to view. During several hours of confrontation with the police, Sandro threatened to kill the passengers on the bus, if his demands were not met. Eventually, he did decide to release most of the hostages and surrender. His surrender to the police became complicated because he descended from the bus with a female hostage. After Sandro's descent, a series of events occurred between himself and the police that resulted in his death and the death of the hostage that he was holding. Sandro eventually died in the back of a police vehicle where the police smothered him to death. (Padilha and Lacerda, 2002)

Because of the media attention surrounding the death of Sandro, a film entitled *Onibus* 174 was created to document the life of Sandro and what would be the last day of his life. Born poor to a single mother, Sandro never had the chance to meet his father. His father died while he was in his mother's womb. As a young child, several men stabbed his mother to death in front of him. After his mother's death, he became a "menino da rua" (street kid). As a street kid, he experienced very difficult situations, which involved hunger, drugs (sniffing glue/cocaine), homelessness, and confrontations with the police. His second encounter with death occurred on July 23, 1993. His group of street kid friends mocked the police near the Candelaria church in Rio during the day. At night, the police returned and killed eight children. Sandro survived, but he was sent to a juvenile detention center where he endured physical abuse. He escaped and found himself once again in the streets until his life ended in 2000.

Sandro became a poster child for race relations in Brazil because a lot questions were raised after his death. *Did Brazilian society create Sandro? Was Sandro responsible for his own* 

actions? Was his life doomed the moment he left his mother's womb because he was black and poor? The debate around Sandro was more than just a debate about a street kid who hijacked a bus while under the influence of drugs. It turned into a national debate about race in Brazil. Some Brazilians say that race does not exist and it is just a matter of rich and poor. Others believe that race is a very important factor in Brazil. How can the case of Sandro be examined without involving skin color, race, and class?

Thirteen years later, another case of a poor, darker skinned male killed by the police reached the front pages. Amarildo de Souza was an assistant bricklayer who lived in Rocinha, a Rio de Janeiro favela. On July 14, 2013, the Unidade de Policia Pacificadora (Pacifying Police Unit) questioned him on suspicion of selling drugs. Two days later, Amarildo had not returned. His family and members of the Rocinha community began to protest his disappearance and demanded answers. The campaign, "Cadê o Amarildo?" ("Where is Amarildo?"), began to receive national and international attention. Eventually, authorities launched an investigation into his death. Disclosed details reveal that he was tortured for 40 minutes before he was killed. His body still has not been found, which is why his death is presumed. The case of Amarildo leads one to wonder how his color, race, and financial background led to the events that resulted in his death. If he had been richer and lighter, would he have been questioned and tortured by the police?

Early in the current year (2014), young, poor/working class youth began participating in "rolezinhos" to protest against racial discrimination. These youths protested in high-end shopping malls to show wealthier and lighter skinned Brazilians that they too had a right to frequent any place that they chose. The reactions to the rolezinhos were divisive. From the view of some Brazilians, these youths were causing trouble and their presence in high-end shopping

malls could result in vandalism or theft. On the other hand, others saw the rolezinhos as a step in the right direction for equal access for all in exclusive spaces in Brazil. As a result of the fear felt by Brazilians with wealth, several malls in the biggest cities of Rio and São Paulo closed their doors to prevent rolezinhos. It is unclear whether or not the planned, but not executed, rolezinhos would have resulted in destruction. However, the question lingers, *how can there be a protest against racial discrimination if "race" does not exist in Brazil?* 

All of these three cases represent the complexity of race, color, gender and socioeconomic status in Brazil. There are countless other Sandros and Amarildos whose stories were never reported. There are millions of poor and dark-skinned youth who encounter some form of racial/color discrimination daily. Therefore, it appears that color, if not race, is an important feature of Brazilian society. Frequently, poor and dark-skinned Brazilians are reminded of their perceived inferiority through perpetual stereotypes. Why is it that being a poor, dark-skinned, male is associated with crime, violence, drugs and robbery? What comes to mind when people see poor, dark-skinned Brazilians?

To answer these questions, I conducted research to explore the connection between stereotypes, race/color and socioeconomic status. My main research question is *what* stereotypes of Brazilians who may or may not identify as black exist? Related questions include: How do you identify someone who is black? How do you identify someone who is poor? What are the consequences of being black and poor?

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Gender was not originally included in my thesis question because I wanted to focus on stereotypes of all Brazilians considered black. However, as I was collecting research, I realized that gendered stereotypes exist of Brazilians with darker skin color.

#### LITERATURE REVIEW

Stereotypes are powerful and often lead to prejudice and discrimination. In Brazil, stereotypes define the way in which people of darker skin--who may or may not identify as *negro/a* (black) (Telles and Lim, 1998)--are treated. In some of the stereotypes of Brazilians, they perceived as black are lazy, dirty, stinky, uneducated (de Brito et. al, 2005) (dos Santos, 2002), criminal, violent, sexually promiscuous, and uncivilized (Bailey, 2002). In relation to beauty standards, negro/as are characterized as having cabelo ruim (terrible hair).

These stereotypes have relatively remained the same since the formation of Brazil as a nation. In *Casa Grande e Senzala* (1986), written by one of the most famous scholars from Brazil, Gilberto Freyre, stereotypes of Africans brought from different regions as slaves were introduced to a wider academic audience. Sudanese Africans were considered to be more intellectual than Africans from the Congo or the Eastern Horn because of their Mohammedan influence. They were able to read and write in Arabic and were much more advanced than most Portuguese at this time considering that many Portuguese were illiterate.

Generally, afro-descendants were blamed for the rampant promiscuity in colonial Brazilian society. During this era, there were high rates of syphilis. The French and Portuguese were blamed for bringing syphilis to Brazil. Despite the damaging effects of syphilis, scars resulting from the sexual disease were celebrated because it was a "rite of passage" into manhood. Young men who engaged in sexual acts at a young age were held in high regard. The persons that they were engaging in sex with were not all Portuguese women. In fact, many of them were slaves and/or women of African-descent. Certain sectors of Brazilian society blamed the widespread promiscuity that resulted in sexual diseases on women of African descent. Supposedly, African people or Afro-Brazilians were "naturally" inclined to be very sexually

active. Out of this miscegenation emerged the mulatta (mixed woman), the beautiful mixture of black and white.

Negative attitudes toward Afro-Brazilians persisted following the colonial period.

Thomas Holloway (1993) has shown that the stereotype of black Brazilians as criminals existed as early as the 19<sup>th</sup> century. For example, he details how the police would profile certain Brazilians based on their involvement in capoeira. Capoeira, a fusion of martial arts and dance was ruled illegal in 1890. It provided slaves a way to defend themselves. The dancing element of capoeira emerged as a means for slaves to disguise their covert actions to the slave master.

Holloway details the mechanisms slave hunters used to capture fugitive slaves including reports of slaves colluding with their captors to extort their bosses financially. In an illuminating quote, one can see the burgeoning of unethical police practices that continue in modern day Brazilian society: "...the Guarda Real soldiers soon became corrupt, abused their authority, and not only engaged in practices inconsistent with their office, but adopted a general system of violence and extortion." (53)

Lilia Schwarcz (1999) demonstrated that the idea of Afro-descendent Brazilians as inferior and therefore imperfectable was quite prevalent among the elite. In the first half of the 20<sup>th</sup> century, Brazil's large population of Afro-descendants held back Brazil from its true potential as a powerful nation in comparison to the more advanced European powers, according to those in power at the time. Planned immigration from Western Europe promised to bring about a whitening of Brazil and an elimination of the "backward" African elements. Though there were some who did not feel that Afro-descendants caused the demise of Brazilian society, they were not able to influence the prevailing thoughts of this era.

Paulina Alberto (2011) concluded that images of Afro-Brazilians were overwhelmingly negative. In fact, she states:

In the early twentieth century, several strands of racist thought combined to portray people of color as intellectually degraded and morally annihilated...ideologies caricatured men of color in particular as weak, sickly, effeminate, dishonorable, and unable to provide for their families. (26)

Black men in Sao Paulo formed organizations to "clean up" the negative images of Afrodescendants. Black owned newspapers and societies formed by men of color promoted positive images of black men working and taking care of their families. Despite the efforts to change the image of black Brazilians, there were cases of upstanding men of color being denied access to respectable middle class jobs because of their skin color.

Starting in the 1950s, surveys began to explore racial attitudes toward Afro-Brazilians. In 1957, Roger Bastide and Pierre Van Den Berghe (1957) conducted a survey of 580 middle class students from teachers' colleges on perceived stereotypes of Afro-Brazilians in São Paulo. Several stereotypes were identified: "lack of hygiene, physical unattractiveness, superstition, lack of financial insight, lack of morality, aggressiveness, laziness, lack of persistence at work, sexual 'perversity' and exhibitionism." (691)

In 1995, one of the most profound studies about racial/color prejudice in Brazil was completed and published (Turra et. al, 1995). The basic conclusion of the study was that "...Brazil is a racist country against black people" <sup>2</sup> (5) Additionally, people who identified as black were more likely to express prejudiced thoughts about other black people. In other words, internalized racism existed between those with darker skin color. Racism between non-blacks and blacks was just as evident. The authors of the study call this racism, "racismo cordial" (cordial racism) because the non-black person who commits acts of racism does not feel as if

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The original quote is in Brazilian Portuguese.

he/she is doing it intentionally. Cordial racists feel that they get along well with black people and yet make disparaging remarks about them. In one case presented in the study, a woman named Maria Thereza Ferraz Ramos Féris was accused and brought to court on charges of committing acts of racial discrimination. Maria Thereza was later acquitted, although there were reports of her allegedly saying that the place of black people was in the senzala (slave house). Denying any accusations of racism, Maria Thereza felt that some black people were too sensitive to the jokes and comments that white people make. Maria Thereza and attitudes similar to hers make it hard for acts of racism to be proven in court because the very same people who are being sued do not feel as if they did anything wrong.

Almost 10 years later in 2004, Edward Telles (2004) synthesized previous works from Brazilian and foreign scholars emphasizing the importance of skin color. Although racial categories are more flexible to a certain degree, skin color is not as mutable. Skin color allows someone to be identified as black even if he/she does not consider himself/herself to be black. Persons identified as black confront stereotypes such as being great athletes and musicians. Stereotypes of black people being less qualified and less well presented for employment in comparison to non-black Brazilians were more explicit in the first half of the 20<sup>th</sup> century. Terms posted in advertisements for jobs requesting that applicants with "boa aparência" (well presented) and "good teeth" were ruled illegal in the 1980s because it was an implicit way of stating that only whites needed to apply. However, according to Telles, there still appears to be a preference for hiring non-black Brazilians in middle and upper income positions. Other barriers to securing better employment opportunities for black Brazilians is the "sistema dos favores" (nepotism), which excludes them from networking to achieve social mobility. Put differently,

stereotypes coupled with diminishing opportunities for black Brazilians leaves them in a position of perpetuating the same stereotypes that they try to overcome.

Determining Blackness in Brazilian Society

Determining who is considered black in Brazilian society has until this day been difficult because of the racial fluidity that exists in Brazil. The Instituto Brasileiro de Geografia e Estatística (IBGE) employs five racial categories: branco/a (white), pardo/a (mixed), preto/a (black), indígena (Indigenous) and amarelo/a (Asian). Racial classification is based on self-identification as in the United States. Therefore, one's self-identification may not match up with how other people classify him/her.

For the purposes of my study, I chose to use the term negro/a when referring to black people instead of preto/a because preto/a for some Brazilians is a very derogatory term. I did not want to risk offending anyone by not knowing his/her preference for the use of preto/a. While in Brazil, I found that people of darker skin would call me preta, but for the most part I was classified as negra. In fact, I did not hear preto/a very much, which led me to conclude that it was better for me to use the term negro/negra when referring to my research. Furthermore, my research of stereotypes was based on previous research on stereotypes from several scholars who did not use the term preto/a. Therefore, it would seem illogical for me to use preto/a considering that I intended to investigate whether the stereotypes of negros/as found in previous research were still prevalent.

Initially, preto/a was used to differentiate black people in Brazil from black people (negro/a) in other parts of the world. Preto/a was not deemed negative, but more positive in the sense that black Brazilians could not be connected to other black people. However, over time, the

Movimento Negro (Black Movement) criticized preto/a because it wanted Afro-descendants in Brazil to be a part of a global community of black persons (Pan-Africanism). (Alberto, 2011)

#### **METHODS**

To study stereotypes of Brazilians perceived as black, I employed the qualitative methods of content analysis, unobtrusive observation, and informal interviews. For my content analysis, I selected photos, from magazines and newspapers, of individuals with darker skin using the Project on Ethnicity and Race in Latin America (PERLA) color palette. The palette displays 11 colors with one being the lightest and 11 being the darkest. I chose the number five as a base line for identifying individuals with darker skin because lower than five (six through eleven on the color palette) the colors darken significantly. If lighter skinned people (four and above on the color palette) were in the photos with darker skinned people (five and below on the color palette), then I included them as well.

After selecting photos based on the presence of individuals with darker skin tone, I coded these individuals using a system that took into account previous literature about stereotypes of Brazilians identified as black. The variables I coded for were gender, age, hair texture, skin tone, facial features and whether the photo was government sponsored or not. Gender consisted of male and female. I divided age between child, young adult and adult. I sorted hair texture into 7 categories: straight, wavy, less curly, curly, very curly, dreadlocks, and no hair.

I used the palette to identify four types of skin tone. "Light" corresponded with the numbers one to three on the palette. The other categories included light to medium (three to five), medium to dark (five to eight) and dark (eight to eleven). I employed overlapping numbers due to the nature of the PERLA color palette. The different colors of the palette do not cover the array of skin tones and hues that are present in real life individuals. Furthermore, an individual can emit a different skin color, depending on the light that is employed to capture an image. A person with darker skin can appear lighter or darker based upon the lighting of the space he/she

is occupying and the light/flash of the camera. To be as accurate as possible without undermining the usefulness of the color palette, I overlapped the numbers. Therefore, the individual in the photo would be in an approximate range rather than being a specific number that corresponded with a skin color.

Facial features such as a big forehead, big lips, and/or wide nose were used to identify individuals who could be considered black.<sup>3</sup> Government sponsored was applied to photos depicting persons cleaning or engaging in some other activity that was associated with the government. Often, these photos displayed logos of local, state, and federal governments at the bottom of the page. For example,<sup>4</sup> there is photo of Gilberto Gil (famous Brazilian musician) and two other musicians posing as the musical acts for the São João Show in Salvador. At the bottom of the page, there is a logo from the Government of Bahia (a state located in the Northeast). It is clear that the Government of Bahia sponsored the photo.

Aside from the coding for the aforementioned variables, I coded the photos as edited or realistic based on how the photos were conceived. The key difference between edited and realistic photos is in the nature of the association between roles (in photos) and skin color. In the edited photos, this association refers to the judgment, presumably influenced by stereotypes, of the magazine or newspaper's editors. In other words, the photo was already conceived before individuals were chosen to be in the photo. The photo was not spontaneous. For example, a dark-skinned person was picked to be a street cleaner in one of the government-sponsored photos that I coded. The photo was not realistic because it was staged. In the realistic photos, the association

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Due to the complexity of coding facial features, I was unable to use facial features in my quantitative analysis. There were many combinations of facial features such as big forehead, small lips, wide nose, etc. These combinations did not easily translate into numbers so that certain tests could be run to determine an individual's blackness based on outward appearance.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Located in the magazine *Época*.

is expected to reflect the real world more accurately. Realistic photos depicted people in the street, celebrities at function, or musical acts. Put differently, the photo was not conceived before the people were chosen.

To incorporate stereotypes of Brazilians with darker skin, I coded the individuals in the photos using several labels. The labels I used were sporty, active, brainy, boss, employee, illegal and flirty. To be considered sporty, the person in the photo had to be identified as wearing a soccer uniform or as involved in some sort of sport. Active was based on someone who was physically doing something in the photo. Persons who were seated at a computer, who wore eyeglasses and/or who looked intent upon learning something were coded as brainy.<sup>5</sup>

Boss and employee were interconnected. Identifying persons who appeared to be a boss was based upon clothing and perceived position of power. "Bosses" were wearing business attire or were in a position of power relative to a presumed employee. Additionally, this category included people who did not have on formal business attire, but were better dressed than the people around them. Law enforcement officials were also labeled as bosses. Employee was determined to be someone who was subordinate to a boss or wearing a uniform associated with a task such as taking out the trash or cleaning up behind someone.

An individual labeled as illegal was someone who was holding a weapon, wore clothing such as a scarf or other paraphernalia associated with criminal activity. This person could also be dressed in regular clothing, but appeared to be involved in suspicious activities such as breaking things or inflicting bodily injury onto another person. Most importantly, any individual that was featured in a mug shot was labeled as illegal. Flirty individuals were nicely dressed, attractive and could be seen selling some sort of item.

15

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> The label brainy was excluded from the quantitative analysis because there was an insignificant number (2 out of 567) of individuals who were coded as such.

In designing this study, I chose two newspapers and three magazines as sources of the photos. The newspapers were *Diário de Pernambuco* (DDP) and *Folha de Pernambuco* (FDP). I collected these regional newspapers two-three times a week, with the exception of the period that I was not in Recife. I also collected one edition of *Folha de São Paulo* (FDSP) from which I selected individuals in five photos to code. I picked DDP and FDP because of their popularity. DDP and FDP are two of the most popular newspapers in Recife. FDSP was picked as a comparison to DDP and FDP considering that São Paulo is a bigger city than Recife and is located in the Southeast of Brazil.

The criteria for picking the magazines were different from the criteria in selecting the newspapers because the magazines were national in scope. I chose *Veja*, *Época*, and *Caras* to ensure diversity of target audiences. I chose *Veja* because it is targeted towards a more general audience and contains a mix of information about more scholarly and celebrity driven issues. I chose *Época* because it is targeted towards an educated audience. I chose the third magazine, *Caras*, because it is a gossip magazine that focuses on Brazilian celebrities. I collected *Veja*, *Época*, and *Caras* on a weekly basis, with the exception of the weeks that it was not available in the newsstands that I frequented. In total, I collected 33 newspaper issues and 26 magazine issues over the span of two months from June to August 2013.

Unobtrusive observation was also part of my research design. Most of my research was conducted in Recife. Places that I commonly frequented in Recife were the mall located in the downtown area, the supermarkets nearest to where I was living, and Recife Antigo (historic center). I also spent a substantive amount of time on the bus, which proved to be fruitful for my research. Other less frequented places were in Boa Viagem, an upscale neighborhood in Recife. In Boa Viagem, I went to a restaurant, the beach and one of the malls there.

Outside of Recife, I went to João Pessoa for a weekend and to the state of São Paulo for a week. In João Pessoa, I stayed in an upscale neighborhood, but rode in a car through some less developed areas. Other places I frequented in João Pessoa were the beach, restaurants, and some bars. In the state of São Paulo, I spent a couple of days in São Carlos. São Carlos is located in the interior of São Paulo and is approximately three hours from the city of São Paulo, which I also visited. In São Carlos, I stayed in a lower middle/middle class area and frequented restaurants and bars. I was in the city of São Paulo for a couple of days. There, I stayed near the neighborhood of Palmeiras where I frequented restaurants.

While I was observing people, I looked for anything that was related to black, or darker skinned Brazilians. These observations were recorded in my field notes. Some of the more specific things that I looked for were the interactions between those of darker skin and interactions between darker skinned and lighter skinned people. Later, I began to include interactions between people perceived as poor/homeless and those who were not perceived as poor/homeless. I was able to identify those perceived as poor by their clothing, the way they smelled, and if they appeared to be asking for money from others. I was also able to observe how people of darker skin were talked about when they were unaware that they were being talked about.

It is important to note my appearance and how this affected my observations. I consider myself to be black in the United States and was called negra, morena and preta by several different Brazilians while in Brazil. I felt that I was able to blend in for the most part because most people assumed that I was Brazilian. In fact, I was asked for directions on more than one occasion while waiting for the bus. All of the people that I informally spoke with were well aware that I was American. I do not think that this altered my research in a negative way, but

actually helped it. People would explain things to me in a manner that would be unnecessary for a native Brazilian because it would be common knowledge.

Talking with people was also a part of my research design. I was able to conduct 12 extended informal interviews with people that I met. There were many other people that I encountered through brief interactions, but I only engaged in informal interviews with those listed below. These informal interviews were only significant to my research if they included anything that was related to perceptions of people who were poor, black or of darker skin color. When I gathered any such information, I wrote it down in a journal that was then typed up and saved. I met these people through various means.

The first two people that I met in Brazil (Larissa\*6 and Igor\*) were introduced to me through the friend of an associate of mine. I lived with these people for the duration of my stay in Recife. They introduced me to the lady who cleaned their house, Bianca\*. The next person (Maria\*) that I met was introduced to me through a mutual friend, Thais\*. I had met Thais in the United States before I went to Brazil. Maria introduced me to three other people (Clarice\*, Renata\*, and Zé\*). While I visited Thais in São Paulo, I was introduced to Diego\* and Ivete\*. I also met Ana\* and Luana\* who were introduced to me by my advisor at the Universidade Federal de Pernambuco (UFPE).

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Denotes that pseudonyms were used in place of real names.

#### ANALYSIS

#### *Qualitative Analysis*

The difference between being poor and being black

One of the things that I found to be most interesting about stereotypes of those who were considered black is that I never really heard Brazilians speak negatively of black people. However, I did hear negative remarks about poor people. Poor people are lazy, dangerous, and ill mannered, according to the observations and field notes that I gathered. The remarks about poor people were identical to the some of the stereotypes of black people. In my view, negative views of poor people masked negative views of darker skinned people. However, some of the stereotypes pertaining to beauty such as terrible hair or a wide nose were directly correlated with black Brazilians.

On my first day in Recife, my host Larissa took me to a gas station. In the gas station, there was a newspaper stand. She pointed to a particular magazine and said that less educated people bought it because it had a lot of slang words and half-naked women. Normally, the least educated Brazilians are of darker skin color and/or Afro-descendant.

Another day, early in the morning, I was with Maria. I saw a group of darker skinned women walking by a bus stop with very bright make up on and wearing little clothing. I asked Maria about these women. Her response was that "those poor people don't have any money and don't care how they look." What I perceived through various conversations, as a way to talk about those with darker skin without identifying them as black, was best explained by Diego in a car ride in São Paulo. Diego told me that I might have trouble with my research because people in Brazil are reluctant to talk about race in terms of stereotypes. He explained to me that when

someone sees a person with darker skin walk by and this person fits the description of someone who might steal, they walk the other way without exactly knowing why.

Additionally in the state of São Paulo, I had very interesting interactions with Thais. She expressed a fear of darker skinned men who appeared to be poor. On one occasion while in the car with her, there appeared a darker skinned man walking with what seemed to be a bag. From the appearance of his clothes, I assumed that he was homeless. Thais noted that it was very dangerous at nighttime in the city she lived in after seeing the man that appeared to be homeless. Another day, in the afternoon, Thais and I traveled to the outskirts of town (*periferia*). Several times she mentioned to me that it was a very dangerous place. Looking around, I saw some adults sitting down and children playing with a kite. The adults and children were of darker skin color. What I found most peculiar about this day was that Thais had her window down and was on her iPhone while she was waiting on someone to come meet her in the "dangerous" part of town.

Back in Recife, Maria and I went to the beach. She asked me how my research was going and I told her well. I mentioned to her that I was not finding the stereotypes of black people that I initially sought, but more stereotypes of poor people. She then proceeded to tell me things about poor people that she did not particularly like such as their behavior in public and the way that they dress. According to Maria, some poor people do not have manners and behave like animals because they engage in activities like throwing trash on the ground instead of picking it up. The people she was referring to on the beach were darker skinned. As a point of comparison, after the big protest in Recife against the World Cup, I noticed that there was a lot of trash on the ground. I saw bottles, cans, and discarded posters. People of all colors and classes (mostly university students and Brazilians from the emerging middle class/middle class) attended the protest.

#### Identifying blackness

From my observations, being black can be based on a number of factors such as facial features, hairstyles or regional identity. One of my first encounters with defining blackness came from Larissa. After I told her about my research, she began to tell me her views around race. She let me know with a lot of passion that she was against quotas for Afro-descendants to enter the university system because admission should not solely be based on race. She then proceeded to tell me that Beyoncé was not black and would not be considered black in Brazil. Larissa's comment about Beyoncé can be interpreted as the whitening of someone with darker skin because of higher income status.

Early in the month of June, I attended a talk about urban music and happiness at the Universidade Federal de Pernambuco (UFPE). During the talk, a very light-skinned woman used the term "dos pretos" while making a remark. In her remark, she was referring to "pretos" from Africa because the talk featured music from different parts of the world, including Angola and other Portuguese speaking countries. It occurred to me that this woman may have used the term "preto" to refer to African people or people of darker skin tone.

From my own personal experience, I felt that preto/a and negro/a were conflated for some Brazilians. One afternoon, while Larissa was dropping me off so that I could go to Maria's house, she commented that she had been thinking a lot about my research with her husband Igor. She revealed that Igor was starting to wonder if he was "preto" because he had a wide nose and "cabelo ruim" (terrible hair). In all the time that I spent with Larissa, I never once told her that I was investigating anything about pretos. This led to me assume that negros and pretos meant the same thing to her.

Maria, although very white, used the term preto/a without hesitation. One evening while celebrating Festa Junina,<sup>7</sup> I met her niece who is parda (a mix of African and European ancestry). Her niece is very light-skinned with curly hair. On this evening, she called her niece pretinha (diminutive of preta) with endearment. Consequently, preto/a varies in meaning based on who is using it and how it is used. In certain cases, it can be a term of endearment. In other cases, it is a way to identify Brazilians with darker skin color.

On one hot afternoon, while waiting for the elevator on the first floor of the building that I was residing in, I was called preta. A woman, who was a little lighter than me asked me in Portuguese if I was from Recife. I responded by asking her why she asked me if I was from Recife. She replied that I looked different from the "pretos" there. I asked her why she said that. She then said it was the way I dressed and my hair that made me stand out. At the time, I had braids in my hair. As I found out from Luana at UFPE, my braids were a marker of blackness because people who embraced their blackness wore braids, dreads and other hairstyles that mostly black people wear.

I believe that it was my braids that made me appear "negra" to some people like Zé. When I first met Zé, I never told him how I self-identified, but he still identified me as negra. One evening, we had a very insightful conversation. He told me that everyone in Brazil is mixed so there really are no truly black or white people. I then asked him if he was not white. I always assumed he was white because he has light brown hair and very pale skin. He responded by saying that he was indeed white because it is printed on his birth certificate. However, he had black features because of his big lips and "nariz largo" (wide nose). From the first day that I met Zé, I never considered him to have a wide nose in comparison to the image that comes to my

7

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Festa Junina is a month long festival in June that is very popular in the Northeast. The festival is featured around certain saints such as São João.

mind when I think of a wide nose. In fact, I wrote that day, "...his nose looked like a white people's nose to me because it was long and pointy. Wide nose to me is something different for him." Maria also mentioned to me that she considered her nose to be wide like a black person's nose.

It appeared that the notion of black features also extended to other parts of Brazil. While in the city of São Paulo with Thais, I met a woman named Ivete. Ivete mentioned that features of black people in Brazil were different than in the United States because in Brazil they had bigger lips, foreheads and noses. In her view, black people in the United States had "finer" features meaning smaller lips, foreheads, noses. She told me that I did not look like the black people in Brazil because my forehead was shorter. Most surprising about this conversation was the fact that she had a "black" child. From my observation, Ivete appeared white because she had straight blonde hair and very pale skin. From our conversation, I gathered that she had a child with a man that she identified as black and that because of this her daughter was now black. She talked fondly of her daughter saying that she had big lips and referred to her as "nega" and "negonha".

While it is not true that all black people have wide noses, it appears to be a stereotype closely associated with black people in Brazil. One of the shows that I watched one day while flipping the channels on the television was "Zorra Total". There was a man dressed as a woman who wore black face, had fake plaits, and a very wide nose that seemed unreal. On the show, the character does not work, which is related to the stereotype of black people being lazy. After speaking with Ana, a professor at UFPE, she let me know that she does not watch that show because she finds it demeaning towards black people. Zorra Total has been heavily criticized by the Movimento Negro because of its portrayal of racist caricatures of black people.

Lastly, blackness is tied to regional identity. Many people that I met told me that I was in the wrong city to learn about black people. According to them, I should have gone to Salvador da Bahia, Maranhão, and even Rio Grande do Sul.<sup>8</sup> Salvador appears to be an obvious place to learn about black Brazilians considering it is the location of one of the largest ports that received Africans to work as slaves. Salvador is famous for its African roots with the Baiana<sup>9</sup> and African derived religions such as Candomblé. According to an Angolan that I met, 60% of the people in Salvador looked just like him. At first glance, the Angolan had dark skin, somewhere in the range of eight-eleven on the color palette. Maranhão is also located in the Northeast, but before I went to Brazil I had never heard of it as being a place to find "black" people. I became perplexed when people would tell me that I should have done research somewhere other than Recife because I saw a lot of darker skinned people there. It is possible that these people may not identify as black. It is also possible that certain people interpreted my research of black people as people who undoubtedly proclaim their blackness and that blackness is tied to African cultural heritage. In São Carlos, in the state of São Paulo, I went to a pagode (bar that plays a certain type of samba) and saw signs on the wall that said "100% negro". The name of the samba bar that I went to is also revealing of its affinity for blackness, "Toca da Criola".

*Identifying the poor* 

Much of my research about stereotypes of black people involved poor people. I found that the Brazilians I interacted with identified poor people based on their skin color and clothing

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Rio Grande do Sul is located in the south of Brazil. The south of Brazil is where many people of European descent settled due to the immigration of Western Europeans in order to whiten the population through mixing. The south of Brazil has less people of African descent than other places in Brazil like the Northeast where I was located.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> The baiana is normally depicted as a black woman who wears what appears to be a turban around her head and a dress that flares out at the end.

attire. Darker skin color was highly correlated with being perceived as poor. In a conversation that I had with a man that I met at music concert, I was informed about the association between being black and being poor. According to him, black people were always associated with poverty and white people were always associated with wealth.

Poor people, along with their darker skin color, were identified by their clothing. I noticed that people who rode the bus, especially older women, wore knee length jean skirts. Younger women wore shorts, halter-tops, and flip-flops. Women with more money were more likely to wear pants, flats, and sunglasses. Men on the bus wore shorts and sleeveless tank tops. I found that they also wore a lot of caps and flip-flops. After a while, it became apparent that it was possible to identify one's socioeconomic status by his/her clothing. Clothing that included American brand names such as Tommy Hilfiger or Hollister were markers of higher income status because those clothes were more expensive to buy because of import taxes imposed by the Brazilian government. Inversely, dirty or oversized clothing was a marker of lower income status.

The consequences of being poor and darker skinned

The interaction of skin color and socioeconomic status produced the most visible forms of discrimination based upon widely held stereotypes. I found that non-white, male Brazilians (three or below on the skin color palette) who were perceived as poor evoked negative reactions from other Brazilians. Therefore, stereotypes of black people such as "dangerous" were extended to a wider range of Brazilians. In other words, skin color was more significant than race.

The most pronounced interactions occurred at nighttime in Recife Antigo (historic center of Recife) and during the day on the bus. On one of the nights that I was in Recife Antigo, a darker skinned man who appeared to be poor based on the clothes he was wearing came up to the

table where I was sitting with three other women (Maria included). The man asked for some money from us. The reaction of the other women at the table was to give him money because they were afraid that he was going to take their cellphones if they did not comply. Supposedly, the money that he wanted was for him to buy food. About an hour later, a darker skinned teenager with oversized, dirty clothes came to the table asking for money as well. Maria and the other women did not give him any money and did not seem to be afraid of him.

During the conclusion of São João (part of Festa Junina), I was invited by Maria to a Festa de São Pedro. The event was held in Recife Antigo, like many other events sponsored by the local government. In order to arrive at the event, Maria, two other women, and I had to cross the bridge that links Downtown Recife to the Recife Antigo (historic center). While I was crossing the bridge, Maria told me to hurry up because there was a man who was following us. I began to walk fast as well because I did not want to get left behind. I was unable to see his face, but he appeared to be homeless because his clothes looked dirty and he was very skinny.

Another night in Recife Antigo, Maria warned to be careful because there was a man who got too close to me. I was at a bus stop catching a bus to Maria's house when a darker skinned man came up behind me looking for cans inside of a recycling bin. I assumed from his actions that people who collect cans receive some sort of financial compensation. Therefore, I did not feel afraid of him because it seemed obvious to me that he was not concerned with robbing me. Nevertheless, Maria felt that I was in danger and told me to stand closer to her.

In João Pessoa, late in the evening, I was in the car with Clarice on the way back from the bus station where she picked up her mother. Clarice mentioned that we were passing through a "lugar esquisito" and that she did not like to be in that area. The area was near the downtown of João Pessoa and the buildings did not look as well kept as the place where Clarice lived (by the

beach). In my own words, "I inferred that a 'lugar esquisito' means a dangerous place because it is poor and there are not many people around."

In the Southeast of Brazil in São Carlos, I was provided with another example of the interaction between color and socioeconomic status. On a sunny afternoon, Thais and I decided to go to the mall. On the way to the mall, Thais spotted four "light to medium" men on a bridge. Thais questioned why they were on the bridge. From the tone of her voice, I inferred that she was concerned for her safety because it was not normal just to see men hanging out on a bridge during the day. I also inferred that they were of a lower socioeconomic status precisely because they were hanging out on a bridge during the day wearing cut off shirts and shorts.

In the same week that I was with Thais, I spotted a darker skinned poor male that she did not even see. In her car, one afternoon, I saw a man walking on the sidewalk. He was very close to my skin color (medium to dark) and appeared to be homeless. His hair was similar to my hair texture as well, very curly. I pointed to him outside the window to give Thais and Diego an example of what I was researching in Brazil. Interestingly, neither Thais nor Diego saw him. From my observations I wrote, "...almost invisible in a sense."

A more visible example of prejudice based on skin color and class also occurred in São Carlos. I was sitting outside at an açaí bar with Thais waiting for our bus to depart for the city of São Paulo. While I was waiting for Thais to order us açaí, I saw a group of women and children walking toward the bar. The group stopped so that one of the women could fix one of the little girls' clothes. As they stopped, a very light-skinned woman (one or two on the skin color palette) gave them a look as she passed by them. The look was not friendly. In fact, it was more of an irritated look as if the group of women and children smelled bad. The group of women and children had on dresses and flip-flops. One of the little girls had her dress hiked up into her

underwear so that her underwear was visible. Her face also looked dirty. I inferred that this group of women and children were of a lower income status than the very light-skinned woman because their outward presentation was not very well put together.

Other very memorable interactions happened on the bus in Recife. One of the most striking experiences I had occurred on July 5<sup>th</sup>, 2013. On this day, two "girls" came on the bus. I initially thought that both of them were girls, but after looking at them better I noted that one appeared to be more gender neutral than the other one. In other words, I could not tell if one of them was a girl or a boy. When they ascended onto the bus, they looked like they were strung out on something because one them still had a cigarette lit and it is against bus regulations to smoke on the bus. They were in the light to medium skin color category. When I started to listen to them speak, I noticed that one of them had a really deep voice. This is when I inferred it was possible that they were both not girls. The gender-neutral girl's/boy's hair looked like it had not been washed or maintained because it had lint in it. The other girl had a higher voice and a white comb in her pocket. They were both wearing what appeared to be sundresses.

At one of the subsequent stops, two of their friends got on the bus. I could tell that they knew each other by the way that they were interacting. One of their friends appeared to be pregnant or had an enlarged stomach because her shorts were too tight for her to zip them up. Their other friend was a man with darker skin tone similar to my own with loosely curled hair. They were talking very loud and people began to stare at them. There was one particular man who had a very interesting interaction with the two "girls". Initially, he was standing very close to them near the doors at the back of the bus. However, he then moved to the front of the bus to get off at the next stop. His move to the front of the bus demonstrated his discomfort with the two "girls" and their friends. Other interesting interactions occurred when people got on the bus

to ask for money. On the way back from the mall after my experience with the two "girls", a man who appeared to be in his 50s ascended onto the bus. He was darker than me (in the "dark" range of the skin color palette) and had a tired look on his face as if he had experienced some traumatic events. On the bus, he began talking about Jesus Christ and how he wanted to change his life around. Some people eventually did give him money and he later got off the bus. No one on the bus seemed to be afraid of him as they did with the two "girls" and their friends.

The very next day, I experienced another entertaining bus ride. On the way back from the mall, a man got on the bus asking for money. He appeared homeless and smelled as if he had not bathed in days. His clothes did not match because he had on surfing shorts and a striped t-shirt. In terms of skin color, he was not black and he was not white either. He was more tan comparable to a three or four on the skin color palette. He had loose black curls and I estimated his age to be in his late 20s/early 30s. In his first few minutes on the bus, he began to sing.

He then proceeded to pass out gum (similar to chiclets). His plan was to sell the gum once it was in the hands of his potential customers, fellow bus riders. While he was passing out the gum, a group of three or four boys got on the bus. They were not black, but they were not white either. They appeared to be teenagers. These teenagers began to laugh at the "singer" and record him. It is apparent that they were being entertained by his singing. The singer then commenced to say that he only wanted R\$1 for a pack of gum. He also stated that he was an unemployed "vagabundo" who had a wife. The boys who were laughing at him eventually gave him some money along with some other people on the bus. Although he was not black, he identified with the stereotype of "vagabundo" (lazy/unemployed), which is usually associated with black people. Stereotypes of black Brazilians can be associated with lighter skinned Brazilians as well. He was also entertaining as was apparent from the reaction of the teenage

boys, which is related to the stereotypes of black Brazilians being good musicians, singers, and entertainers.

On one of the most memorable days of my time in Brazil, I was advised to take extra precautions and be aware of my surroundings. On that particular day, I was headed to the big protest in Recife. I had a conversation with Bianca, the woman who cleaned the house where I resided during my stay. She warned me about going to the protest because it was going to be dangerous. I did not consider Bianca to be white or black. She looked indigenous because of her tan skin and jet-black straight hair. She told me that I was "doida" (crazy) for going because there were going to be many people there who sniff glue. From my background in studying Brazil, I understand that people who sniff glue are usually street kids (darker skin, poor and homeless).

Lastly, I was made aware of racial/color discrimination through a second hand account from a white woman who was a professor at UFPE. She asked me about my research and proceeded to tell me a story about her maid's daughter. According to her, the daughter had applied to work as a receptionist at a beauty salon. She went to the salon for an in-person interview, and the personnel at the salon did not receive her warmly. A woman in the salon told the maid's daughter that the salon was associated with beauty and looked directly at her skin. The same woman pointed to the *porteiro* who had blonde hair and very light skin to demonstrate that even the doorman had to comply with a certain standard of beauty. Needless to day, the maid's daughter did not get the job as a receptionist in that beauty salon. The white professor then said, "but she is so beautiful". She then pointed to me to tell that her maid's daughter was my skin color. Up until that point, I had not paid much attention to the fact that I was the darkest person in the room. The professor seemed very shocked and embarrassed by the blatant act of

racial discrimination that impacted her maid's daughter. Her final words were that ever since she had been in Recife, she had never heard of this happening before.

#### Quantitative Analysis

In total, I coded 567 individuals. Of those 567 individuals, I identified 40 children (7.1%), 16 young adults (2.8%), and 511 (90.1%) adults. In regards to skin color, I determined 28.7% to be "light", 18% to be "light to medium", 39.7% to be "medium to dark" and 13.6% to be "dark". Therefore, the majority of the individuals were in the medium to dark range (five to eight on the skin color palette). In terms of gender, 61.2 % were male and 38.8% were female. Most individuals had straight hair (56.3%), followed by no hair/indeterminable (19.2%), very curly hair (17.8%), less curly hair (12.9%), wavy hair (10.6%), curly hair (9.2%), and dreads (2.5%)<sup>10</sup>. I coded 148 individuals in edited photos and 419 individuals in realistic photos.

In analyzing the percentage of people in photos labeled as boss, employee, active, sporty, illegal and flirty, I found mixed results. In relation to individuals labeled as boss (**Table 1a, 1b**), I found that light and light to medium skinned individuals are less likely to be shown as a boss in edited photos in comparison to realistic photos. This suggests that the editors of the magazines and newspapers that I selected wanted to present a more egalitarian view of Brazilian society. In this society, Brazilians of all colors have the opportunity to hold powerful positions. However, according to **Table 1c**, light-skinned individuals are still more likely to be picked to fulfill the role of a boss (54%).

For the label of employee (**Table 2a, 2b**), I found that light to medium individuals were overrepresented in the role of employee in edited photos in comparison to realistic photos.

<sup>10</sup> Hair texture was omitted from further analysis because the differences between skin color and hair texture were insignificant in edited and realistic photos.

31

Medium to dark and dark individuals were underrepresented in edited photos in comparison to realistic photos. The data suggest that the editors of magazines and newspapers wanted to present a more diverse view of Brazilian society. Darker skinned individuals (medium to dark and dark) are usually depicted in positions of subordination in Brazilian media. **Table 2c**, however, shows that the proportion of light to medium individuals that are employees is much larger than any other group. The column percentages also demonstrate that 67% of employees in edited photos have light to medium skin color.

For the label of active (**Table 3a, 3b**), I found that light and light to medium skinned individuals were less active in edited photos in comparison to realistic photos. The column percentages (**Table 3c**) show that only 14% of active people have either light or light to medium skin color. A plausible reason for this low percentage of active light-skinned individuals is that individuals who are active are more likely to be engaged in sports. Individuals who are engaged in professional sports are more likely to be darker skinned in Brazil.

For the label of sporty (**Table 4a, 4b**), medium to dark and dark individuals were more likely to be engaged in some sort of sport in comparison to lighter skinned individuals. From the results of this analysis, I concluded that darker skinned individuals are more likely to be represented in photos of sport-related activities because sporting photos are less likely to be edited/staged. In real life sporting events, there are more darker skinned Brazilian players than light-skinned Brazilian players. Some of the best players come from lower socioeconomic backgrounds. In Brazil, the darker a person is the more likely he/she is to be in a lower social position. The column percentages in **Table 4c** confirm this expectation considering that 83% of individuals labeled as sporty are medium to dark or dark.

For the label of individuals depicted as engaging in illegal activities (**Table 5a, 5b, 5c**), I found that light individuals were not at all represented in either edited or realistic photos. In line with the stereotypes of Afro-Brazilians being criminals and robbers, medium to dark and dark individuals were more likely to be represented as engaging in illegal activities in both edited and realistic photos.

For the label of flirty (**Table 6a, 6b**), edited photos showed a larger percentage of light and light to medium skin that were flirty than in edited photos than in realistic photos. Medium to dark and dark-skinned individuals were less likely to be represented as flirty in edited photos in comparison to realistic photos. As evident in **Table 6c**, editors chose to give almost half (47%) of photos designated to have a flirty theme to light-skinned individuals, even though they were only 33% of the total individuals. I believe that the high percentage of light-skinned individuals in photos can be explained by the standard of beauty that is prominent in Brazil. Lighter skin is more valued than darker skin and therefore seen as more attractive. This phenomenon is not particular to Brazil as there are many other countries where lighter skin is valued in terms of beauty, such as in the United States.

Table 1a

# Edited

Skin tone	Boss: No	Boss: Yes	Total
Light	86%	14%	100%
Light to medium	100%	0%	100%
Medium to dark	94%	6%	100%
Dark	87%	13%	100%
Total	91%	9%	100%

### Table 1b

# Realistic

Skin tone	Boss: No	Boss: Yes	Total
Light	79%	21%	100%
Light to medium	92%	8%	100%
Medium to dark	96%	4%	100%
Dark	89%	11%	100%
Total	90%	10%	100%

## Table 1c

# **Edited (Column)**

Skin tone	Boss: No	Boss: Yes	Total
Light	31%	54%	33%
Light to medium	16%	0%	15%
Medium to dark	38%	23%	36%
Dark	15%	23%	16%
Total	100%	100%	100%

34

Table 2a

# **Edited**

Skin tone	Employee: No	Employee: Yes	Total
Light	98%	2%	100%
Light to medium	82%	18%	100%
Medium to dark	98%	2%	100%
Dark	100%	0%	100%
Total	96%	4%	100%

# Table 2b

## Realistic

Skin tone	Employee: No	Employee: Yes	Total
Light	97%	3%	100%
Light to medium	96%	4%	100%
Medium to dark	92%	8%	100%
Dark	98%	2%	100%
Total	95%	5%	100%

### Table 2c

# **Edited (Column)**

Laitea (Column)			
Skin tone	Employee: No	Employee: Yes	Total
Light	34%	17%	33%
Light to medium	13%	67%	15%
Medium to dark	37%	17%	36%
Dark	16%	0%	16%
Total	100%	100%	100%

35

Table 3a

# **Edited**

Skin tone	Active: No	Active: Yes	Total
Light	98%	2%	100%
Light to medium	100%	0%	100%
Medium to dark	94%	6%	100%
Dark	87%	13%	100%
Total	95%	5%	100%

## Table 3b

### Realistic

Skin tone	Active: No	Active: Yes	Total
Light	95%	5%	100%
Light to medium	89%	11%	100%
Medium to dark	87%	13%	100%
Dark	91%	9%	100%
Total	90%	10%	100%

## Table 3c

# Edited (Column)

Skin tone	Active: No	Active: Yes	Total
Light	34%	14%	33%
Light to medium	16%	0%	15%
Medium to dark	36%	43%	36%
Dark	14%	43%	16%
Total	100%	100%	100%

Table 4a

## **Edited**

Skin tone	Sporty: No	Sporty: Yes	Total
Light	98%	2%	100%
Light to medium	95%	5%	100%
Medium to dark	89%	11%	100%
Dark	83%	17%	100%
Total	92%	8%	100%

# Table 4b

## Realistic

Skin tone	Sporty: No	Sporty: Yes	Total
Light	93%	7%	100%
Light to medium	86%	14%	100%
Medium to dark	83%	17%	100%
Dark	78%	22%	100%
Total	86%	14%	100%

# Table 4c

## **Edited (Column)**

Skin tone	Sporty: No	Sporty: Yes	Total
Light	35%	8%	33%
Light to medium	15%	8%	15%
Medium to dark	35%	50%	36%
Dark	14%	33%	16%
Total	100%	100%	100%

Table 5a

## **Edited**

Skin tone	Illegal: No	Illegal: Yes	Total
Light	100%	0%	100%
Light to medium	95%	5%	100%
Medium to dark	93%	7%	100%
Dark	91%	9%	100%
Total	95%	5%	100%

## Table 5b

## Realistic

Skin tone	Illegal: No	Illegal: Yes	Total
Light	100%	0%	100%
Light to medium	99%	1%	100%
Medium to dark	87%	13%	100%
Dark	98%	2%	100%
Total	94%	6%	100%

## Table 5c

# **Edited (Column)**

241004 (00141111)			
Skin tone	Illegal: No	Illegal: Yes	Total
Light	35%	0%	33%
Light to medium	15%	14%	15%
Medium to dark	35%	57%	36%
Dark	15%	29%	16%
Total	10%	100%	100%

38

# Table 6a

# Edited

Skin tone	Flirty: No	Flirty: Yes	Total
Light	90%	10%	100%
Light to medium	88%	12%	100%
Medium to dark	94%	6%	100%
Dark	98%	2%	100%
Total	92%	8%	100%

## Table 6b

## Realistic

Skin tone	Flirty: No	Flirty: Yes	Total
Light	86%	14%	100%
Light to medium	100%	0%	100%
Medium to dark	89%	11%	100%
Dark	91%	9%	100%
Total	90%	10%	100%

# Table 6c

# **Edited (Column)**

Skin tone	Flirty: No	Flirty: Yes	Total
Light	32%	47%	33%
Light to medium	17%	0%	15%
Medium to dark	36%	40%	36%
Dark	16%	13%	16%
Total	100%	100%	100%

39

### DISCUSSION

In my qualitative analysis, there were four main points that highlighted the synthesis of my unobtrusive observation and informal interviews: (1) the difference between being poor and being black was indistinguishable (2) blackness was based on facial features, hairstyles and/or regional identity (3) skin color and outward appearance indicated socioeconomic status and (4) being a non-white poor man produced negative consequences in certain situations.

The distinction between being poor and being black was not clear because the stereotypes of black people (criminal, violent, uncivilized, stinky, uneducated) closely mirrored the stereotypes of poor people (lazy, dangerous, stinky, and ill mannered). Drawing upon this finding, I began to conclude that speaking ill of poor people was likely a way to mask true feelings for darker skinned people. I do not think that it was a way to mask true feelings for black people because determining who was black proved difficult for me. I found that the Brazilians that I interacted with had different definitions of who was black, but could generally agree on identifying a poor person.

I perceived a general fear and underlying disgust for poor dark-skinned people. In further exploring why negative attitudes about poor people existed, I think back to the conversation I had with Maria on the beach. Every comment that she made about poor people was a way for her to differentiate poor people from herself. If middle to upper class Brazilians are the epitome of sophistication, have the best education, and are generally looked up to by others (lower classes), it is not too difficult to understand why some Brazilians view poor people as lacking these perceived "inherent" qualities. Therefore, the poor can be blamed for problems affecting Brazilian society because they do not possess the qualities of richer Brazilians. However, the poor are usually darker skinned because of the colorism that exists in Brazilian society. The

richest Brazilians are prone to be white or very light-skinned, while the poor are prone to be black or dark-skinned. In following this logic, the backward "black" population can be held responsible for problems facing Brazilian society.

From a historical perspective, since the end of slavery, one can see how black people have been blamed for the backwardness of Brazilian society. Even in the 1950s, the black players on the Brazilian soccer team for the World Cup were blamed for Brazil's lost to Uruguay (Soares, 1999). Later, with the influence of Gilberto Freyre and Mário Filho, the *negro* in Brazilian soccer was celebrated based on his natural ability to play soccer using the playful style known as *futebol-arte*. At times, black Brazilians are celebrated when they form part of a positive Brazilian narrative. However, when they do not fit within that narrative, they are similar to the poor that were characterized in my research: the epitome of everything that a Brazilian does not want to be.

Blackness was identified on the basis of facial features. I find it interesting that many of my respondents did not identify black people based on their skin color, but did identify them based on their outward appearance. People of African descent have all different types of noses, eyes, and lips. It is not to say that some do not have wide noses, big eyes and big lips. However, the stereotype of black people having wide noses, big eyes and big lips does not correspond with the image of Brazil as a multi-racial society. If Brazil indeed has a considerable multi-racial population, one can assume that there would be phenotypic differences among African descendants because of widespread miscegenation. In other words, there would not be large numbers of "black" people with wide noses, big eyes and big lips. There would be more variation such as "black" people with small noses, small eyes, and small lips. Nevertheless, the stereotype of black features remains prevalent in Brazil, according to my analyses.

Hairstyles, hair texture and regional identity were also markers of blackness. Braids, dreads, afros, and other styles worn mostly by people of African descent determined one's blackness. Seemingly, having very coiled or curly hair would make one more prone to be identified as black because some black people do have this type of hair texture. In terms of regional identity, the reputation of Salvador da Bahia as a place to find black people fits in line with the history of Salvador da Bahia. Salvador was one of the original ports where slaves where shipped to other parts of Brazil.

The other places that I was told had significant populations of black people were Maranhão and Rio Grande do Sul. More importantly, no one mentioned Recife. I originally chose the location of Recife to conduct research because it is located in the Northeast. The Northeast is known for having more black people just as Rio Grande do Sul is known for having more white people. I do believe that there were black people in Recife, but obtaining a consensus about who was black was not feasible. Therefore, I conclude that Recife is not known for being a black cultural center that celebrates its African roots like Salvador. Instead, its character seems to be based on having a population of mixed people with various skin colors. Having a population of mixed people implies that there are no significant populations of one particular race.

In regards to the assertion that skin color and outward appearance indicated socioeconomic status, I found that darker skin color was associated with lower socioeconomic status. According to census data from the Instituto Brasileiro de Geografia e Estatística (IBGE) in 2010, 41.3 % of Brazilians (10 years or older) who were employed, made the minimum wage (R\$510.00 per month) or less. Approximately 8.5% of Brazilians, 10 years or older, who were employed at the time of the census made more than three times and up to five times the minimum wage. At the highest level of monthly income, only 1.1% of Brazilians, 10 years or

older, who were employed at the time of the census made more than 20 times the minimum wage (IGBE, 2010). This data suggests that the distribution of income is skewed toward the top earners, while the majority of Brazilians make close to or slightly above the minimum wage.

However, Brazil's economic miracle in the past few years has lifted 39 million Brazilians out of poverty into the middle class (Secretaria de Assuntos Estratégicos, 2011). In Brazil, the division of classes consist of Class A, B C, D and E (Centro de Políticas Sociais da Fundação Getúlio Vargas, 2011). The new Brazilian middle class was added to Class C. In regards to my research, darker skinned people were assumed to be poor and yet darker skinned people are now a part of the middle class. One can assume that some of the new middle class still reside in favelas or *periferias* (outskirts) since they were formerly a part of Class D and E. Normally, it is assumed that people who reside in the favelas or *periferias* are poor. I believe that the correlation between darker skin and poverty is so ingrained in Brazilian society that it is difficult for some Brazilians to reverse the assumption that because one is dark-skinned he/she is automatically poor.

Taking a closer look at the conclusion that being a non-white poor man produced negative consequences in certain situations, findings from my qualitative analysis suggest that darker skinned Brazilians were stereotyped in a manner consistent with previous research about stereotypes of black Brazilians. Brazilians seemed to me most afraid of non-white poor men at night. During the nighttime, it appeared more common for homeless persons to become visible in comparison to the daytime. Visibility of homeless persons combined with the heightened senses of Brazilians going out to enjoy themselves at nighttime resulted in negative consequences for both parties. The homeless person was feared and the other party was afraid. This type of

interaction had the possibility of escalating into something more such as a robbery or a confrontation.

During my bus rides, I noticed that some of the persons that I observed engaging in a stereotypically black manner (lazy, entertaining, poor, bad smelling) were not black or white. In fact, they were not even darker skinned. However, they were not white. This leads me to believe that being non-white can produce as many negative consequences as being dark-skinned. In other words, the darker one's skin color is the more likely one is to confront stereotypes associated with black people. This assertion is true when incorporating gender (male). Poor males, ranging from lighter (but non-white) skinned to dark-skinned produced gendered stereotypes. Women, regardless of skin color, did not appear to be threatening in any of the interactions that I observed.

Incorporating my quantitative analysis, the photos from newspapers and magazines that I coded depicted more egalitarian images of darker skinned Brazilians for the labels of boss and employee. However, the labels of active, sporty, illegal and flirty paralleled the stereotypes of black Brazilians. Black or darker skinned Brazilians are known for playing sports well (soccer), engaging in criminal activities, and not being celebrated for their natural beauty. Negative images of black/darker skinned Brazilians have existed for some time in Brazil. Fernando Conceição (1998) evaluated the representation of black Brazilians in print media. Some of his conclusions were that: (1) the black Brazilian is valued in cultural sections and (2) In political sections, "the black Brazilian can be valued, but also seen as a threat to society." Conceição's (1998:4) findings suggest that black Brazilians' images can vary from negative to positive. This

<sup>11</sup> Original quote in Brazilian Portuguese

finding can help explain why I found that there were some egalitarian views of darker skinned Brazilians, while there also existed negative or stereotypical images of darker skinned Brazilians.

### CONCLUSION

The process of researching my initial question: What stereotypes of Brazilians who may or may not identify as black exist? led me to focus more on skin color than race. Skin color, less mutable than race, is a marker of socioeconomic status and certain stereotypes (threatening, ill-mannered, and entertaining). Race, more mutable than skin color, was characterized by facial features, regional identity and hair texture/hair style. Certain stereotypes were generally applied to darker skinned or non-white individuals, whereas others (big nose, forehead, and lips) were only applicable to race.

In conclusion, there is a correlation between skin color and race because those with darker skin are more likely to be Afro-descendant. In fact, according to *The Guardian*, preliminary results from the 2010 census demonstrated that 51% percent of Brazilians now claim some African ancestry by identifying as negro/a (black) or pardo/a (mixed with European and African ancestry) (Phillips, 2011). However, determining who is black and who is not still remains a complex subject manner. Even more complex, is the relationship between darker skin color, gender and socioeconomic status. Stereotypes are stronger for poor darker skinned men than poor darker skinned women because certain stereotypes almost exclusively apply to men such as dangerous. Therefore, as stated previously, skin color is much more important than race in Brazilian society.

There were several limitations to my research: (1) small number of interviews (2) limited diversity of among respondents (3) limited geographical range and (4) lack of intercoder reliability. The first limitation was the small number (12) of interviews that I conducted. Similarly, the pool of interviewees was not as diverse as it could have been since I met most of them through mutual friends. The geographical range of my research was limited to mainly

Recife with brief exposure to João Pessoa, São Carlos and the city of São Paulo. Therefore, my findings are mostly applicable to Recife. Lastly, as the sole coder of the magazines *Veja, Época, Caras* and the newspapers *Diário de Pernambuco, Folha de Pernambuco and Folha de São Paulo*, there was no possibility of obtaining intercoder reliability. If there had been more than one coder, the results of the content analysis would have been more reliable.

Future research would further examine the relationship between skin color and stereotypes, particularly those with darker skin color. Certain questions were left unanswered from this round of research such as *If the middle class is growing, why are darker skinned individuals still associated with poverty?* Other questions would include *Why do certain stereotypes of darker skinned Brazilians persist in the media, while others appear to be disappearing? Does the egalitarian view of darker skinned Brazilians in positions of power in the media correlate with the view of the Brazilian public of darker skinned Brazilians?* and *With the growing number of Brazilians claiming their African ancestry, do more positive stereotypes of them such as intelligent exist?* 

### REFERENCES

- Alberto, Paulina L. 2011. *Terms of Inclusion: Black Intellectuals in Twentieth-Century Brazil*. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press.
- Bailey, Stanley R. 2002. "The Race Construct and Public Opinion: Understanding Brazilian Beliefs about Racial Inequality and Their Determinants. "American Sociological Review 108: 406-39.

  2009. Legacies of Race: Identities, Attitudes, and Politics in Brazil. Stanford: Stanford University Press.
- Bastide, Roger and Pierre Van Den Berghe. 1957. "Stereotypes, Norms and Interracial Behavior in São Paulo, Brazil." *American Sociological Review* 22: 689-94.
- Bottari, Elenilce. 2013. "Ministério Público revela detalhes do assassinato de Amarildo." *O Globo*. October 23. Retrieved February 10, 2014 (http://oglobo.globo.com/rio/ministerio-publico-revela-detalhes-do-assassinato-de-amarildo-10495697#ixzz2swefiEUK)
- Bowater, Donna. 2013. "Where's Amarildo? How the disappearance of a construction worker taken from his home by police has sparked protests in Brazil." *The Independent*. August 4. Retrieved February 10, 2014 (http://www.independent.co.uk/news/world/americas/wheres-amarildo-how-the-disappearance-of-a-construction-worker-taken-from-his-home-by-police-has-sparked-protests-in-brazil-8745464.html)
- Brito, Angela Maria Benedita B. de, Santana, Moisés de Melo and Rosa Lúcia L. S Correia. 2005. *Kulé Kulé : educação e identidade negra*. Maceió, Alagoas: Edufal : Ideário Comunicação e Cultura.
- Centro de Políticas Sociais da Fundação Getúlio Vargas. 2011. "Qual a faixa de renda familiar das classes?" Retrieved March 19, 2014 (http://cps.fgv.br/node/3999)
- Conceição, Fernando. 1998. "O Medo da Cor na Mídia Impressa" from the book *A cor do medo:* Editora UNB.
- Freyre, Gilberto. 1986. *The Masters and the Slaves: A Study in the Development of Brazilian Civilization*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Holloway, Thomas H. 1993. *Policing Rio de Janeiro: Repression and Resistance in a 19th-Century City*: Stanford: Stanford University Press.
- Instituto Brasileiro de Geografía e Estatística. 2010. Censo Demográfico 2010: "Tabela 1.9.1.-Pessoas de 10 anos ou mais idade, por classes de rendimento nominal mensal segundo as Grandes Regiões e as Unidades da Federação-2010".
- O Globo. 2014. "Justiça de SP proíbe 'rolezinho' no Shopping Aricanduva." *O Globo*. February 7. Retrieved: February 10, 2014 (http://oglobo.globo.com/pais/justica-de-sp-proibe-rolezinho-no-shopping-aricanduva-11534835#ixzz2swd5GlDS)
- Padilha, José and Felipe Lacerda. 2002. *Ônibus 174*. DVD. Rio: Zazen Produções.
- Phillips, Tom. 2011. "Brazil Census Shows African-Brazilians in the Majority for the First Time." *The Guardian*. November 17. Retrieved March 12, 2014 (http://www.theguardian.com/world/2011/nov/17/brazil-census-african-brazilians-majority)
- Santos, Gislene Aparecida dos. 2002. A Invenção do "Ser Negro": um percusso das idéias que naturalizaram a inferioridade dos negros. São Paulo; Rio de Janeiro: Educação: FAPESP; Pallas.

- Schwarcz, Lilia Moritz. 1999. *The Spectacle of the Races: Scientists, Institutions, and the Race Question in Brazil, 1870-1930.* New York: Hill and Wang.
- Secretaria de Assuntos Estratégicos. 2011. "O rápido crescimento da classe media no Brasil é um desafio para o Estado". *Seminário Políticas Públicas para uma Nova Classe Media*. August 8. Retrieved: March 12, 2014 (http://www.sae.gov.br/novaclassemedia/?p=113)
- Soares, Antônio Jorge. 1999. "História e Invenção de Tradições no Campo do Futebol" *Estudos Históricos* 23: 119-145.
- Telles, Edward E. and Nelson Lim. 1998. "Does it Matter Who Answers the Race Question? Racial Classification and Income Inequality in Brazil." *Demography* 35: 465-74.
- Telles, Edward E. 2004. *Race in Another America: The Significance of Skin Color in Brazil.*Princeton: Princeton University Press
- Turra, Cleusa, Venturi, Gustavo and Datafolha. 1995. *Racismo cordial : a mais completa análise sobre o preconceito de cor no Brasil*. São Paulo, SP: Editora Atica.