

A PECULIAR SYNERGY: MATRIARCHY AND THE CHURCH OF GOD IN CHRIST

By

Anthea D. Butler

Dissertation

Submitted to the Faculty of the
Graduate School of Vanderbilt University
in partial fulfillment of the requirements
for the degree of

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

in

Religion

May 2001

Nashville, Tennessee

Approved

Prof. Lewis V. Baldwin

Prof. Darren E. Sherkat

Prof. Eugene TeSelle

Prof. Victor Anderson

Prof. Sheila Smith McKoy

Copyright© 2001 by Anthea D. Butler
All Rights Reserved

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

There have been many travelers along the way who have participated with me in this project that I want to express my gratitude to. Without their support, academic and spiritual, I could not have made it along this cobbled path. Order of mention does not mean that your value is less, only that my memory is short!

The Vanderbilt Crew:

First, thank you to my dissertation advisor, Lewis V. Baldwin. You taught me what it takes to be a good teacher and a scholar, and I hope that it shows in what I have written. Thank you, Darren E. Sherkat, for being a great friend always reminding me to have fun, but supportive all the way of this project. Thanks to Eugene TeSelle for engaging me the very first time we met about ‘Pentecostals’, and allowing me to have the pleasure of working alongside you at the Witherspoon conference. Thank you Victor Anderson for saving me (from myself) numerous times, and honing me into a thoughtful scholar. Thank you. And to Shelia Smith McKoy, for being a friendly, honest face when they were few and far between.

A very special thank you goes out to The Vanderbilt Divinity Library, specifically Bill Hook, Anne Womack, Donna Smith, Eileen Crawford, and Mat Trotter. You were my home away from home, and without your support and resources, this dissertation would be just a shell. Thank you all so very much. Also, thanks to the Vanderbilt Central Library Staff, especially Jim Toplon, and the ILL crew. Thanks for trying to get all the esoteric stuff I ordered, and putting up with me turning in items late too many times! Thanks to Jody Combs for your “tech expertise!”

To James F.X. Pratt, S.J., who changed the course of my spiritual life while at Vanderbilt. Thank you so much for understanding my soul and my intellect needed to be united, not separated. Your friendship and encouragement have helped me tremendously.

To Fernando Segovia, who dropped my name to help me obtain my first job. Thanks for your wisdom, wise words, and delightful “conversations”.

Colleagues

I would like to express a very special thank you to Dr. Walter Hollenweger of Krattigen Switzerland, for his prophetic “You should do a Ph.D.. You are very stretchable!!” to me that fateful summer of 1993 in Pasadena, California. Neither one of us could anticipate this journey, but I am very glad you set me upon it. God knows I wouldn’t have made a very good pastor!!

To Cecil ‘Mel’ Robeck, who put me on the Pentecostal bus tour and taught me how to be a rabid researcher and collect every scrap of material, and more importantly, how to be a servant. Thank you. Your contribution to this project was more than you could know. Thanks to Patsy Robeck as well for being an encouraging, Godly friend.

To Russ Spittler, who suffered through all of my probing questions about graduate school and provided unwavering support and advice. I am especially grateful to you for suggesting I take Dr. Hollenweger’s class. You were right, it changed my life.

To David Daniels, who was the invisible 6th reader of this dissertation. We talked about this project in Italy, Switzerland, Brazil, Costa Rica, and Chicago, and numerous other places in between. Thank you so much for being a Saint, and accepting the ain’t writing about your denomination!! Without your guidance, I would still be writing.

To Rickie Moore: Your invitation to Cleveland, Tennessee started this whole topic off. Thanks so much for being there to support me through the dry places. We both know how tough they can be.

To Rob Johnston, for the tip about Vanderbilt, and Lewis Baldwin. I owe you one.

To my colleagues in the Theological Studies and Classics Departments at Loyola Marymount University in Los Angeles, CA. You provided me with a collegial home to finish this project in. Thanks for trusting me to finish! And to Nick Frankovitch, who came in to help edit my time of need, a very sincere thanks.

Archivists:

To Sherry Sherrod DuPree, who allowed me to ransack her “archive” in Gainesville, Fla. Thank you for your assistance and support in this project. You are a faithful woman of God who

had a vision that was right on. Thank you for all of your help in retrieving COGIC materials.

To Emma J.Clark of the Mattie McGothen Archives in Oakland, California. Thanks for your trust in mailing me materials! I needed them more than you could ever know. Thanks also to Wayne Warner and his staff at the Assemblies of God Archives in Springfield, Mo. You run a tight ship and I am blessed for it. A special thank you also to Kate Mc Ginn and David Roebuck. You both let me poke around where only the special folks'go.

To Mother Phyllis Barnett: Your gracious hospitality and companionship have enriched my life. I hope that this project does you and other COGIC mothers the justice you deserve.

To Mother Martha Parker, State Supervisor of Nebraska, and the Women's Department of Nebraska: Thank You for your hospitality and trust. You are the living archives that I needed to talk to.

Family and friends.

Thanks to my friends who have had to listen to my many phone calls, complaints and pains: Fannye Belt, Christine Caron, Darla Schumm- Harris, Deborah Hokett, Barbara Holmes, Tim Kitchen, Suzette Lemrow, Jean-Daniel and Susan Pluss, Paul Ramsour, Mark Roberts, Michael Stephens, and Minnette Watkins. I love and value you all. Thanks also to JRA, who helped me to survive my first year at Vanderbilt. Despite everything that has happened, I remain grateful for our friendship.

To my faithful and recalcitrant cat, Oreo, who deserves thanks as well for being faithful. You deserve a degree after all the things I have put you through, but a cat treat will have to do.

To my Parents, Willa and Jesse Butler, and my sisters, Stacy, Kamala, and Keitha. I am sure you are all glad that this is over. Thank you so very much for bearing with my poverty, crabbiness, and many travels. Your support, despite all the other distractions, has been appreciated and noted. I love you all.

Finally, but most importantly, I thank Jesus Christ for getting me through all this. You called me, and I answered very reluctantly. I did not trust you, but You have exceeded all my hopes and expectations for what could be in my life. Thanks for hanging in there with the biggest doubter since Thomas.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS	iii
 Chapter	
I. A PECULIAR SYNERGY	1
Historic Background of the Church of God in Christ	6
Pentecostal Hermeneutics	8
Holiness Groups, Public Ministry and Women’s leadership	13
Summary	14
II. THE OFFICE OF THE CHURCH MOTHER AND THE RELATIONSHIP OF MEN AND WOMEN IN THE CHURCH OF GOD IN CHRIST	15
Accommodation to Culture	17
Biblical Literalism	19
Commitment to Racial Uplift	20
Post-Reconstruction Black Women and Leadership Roles	22
Teachers	22
Clubwomen	24
The Church Mother	25
Historic Anthropological Connections to the Role of Women in COGIC	28
Fictive Family and Kin	30
Summary: Women, Leadership and COGIC	34
III. THE BEGINNINGS OF THE WOMEN’S DEPARTMENT	36
Robinson and Mason meet	38
Organization of the Women’s Department	45
Prayer and Bible Band	45
Sewing Circle and Sunshine Band	49
Purity Class	50
Home and Foreign Mission Board	50

Women’s Department Organizational Chart, 1926	51
The First Church Mothers	52
Post Reconstruction Women’s Leadership and COGIC	59
Lillian Brooks Coffey	59
Arenia Mallory	62
Qualifications for Leadership and the Women’s Department	64
Summary	65
IV. Structure, Organization, and the COGIC Matriarchy	67
Structural Theory	68
The Foundation of the Women’s Department: The Bible	72
Sanctification	78
Consecration	79
Sacrifice	81
Cleansing	83
Gender	89
Resources Generated by the Women’s Department	94
Human Resources in The Women’s Department	94
Habitus and COGIC	97
Summary	99
V. THE MATRIARCH AND HER DAUGHTERS	100
Arenia Mallory: Moving the Saints Forward	102
Mary Mcleod Bethune, Mallory, and the National Council of Negro Women	107
Little Lillian and the Women’s Department	111
Mallory and Coffey: A Partnership of Change	116
The End of an Era and Change	118
Summary	124
VI. DEATH AND REBIRTH: THE CHURCH MOTHER IN THE 50’S	125
The 1945 Convocation	127
A “New Mother” Redirects her Daughters	132
Expanding and Restructuring the Women’s Department	134
Administrative	136
Service Auxiliaries	137
Huldah Club	137
Stewardess Board	138
Hospitality group and volunteer counselors	139
Missions	139
Leadership	136

Summary of New Auxiliaries and Theoretical Considerations	143
New Alliances and the Women’s International Convention	144
The 1951 Women’s Convention	142
The Decade of the 50's and the Women’s Convention	150
Summary	155
VII. THE END OF AN ERA	156
The Ebony May 1963 Article and the End of Coffey’s Era	158
The End of the Line	163
Conclusions, Observations and Reflections	164
Observations	168
Reflections	168
BIBLIOGRAPHY	170